

Evaluation Management Response Document

Region: MENAR

Office: Lebanon

Evaluation Year: 2018

Evaluation Title: Evaluation of Immunisation Programme (EPI) in Lebanon (2013-2017)

Person In Charge For Follow Up to Management Response: Genevieve Begkoyian

Overall response to evaluation

The evaluation findings are acceptable and the Management Response was tailored accordingly

Planned Use of the Evaluation

The Evaluation Findings will be used in order to improve the design and implementation of future programming

Recommendations and Actions

No.	Recommendations/Actions	Responsible Section (Action)	Responsible Person Name (Action)	Expected Completion (Action)	Mgt Response / Implementation Stage	Reason/Action Taken
1	The AWP should mention specific strategies to address families from lower-socio economic backgrounds. Although UNICEF staff acknowledged that residual costs were a constant barrier for accessing vaccines, the activities detailed in the AWP's from 2013 to 2017 do not incorporate any specific strategy for overcoming those challenges at a programmatic level. In that regard, UNICEF could support the MoPH in the analysis of out of pocket expenditures related to immunisation and the drafting of a National policy on free access to vaccine and to vaccination till full immunisation of the child.				Disagree	
1.1	Continue advocacy discussions with MoPH and main stakeholders	Chief Child Survival	Genevieve Begkoyian	3/29/2019	Completed	1-Social Policy and H&N team met with World Bank to advocate for free immunization in context of UHC 2-Systematic participation in the EU MADAD steering committee, to confirm free / affordable vaccine services in context of MADAD funded health projects 3-Supported MoPH in issuing decree for private doctors access to MoPH vaccine store, only if they provide for free and report against the children vaccinated to MoPH 4-Design the AIA approach in response to the measles outbreak - referring children to free vaccination at identified PHCs; in addition, to free on spot vaccination through mobile units in isolated areas. 5-2019 Measles campaign was jointly plan with WHO MoPH and other health stake holder. 6-Chief of HN meeting Director of PHC on a weekly basis, is member of the EPI technical Committee, and of the Health core working group, HN Staff are all part of the inter agency working group.

1.2	Equity analysis on immunization	Chief Child Survival	Kyaw Aung	12/30/2021	Completed	<p>on the 22nd of June, the ToR was sent to the Ministry for final validation before proceeding with the recruitment process. Implementation is planned to begin in August. An extensive data analysis on routine immunization data and drop out rates, 9 districts (out of total 26 in Lebanon) were identified to have 1/3 of drop-out children. Also, these 9 districts are categorized among the most vulnerable (from socio-economic perspective). This equity analysis was used with MoPH EPI and PHC manager to agree on UNICEF's focus on the 9 districts with highest drop out rates through a tailored approach (which is provision of routine immunization services through mobile and temporary vaccination units, in addition to the referral to nearest fixed primary health care services). In addition, UNICEF is planning to conduct an immunization financing case study as part of Primary Health Care financing case study, in order to advocate for sustainable financing mechanisms to PHC services (including Immuni</p>
1.3	Identify steps needed to draft a policy on free routine immunization in Lebanon	Chief Child Survival + Social Policy staff	Kyaw Aung	12/30/2021	Cancelled	<p>Such a policy will not be drafted seeing that it is not within the Health section's rolling workplan. However a circular is available at the ministry of public health stating that vaccines for children are free as long as a registered nurse administers the vaccine.</p>

1.4	Draft Policy that includes monitoring and accountability aspects (possible sanctions)	Chief Child Survival + Social Policy Staff	Kyaw Aung	12/30/2021	Completed	ToR updated for an immunization financing analysis, in link with the current context in Lebanon's multifacet crisis. To be finalized this week and to be launched and conducted during Q2. After the immunization financing case study is finalized (Q4 2021) a plan of action will be created that includes monitoring and accountability aspects for the ministry and stakeholders to ensure sustainable immunization programme. The ToR for immunization financing case study is now being tailored to capture full PHC financing, that will be conducted in 2022. The ToR for PHC financing is finalized. The national multi-year Immunization (EPI) strategy draft is finalized, and it includes the needed national strategy and budget needed (please attach draft document).
1.5	Draft action plan to implement Policy	Chief Child Survival + Social Policy staff	Kyaw Aung	12/30/2021	Completed	ToR updated for an immunization financing analysis, in link with the current context in Lebanon's multifacet crisis. To be finalized this week and to be launched and conducted during Q2. After the immunization financing case study is finalized (Q4 2021) a plan of action will be created that includes monitoring and accountability aspects for the ministry and stakeholders to ensure sustainable immunization programme. In addition to the immunization/ PHC financing analysis that will take place in 2022; UNICEF has supported MoPH in developing a detailed framework for the national Immunization strategy and operational plan.
2	Furthermore, there was little mention of specific strategies to address families with disabled children. In line with UNICEF global efforts, more should be done in Lebanon to work with the MoPH to ensure health professionals do not consider disability alone as a contraindication for immunization.				Agree	

2.1	Establish a committee with main stakeholders	HN focal point on disability	Genevieve Begkoyian	4/29/2021	Completed	first consultation with pediatricians took place on 26-11-2020 to call for engaging the private pediatricians in the free access to routine vaccination of the child including monitoring and the use of the MERA application. Following the first consultation, during Q 1 an additional consultation, this needs follow up to define concrete next steps for larger engagement of pediatricians with routine immunization the MoPH already has a committee (NCC) that includes private sector and public sector presentation, more engagement will be planned with the private sector to ensure they get their vaccine from MoPH and deliver them to children for free.
2.2	Review existing guidelines related to Routine immunization and disabled children	HN officer and HN Roving	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/30/2020	Completed	The focus in 2020 was to integrate all COVID 19 prevention within the guidelines and SOP of the immunization programmes to ensure vaccination in a covid 19 free environment (as per WHO IPC conducted trainings) which was done
2.3	Draft guidelines	HN Officer and HN Roving officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	8/30/2021	Completed	Based on MERA data base, we are targeting defaulter children in routine immunization catch-up. The national strategy of EPI also outlined different approaches to reach zero dose and defaulting children. UNICEF through Lebanese Red Cross is already implementing dual approach of outreach vaccination and PHC referrals. (please attached LRC PD).
2.4	Finalize guidelines	HN Officer and HN roving Officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	6/29/2021	Completed	AIA evaluation is being undertaken; this will support in proposing needed recommendations for way forward in Routine Immunization catch up. AIA evaluation was finalized in April 2021
3	Capacity building activities should be more closely documented and should be focused on providing Training of Trainer (ToT) activities rather than simply training. Hence, ToT should support greater sustainability across MoPH, at the central, district and local level, and provide MoPH with the knowledge and skills to run their own training as new staff are contracted, rather than UNICEF needing to repeat training sessions.				Partially Agree	

3.1	Esnure all trainings conducted till end of 2020 include pre-post tests and are well documented	HN roving Officer + C4D officer + PRIME	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/31/2020	Completed	1-First AIA training was conceived across sector coordination to integrate: (1) Social Behaviour change on Immunization (2)YCF practice (3) Immunization data by health workers 2-Second AIA training was designed sing lessons learned and good practive from 1st AIA training; initially conceived as a TOT was finally conducted as a training as part of capacity building (as TOT was not yet feasible - due to turnover of staff among different stakeholders) 3-In context of AIA scale-up and plan of mass measles campaign; ToT is planned and integrated in the approach
4	UNICEF can support PHCs through the introduction of practices and policies which promote equality across nationalities, providing greater support to hamper any misconceptions about biased among Syrians or Lebanese.				Agree	
4.1	Prepare trainings and agendas for all PHC staff on essential IPC skills to ensure respect and proper treatment of patients from all nationalities – abiding by MoPH PHC values	HN Roving officer + C4D Officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	10/30/2019	Completed	1-The AIA plans were based on measles attack rate, low immunization coverage with a micro-plan organized at local level with no descremination among all children. 2-all outreach workers and vaccinators through AIA were trained on IPC that emphasized vaccination for all (no descremination) 3-As a result, AIA in 2018, reached 48% Lebanese and 52% non-Lebanese. 4- Still undergoing in context of COVID. IPC and PPE equipment an dtraining were reinforced in context of COVID 19 response. 84 PHC have been equipped with PPE to continue immunization and MNCAH.
4.2	Conduct needed trainings for all PHCs	HN Roving Officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	1/31/2020	Completed	(1) AIA trainings were done to PHC staff identified by MoPH (2) Future trainings will take place
4.3	Ensure effective compliant mechanism and evaluation of respectful service at PHCs	HN Roving Officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	10/31/2020	Completed	Grievance system exists at the MoPH which was put in place by the PHC.
5	In order to target residual costs that hinder access to vaccination services, UNICEF could further support the MoPH in tackling the cost of vaccines through PHCs and other health facilities. UNICEF should encourage the MoPH to collaborate with all actors (including the private sector) involved in making sure that they are a still and clear strategy that effectively ensure that vaccination is free for all children under five. Furthermore, the evaluation team suggests that UNICEF conducts research into wastage to better understand the extent to which it impacts on effectiveness and efficiency.				Disagree	

5.1	1. Waste management of vaccination commodities in all EPI points (130 points of collection)	CS roving in close coordination with CS field offi	Genevieve Begkoyian	6/29/2020	Completed	(1) All PHCs are equipped with safe disposal boxes (2) UNICEF implementing partner (Arc en Ciel) collects all vaccine wastage from all EPI points and segregates them for safe disposal - this will continue till end of December 2019 (3) UNICEF engaged with Solutions for safe disposal of expired drugs in Lebanon and outside Lebanon
6	Wastage of vaccines remains an ongoing concern that prohibits effective vaccine management at the national level. Health professionals at the local and district levels shared initiatives to reduce wastage. One option worth exploring further is the redistribution of non-used unexpired vaccines through the MoPH				Partially Agree	
6.1	Waste management of vaccination commodities in all EPI points (130 points of collection)	HN Roving Officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/31/2020	Completed	(1) All PHCs are equipped with safe disposal boxes (2) UNICEF implementing partner (Arc en Ciel) collects all vaccine wastage from all EPI points and segregates them for safe disposal - this will continue till end of December 2019 (3) UNICEF engaged with Solutions for safe disposal of expired drugs in Lebanon and outside Lebanon
7	No evidence was shared proving that efforts are made to verify reported vaccination needs and consider cost effectiveness when procuring vaccines and equipment. The first step to achieve some progress in that direction is to be made on the accuracy and transparency of MoPH data records. UNICEF shall work with the Ministry to support their efforts, drawing on the lessons learnt from the successful experience of other countries in the region that have put forth such reforms				Disagree	
7.1	1.Continuous UNICEF support to the scale up of the EPI registry and MERA application,	CS Chief with MoPH HN officer central to support M	Genevieve Begkoyian	9/29/2019	Completed	(1) MERA under leadership of MoPH, was implemented in 500 cadasters at PHCs and at community level were AIA was implemented (2) MERA use was scaled-up to nurseries, public schools, Qadaa MoPH offices, and PHCCs (3) MERA will be further scaled-up by end of 2019 to all dispensaries, private schools, private physicians (4) MERA has been validated by WHO as the information tool to be used in measles mass campaign
7.2	2.Capacity building of EPI network staff on quality data collection	CS roving HN	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/30/2020	Completed	651 staff were trained on MERA (from dispensaries, PHCs and community outreach workers).
7.3	3.Equity analysis of Immunization	HN Officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/30/2019	Cancelled	Same as the first Action under these recommendations
8	One major issue regarding the efficiency of the procurement of vaccines remains on the choice between single and multi-doses. Further investigation, both with the MoPH and UNICEF Supply Division, is required to better understand the procurement choices despite the awareness that wastage is an ongoing concern. Efforts needs to be made by UNICEF to collect and review spending, such as budgets allocated for vaccine procurement. UNICEF shall conduct a thorough needs-cost analysis to support their choices of procurement.				Agree	

8.1	Supply chain system strengthening and capacity building of warehouse management	Chief child survival	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/30/2020	Completed	EVM assessment training has been conducted with 66 participants including the central warehouse managers, PHC network participants and UNRWA to build up the whole capacity building throughout the vaccine supply chain system. Following the training they will be conducting a national assessment
9	Building on UNICEF's global experience, UNICEF Lebanon could work more closely with MoPH to develop lessons learned approaches to their practices, with the introduction of workshops or seminars, encouraging shared dialogue. Examples of topics to be discussed may include the following – best practices in other countries, data record keeping practices at national and local levels, monitoring tools and activities. The objective of such workshops is to ensure that the MoPH is aware and has the tools to introduce policies and practices that have been deemed successful to overcome challenges in other countries				Partially Agree	
9.1	In collaboration with MENARO, seizing all opportunity for the MoPH participation in regional or global training/ workshop	Chief Child Survival	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/31/2020	Completed	(1) MoPH participated in EQUIST training in New Delhi - India (Q1 2019) (2) MoPH participated in the Tunis Private / Public Immunization MENA landscape workshop
10	Given the role played by the private sector in achieving the objectives of the EPI, UNICEF could encourage the MoPH and support it in better understanding the provision of immunisation services by the private sector, including vaccine safety issues (e.g., integrity of the cold chain), whom the sector serves, how services are paid for, its contribution to coverage, and its integration with monitoring and surveillance				Agree	
10.1	Supportive supervision in collaboration with PHC coordinator in the EPI network	HN Roving Officer	Genevieve Begkoyian	12/30/2020	Completed	Ongoing and will continue as a core activity to ensure quality vaccine system