

Evaluation Management Response Document

Region: MENAR

Office: Sudan

Evaluation Year: 2022

Evaluation Title: Real-Time Evaluation of UNICEF Tigray Response in Sudan

Person In Charge For Follow Up to Management Response: Vu Manh Hong

Overall response to evaluation

Sudan CO appreciates intensive work that was done for this evaluation, and appreciate the observations and recommendations provided. One of the lessons that clearly comes out of this evaluation is not only challenges of rapid scaling up while ensuring the quality of the response, but also insufficient UNICEF readiness and know-how in scaling down and HQ/RO support that can be provided especially in the face of funding shortages, given the organizational position of "no regret".

Planned Use of the Evaluation

Given the delay in the evaluation report, a number of recommendations that are included in this report have been already implemented, and others have become redundant or not applicable due to the changes that happened in the country (including the military take over and some donors' conditionalities against funding the government).

Recommendations and Actions

No.	Recommendations/Actions	Responsible Section (Action)	Responsible Person Name (Action)	Expected Completion (Action)	Mgt Response / Implementation Stage	Reason/Action Taken
1	Revise the operational strategy to 12 months and adjust staff and consultants' contracts accordingly to mitigate short-term operational planning and related issues				Partially Agree	
1.1	Revise operational strategy to 12 months and adjust staff/ consultants' contracts accordingly	FOE	Jill Lawler	12/30/2022	Completed	
2	Establish an office/base at the camps to reduce time and resources spent shuttling between Gedarif and the camps				Disagree	
3	Upgrade the Gedarif office to a sub office independent of Kassala office and strengthen human resource capacity and staff care to mitigate high workloads and improve the emergency response outcomes that UNICEF has set out to achieve. Strengthening human resource capacity includes quickly deploying more staff for education, M&E, human resources, and child protection				Partially Agree	
3.1	Establishment Gedaref as the temporary office	FOE	Jill Lawler	6/29/2022	Completed	PBR submission to establish a temporary office was approved.
3.2	Strengthen HR capacity (also partially covered under Recommendation 1)	FOE	Jill Lawler	6/29/2022	Completed	. Consultancies converted to TAs and new staff recruited based on needs.
4	4. Address informal education complexity through: • Deploying more education capabilities including urgently fundraising for the education sector to fast-track transition from nonformal to formal schooling for all school age children in the camps. • Working closely with Government/Ministry of Education going forward, with Government as the main coordinating body, with support from UNHCR and UNICEF. • Hiring an experienced 'Education in Emergency consulting firm or individual to help guide a fast-tracked transition to formal education for over 10,000 refugee children. • Strengthening education sector coordination with UNHCR including an MoU, to increase synergy and reduce overlaps.				Partially Agree	
4.1	Fund-raising for education	Education Section, Coordinator with HCR	Dina Ali	12/30/2022	Completed	Advocacy and fund-raising efforts made e.g. ECW I and ECW II focusing on Refugee children, including children with disabilities, of primary school age; pre-primary school age; secondary school age are supported to access equitable, quality learning opportunities. The sector remains largely under-funded.

4.2	Advocacy with the government	Education Section Gedaref Office	James Kamira	12/30/2022	Completed	At Gedaref State level, through the refugee Education working group, UNICEF has engaged the MoE and the MoF and Labour services on government leading in deployment of teachers to schools in refugee camps. As a step forward, proposed new salary structure and guide incentive teachers' payment was discussed and agreed. This is however affected by the diminishing funding for the sector to ensure implementation.
4.3	Transitional Instructional Programme (TIP)	Education Section Gedaref Team	James Kamira	5/30/2022	Completed	Engaged a consultant through IRW, an implementing partner for UNICEF in the refugee camp to develop a transitional Instructional Programme (TIP) that supports teachers and students in Gedaref camps to move from the Ethiopian Curriculum to the Sudanese Curriculum. A report is in place. The consultant engaged children, parents, MOE, Education partners, refugees and the commission for refugees (COR).
4.4	Strengthen coordination with UNHCR	FOE Gedaref Office	James Kamira	12/30/2022	Completed	MOU signed UNICEF co-chairs with UNHCR the Refugee Education Working Group in Gedaref together with MoE. UNICEF has also activated the wider Education sector in Gedaref looking at education in both the refugee camps and the host community.
5	Review existing arrangements of national/Government channels, particularly MoH, for emergency supplies except EPI commodities				Disagree	
6	6. Strengthen PSEA programming viz: • Ensure completion of PSEA training and keep track of compliance data for all personnel accessing the camps. Retrain frontline workers. UNICEF Gedarif leadership should communicate and embrace SEA zero tolerance. • Ensure SEA risk review is completed for all UNICEF-contracted agencies operating in Gedarif and engage other UN agencies and partners on the same. • Engage UNHCR and COR to move help desks away from police units and staff them with trained, gender-balanced teams. • Assess the viability to provide income generation activities and cash transfers to empower women and girls.				Partially Agree	

6.1	PSEA for all personnel accessing the camps	FOE/CP Gedaref Office	James Kamira	12/30/2022	Completed	This goes beyond UNICEF and the key is to coordinate with UNHCR and COR. All staff in Gadref have completed PSEA online training and were provided with three PSEA Sessions during the reporting period (2021). Moreover, two separate sessions were provided to the security guards and cleaners as well. Four PSEA trainings have been conducted for SCCW social workers, and teachers in Babikiri, Tunaydbah and Umrakuba camps. The trainings have been done jointly between UNICEF/UNHCR. Also PSEA refresher sessions have been conducted for UNICEF staff, guards and MoH staff by UNICEF) UNICEF coordinates on PSEA with UNHCR including on integrated messaging to affected population, capacity building to partners and program participants, consultations and collaboration to ensure necessary actions against perpetrators in line with the laws, strengthening AAP, and providing a survivor centered response. A GBViE specialist is deployed to support further in this area.
6.2	SEA Risk review of all UNICEF partners	PSEA FP		12/30/2022	Completed	This is done as part of partnership agreement processes.
6.3	Advocate to move help desks from police units and staff them with trained, gender balanced teams	CP Gedaref Office	James Kamira	4/29/2022	Completed	UNHCR and COR manages the desk through partners on information sharing, receives and provides feedbacks to program participants. When complaints or issues are received from the desk, they are channeled to the relevant partner who would ensure the issues are addressed and feedback provided to the desk. Police however maintains presence in the camps and there is ongoing engagement on inclusion.

6.4	Assess the viability to provide income generation activities and cash transfers to empower women and girls.	Gederef Office	James Kamira	12/30/2022	Completed	The vulnerability criteria for the ongoing cash support by UNHCR is strictly targeting children with medical conditions (mild to severe conditions), IGA for women and girls is based on vulnerability criteria that includes women and girls at risk (living alone, female headed households, those with manageable illness including HIV, out of school etc.) Also, there is general crafts or skill acquisition which is usually open to all women and girls serving as a form of PSS.
7	Conduct immediate investigations of SEA cases and take actions on • individual perpetrators, including the immediate separation and expulsions from the vicinity of the camps, of persons found to have committed SGVB and SEA against the refugees; and • partner organizations whose staff are found to have committed SEA, including a review at HQ level.				Partially Agree	
7.1	Immediate separation of perpetrators (PSEA/GBV) linked to UNICEF and its partners	CFO; Gederef office (with support from CO)	Osman AbuFatima, James Kamira	12/30/2022	Completed	For personnel beyond UNICEF and its partners, HCR is in charge. Also “expulsion from the vicinity of the camps”, especially for GBV cases, is not within UNICEF control (should be HCR/COR with police/security forces). UNICEF has followed up with partners to ensure immediate separation of perpetrators.
7.2	Partner organizations whose staff are found to have committed SEA, including a review at HQ level.	CFO; Gederef office (with support from CO)	James Kamira, Osman AbuFatima	12/30/2022	Completed	This is part of existing processes.
8	Advocate for and or provide technical and financially support for the establishment of fit-for-purpose psychosocial and clinical care, as well as survivor centres for GBV and SEA in the three camps, including Babikri camp. Strengthen GBV and PSEA programming by working more closely with UNFPA, WHO, UNHCR and COR on SGBV				Agree	

8.1	Work with UNFPA, SCCW, FCPU and partners to strengthening the case management systems and strengthen linkages between GBV referral pathways and Child Protection referral pathways	CP Gedaref Office PSEA focal point-SCO)	James Kamira,Osma AbuFatima	12/30/2022	Completed	Until Dec 2022, UNICEF was co-chairing the CP sub cluster and PSEA working group through which capacity building was done for partners on CP referral pathway, GBV referral pathway & a workshop bring together both CP & GBV partners established linkages between CP & GBV referral pathways. UNHCR & UNFPA are currently taking on the lead on action points generated during the respective workshops. Engagement with UNFPA, SCCW, FCPU, UNHCR, & partners on capacity bridging and proper intervention. Through the PSEA network, GBV WG and CP WG, UNICEF has advocated for services & updating the GBV referral pathway. The current referral pathway has medical care including Clinical Management of Rape (women, girls, boys, men), providing contraceptives to prevent unintended pregnancies, offering pregnancy testing & counseling; & supporting peoples living with HIV/AIDS. Case management is done by both CP & GBV partners to support survivors get over their challenges & build resilience. Psychosocial suppo
9	Build capacity of Government ministry and implementing partners responsible for Child Protection in case management through, for example, but not limited to contracting experienced child protection case management agency(ies) and individuals.				Agree	
9.1	Building the capacity of Government ministry and implementing partners responsible for Child Protection in case management	Child Protection section and Gedaref Office	James Kamira	6/29/2022	Completed	The CP working group was activated, which is col-lead by UNICEF, UNHCR and SCCW. Within this, a case management task force was established, and capacity building (trainings, coaching and mentoring sessions) conducted for SCCW social workers, case workers from partner agencies implementing CP and GBV case management. Tools including ToRs, SOPs, 5Ws, are in place
10	Review and strengthen AAP interventions implementation, including introducing: • SMART AAP indicators into the emergency response results framework • connecting AAP interventions to RBM in the emergency response work plans, and • AAP support supervision (Targeted technical assistance at the place of work. In this case a technical specialist from Khartoum would provide TA at the camps to the AAP focal person at Gedarif, on regular structured basis.) by a CO based specialist who has a dotted line responsibility over the AAP focal person in Gedarif. • Introduction of a biannual AAP scorecard will help the emergency response implement AAP adaptive management.				Agree	

10.1	Introduce SMART AAP indicators into the emergency response results framework	Chief Field Offices and Emergency Gedaref Office	Jill Lawler, Naokc Akiyama, Jam Kamira	4/29/2022	Completed	The Strategy and Response Plan for Ethiopian Refugee Crisis, Eastern Sudan (January to December 2022-extended to March 2023) includes 3 indicators on AAP ie - Establishment of the AAP through Community feedback; Capacity building of community leaders, volunteers, and partners through orientation sessions, and awareness raising activities; evidence based information from field with feedback to agencies and working groups while sharing back to the communities.
10.2	Connecting AAP interventions to RBM in the emergency response work plans, and	Gedaref Office	James Kamira	6/29/2022	Completed	AAP interventions within the refugee response are integrated within ongoing programs and partnership documents with UNICEF implementing partners. Education and Protection working group along with sub-working groups (GBV/CP) put in place an interagency community based feedback and complaint mechanism (including SOPs). This includes inter-agency community meetings with refugees, suggestion/complaint boxes, toll free and protection lines, protection desks, Community structures, interpersonal communication, and outreach teams including SBC volunteers. UNICEF is specifically using outreach teams (SBC volunteers and SCCW social workers), community based child protection networks, interpersonal communication, teachers, PTAs, CFS animators among others. Feedback is always shared with stakeholders including HCR, local authorities and partners through the working groups.
10.3	AAP support supervision (Targeted technical assistance at the place of work. In this case a technical specialist from Khartoum would provide TA at the camps to the AAP focal person at Gedarif, on regular structured basis.) by a CO based specialist who has a dotted line responsibility over the AAP focal person in Gedarif	FOE Gedaref Office SBC	Jill Lawler, James Kamira	3/30/2022	Completed	AAP in integrated within the roles of all program officers at Gedaref level during program vision missions.

10.4	Introduction of a biannual AAP scorecard will help the emergency response implement AAP adaptive management	Gedaref Office	James Kamira	7/29/2022	Completed	UNICEF advocated through the refugee working group platform for establishment of the AAP sub working group with UNHCR co-leading this working group as UNICEF provided technical support with a focus on refugee camps. Feedback, Referral and Tracking Mechanism SOPs are in place and being implemented, also SOPs for protection referral/feedback/tracking form for camps in place as led by UNHCR, Also a protection and referral form being used by partners, SOPs for management of complaint boxes, and ToRs for the task force on complaint boxes is in place. These were the context based agreed upon approaches to help implement AAP adoptive management in Gedaref for refugee camps to address the gap for bi annual AAP score cards. As part of the inter-agency road map to address this in a more sustainable way for refugee camps, it was agreed that UNHCR takes lead on. UNICEF has handed over refugee camp programming to UNHCR.
11	Work/Coordinate with other UN agencies and stakeholders in the response: UNHCR and other actors on cross-border protection of refugees to prevent future atrocities on IDPs and refugees like happened to those fleeing towards the Sudanese border. This is important, however, disagree as UNICEF's action point as this is beyond UNICEF's mandate and the role of police and other protection services. UNICEF's role is continued advocacy for protection of children and women and technical support on CP in general. UNAIDS, MOH, WHO, UNDP and other partners to streamline HIV, TB, Hepatitis, and other communicable disease challenges. Strategies on how the health system can be strengthened. COR, ILO, Plan International and other partners to resolve child labour challenges. Agencies working in this response seem to have inadvertently omitted to dedicate planning and implementation of child labor prevention programs.				Partially Agree	
11.1	Advocate with UNHCR and other actors on cross-border protection of refugees to prevent future atrocities on IDPs and refugees like happened to those fleeing towards the Sudanese border	CP and Gedaref Office	James Kamira	6/29/2022	Completed	UNHCR has deployed a security officer who provides updates on security situation on the border points and cross border. This information is used to always advocate on cross boarder protection. The refugee working group and protection working groups are the only viable option for UNICEF as this is beyond UNICEF mandate. At the border points, FCPU and SCCW social workers work closely to ensure protection of children, FTR services and support of children in conflict with the law (refugees and Sudanese).

11.2	Streamline response to communicable diseases and put in place strategies to strengthen response	health	Aigul Nurgabilova	12/30/2022	Completed	<p>UNICEF to continue to work closely with WHO, MOH and other health partners to integrate and streamline tools and processes. UNICEF with UNAIDS, MOH and WHO's strategy is using the risk based programming to prevent and timely respond to communicable disease outbreaks through: - Improved infection surveillance system with preparedness plan. - Prepositioning health and nutrition supplies - Capacity building of PHC and community health workers on timely identification, case management and referral of the cases - SBC interventions in camps and hosting communities - Capacity building in Infection Prevention and Control with adequate supply of PPEs. - Ensure access to WASH facilities with no open defecation strategies. UNICEF is partnering with SMOH with funding from UNAIDS in providing PMTCT services as prevention procedures so as to streamlining HIV response in the camps. For TB is providing nutrition services as most of T.B cases among children are malnourished. For Hepatitis U</p>
11.3	Strengthen health system	Health	Aigul Nurgabilova	12/30/2022	Completed	<p>The strategies to strength the health system includes strengthening the coordination system through a strong Nutrition sector coordination and leadership; Strength warehousing system management through building warehouses for the line ministries for improved storage of health and nutrition supplies as well as the construction of the EPI cold chain and rehabilitation of health facilities; strengthening information system through capacity building for the SMOH and partner staff, provision of data collection, documentation, and communication tools; prioritizing integrated/ multi-sectoral interventions</p>

11.4	Advocate with UNHCR to address child labor issues with relevant actors (COR, ILO, Plan International and other partners).	CP Gedaref Office	Bakary Sogoba, James Kamira	3/30/2023	Completed	UNICEF will continue to advocate for greater protection and access to services. One training conducted in partnership with UNICEF and UNHCR CP teams on child labor. Also education has been used as a pathway in prevention of Child labour. UNICEF has invested integrated programming including transition from informal to formal education for the refugee children. Child labour has been minimized as children enroll in schools for primary and secondary education, child labour. Also representation of teachers on the community based child protection networks in contributing to prevention and mitigation of child labour. However, with the reduction in food rations to refugees, more families are likely going to engage their children in child labour for additional food for households.
12	Scale up capacity-building efforts on local/national partners, extending the capacity development work that was done with EI Taweki and SCCW				Agree	
12.1	Scale up capacity-building efforts on local/national partners, extending the capacity development work that was done with EI Taweki and SCCW	Gedaref office	James Kamira	5/30/2023	Completed	Trainings and dedicated capacity support undertaken. One partnership training conducted by the partnership team in Gedaref for national and international UNICEF partners as well as line ministries of CP, education, WASH, Health and Nutrition. Partner capacity building plans integrated in field missions by UNICEF personal. Trainings done for SCCW social workers, community based networks and CP/GBV partners through the existing coordination platforms. The GBV case management capacity building TOT was conducted and the Civil Society Organisations from Gedaref attended.