

Evaluation Management Response Document

Region: ECAR

Office: Republic of Kyrgyzstan

Evaluation Year: 2022

Evaluation Title: Evaluation of PBF PVE Project "Communities resilient to violent ideologies"

Person In Charge For Follow Up to Management Response: Nuriia Karakulova

Overall response to evaluation

The evaluation was commissioned to critically reflect on lessons learned and good practices from this project in order to inform and strengthen joint implementation and strengthen peacebuilding initiatives. Evaluation TOR, Inception Report and Final Report were cleared by UNICEF external quality assurance mechanism and Peacebuilding Fund Support Office. The methodology of the evaluation allowed to gather evidence to support valid and coherent findings. Efforts were made to triangulate data from different sources. The evaluation process employed a participatory approach involving all implementing agencies in an Evaluation Management Group and key stakeholders and beneficiaries in Evaluation Reference Group at all stages. Recommendations are grouped by target audiences for easy reference and use. The Management Response is based on intensive discussions among three implementing agencies' staff.

Planned Use of the Evaluation

Findings and recommendations have been discussed with the Evaluation Reference Group. Management responses have been developed by UNICEF, UN Women and UNFPA programme staff. It is expected that project evaluation findings and recommendations will inform future programming strategies of involved duty bearers, CSO implementing partners, UNICEF, UNFPA, UN Women and the Peacebuilding Fund to strengthen peacebuilding initiatives, influence development and implementation of future youth empowerment and peacebuilding projects.

Recommendations and Actions

No.	Recommendations/Actions	Responsible Section (Action)	Responsible Person Name (Action)	Expected Completion (Action)	Mgt Response / Implementation Stage	Reason/Action Taken
1	Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 1: The RUNOs should continue focusing on youth empowerment and peacebuilding around VE through an integrated approach, while including peacebuilding in their regular programs and investing in skill development on peacebuilding. Operational recommendations • RUNOs should consider developing peacebuilding projects around VE by continuing to use an integrated approach applied by the project under review. • RUNOs should anchor their peacebuilding approach in the broader strategic planning and programming architecture of country offices by including peacebuilding outcomes in the CPD and their strategies. • When designing new peacebuilding projects, RUNOs should define difficult concepts such as VE into the project document, in collaboration with the UNRC office, based on good practices and the growing literature on the subject. RUNOs should consider strengthening their technical expertise in peacebuilding, in collaboration with the PBF by attending online courses or in-person training.				Agree	
1.1	Youth empowerment and peacebuilding are to be included in UNICEF and UNFPA Country Programme Documents (CPD) for 2023-2027 and UN Women Strategic Note 2023-2026.	UNICEF	Yulia Oleinik	6/29/2022	Completed	UNICEF CPD 2023-2027 includes peacebuilding approach in implementing strategies for ADAP programming
1.2	Difficult and sensitive concepts such as "Kyrgyz Jarany", "peacebuilding" are to be included in the proposal writing stage of all new PBF projects.	UNICEF	Sylvi Hill	3/28/2024	Completed	1.2022 YPI and PRF project proposals both include orientation on Kyrgyz Jarany and peacebuilding more broadly. 2. PBF project "Inclusive governance and shared identity for sustainable peace and development" includes "Kyrgyz Jarany" and "peacebuilding" concepts
1.3	For RUNO staff involved in implementation of new PBF projects, workshops on conflict sensitivity and "do no harm" approach will be organized.	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	3/28/2024	Completed	In partnership with Peace Nexus, the PBF Secretariat, and the RC Office, provided a series of workshops and training on conflict sensitivity and peacebuilding programming, attended by all UN agencies and state partners.

1.4	RUNO staff will participate in relevant peacebuilding trainings.	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	3/28/2024	Completed	In partnership with Peace Nexus, the PBF Secretariat, and the RC Office, provided a series of workshops and training on conflict sensitivity and peacebuilding programming, attended by all UN agencies and state partners.
1.5	If there is a successor project, UNICEF and UNFPA will propose youth empowerment through the existing youth platforms.	UNICEF	Cristina Brugiolo	3/28/2024	Completed	<p>The RUNOs continue focusing on youth empowerment and building youth peacebuilding competencies. The ongoing peacebuilding project "Inclusive governance and shared identity for sustainable peace and development" includes the component led by UNICEF on building capacity of the local self government in 7 target locations and building capacity of youth by using the UPSHIFT methodology. UPSHIFT is a youth social innovation program in Kyrgyzstan that empowers young people to identify and address community problems. It encourages participants to think critically, work collaboratively, and develop innovative solutions to local issues. Through UPSHIFT, youth acquire skills in project management, problem-solving, leadership, and communication, as well as technical skills related to their specific projects. This program has led to the development of 42 youth-initiated peacebuilding solutions, demonstrating its effectiveness in fostering social change and community development. The majority of these solutions have been supported by the LSGs. In both YPI and PRF proposals, the RUNOs defined such concept as "kyrgyz jarany", "peacebuilding". The component on building peace competencies among youth and supporting their social cohesion initiatives are one of the key interventions of the UNICEF's ADAP program, which is supported by a two-year work plan approved by the relevant ministries and UNICEF.</p>

2	<p>Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 2: RUNOs should strengthen MEL systems to make learning one of the priorities when developing and implementing peacebuilding projects. Operational recommendations: • The RUNOs should clarify the logic behind the TOC pathways, underlying assumptions and objectives. The TOC should include a visualization of the logical connections and underlying assumptions. The TOC should clearly show all the underlying assumptions that are clearly illustrated, tested and refined as necessary during implementation. • Based on the TOC M&E frameworks, RUNOs should: o Develop SMART indicators and data collection tools that facilitate the attribution to the activities of the project. o Develop specific tools or mechanisms to capture the catalytic role of the project. They should use qualitative methodologies, such as the 'outcome mapping', that empower beneficiaries to collect the data themselves and show changes in the observed behavior. o Develop a digital platform that captures progress against the indicators and major reflections and changes during implementation. o Develop a M&E system and workplan that allow flexibility on revising the indicators, as needed. Develop a solid RF/logframe and related workplan while allowing flexibility to revise activities, indicators or budget items during implementation. • RUNOs should gradually integrate learning into project activities. This could be done by adding a specific section on the reporting templates on learning related to the problems the projects faced and the solutions devised to address those problems. This could be also done, lightly, by asking a series of systematic questions during the formal meetings agencies hold such as: what did we learn about the problem we are trying to face? What are learning about the way in which we collaborate? 'Light events' specifically on learning would give UN agencies and the main stakeholder some space for reflection.</p>				Partially Agree	
2.1	Pathways, underlying assumptions and objectives are clearly identified and visualized when designing logic behind PBF TOC.	UNICEF	Sylvi Hill	6/29/2022	Completed	TOCs for YPI and Peacebuilding Recovery Facility (PRF) re-designed following feedback from PDA/O. Now more in line with PBF guidance, include assumptions and evidence and more clearly visualise the project pathway.
2.2	Current and future PBF project M&E frameworks will be developed considering recommendations of this evaluation.	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	3/28/2024	Completed	Current PBF project "Inclusive governance and shared identity for sustainable peace and development" has comprehensive M&E framework.
2.3	Learning approach will be integrated into future and current PBF projects including "Inclusive governance and shared identity for sustainable peace and development" project.	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	3/28/2024	Completed	RUNOs integrated learning approach into new projects by adding a specific components on learning to the M&E frameworks as well as joint reflection sessions on learning 'what works'.
3	<p>Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 3: When conducting joint projects, RUNOs should clarify the roles, responsibilities, and level of collaboration they seek. Operational recommendations: • RUNOs should better specify the nature of collaboration they envisage within joint programs based on the project objectives, budget, country context, agencies involved and based on the UN joint programming guidance. They should justify the extent to which they will collaborate, such as how many joint activities they intend to develop, at conception stage. • RUNOs should consider the development of a 'responsibility matrix', at proposal stage and finalize before starting implementation, to clarify comparative advantages and the specific tasks of each agency in the project document. • RUNOs should articulate a joint workplan, including a description of the inputs needed to carry out the activities and the budget for completing those activities. • RUNOs should learn from other joint programs about the governance structure they used, the type of activities they developed, etc. (see Recommendation 1)</p>				Agree	
3.1	Responsibility matrix that clarifies governance structure and RUNOs roles and responsibilities will be developed before starting implementation of PBF projects, including current "Inclusive governance and shared identity for sustainable peace and development".	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	3/28/2024	Completed	Responsibility matrix for "Inclusive governance and shared identity for sustainable peace and development" project has been developed.

3.2	Joint workplan with description of budgets, locations, interventions will be developed by RUNO together with relevant ministries and President's Office.	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	3/28/2024	Completed	Joint workplan for "Inclusive governance and shared identity for sustainable peace and development" project has been developed.
4	Evaluation Recommendation or Issue 4: When developing peacebuilding projects, RUNOs should develop solid partnerships with complementary projects by identifying them at conception stage, building on synergies, interacting during implementation and documenting this in progress reports. Operational recommendations: • RUNOs should, at the project design and implementation stages, ensure that proper synergies are sought with partners and donors that have developed complementary projects. • RUNOs should ensure that learning about complementary projects and synergy development is happening. During implementation, agencies should document how complementary projects affect synergies or adjustments.				Agree	
4.1	RUNOs together with relevant state institutions and implementing partners will develop a partnership strategy in order to ensure synergy among complementary projects and avoid duplication.	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	6/27/2024	Completed	The joint partnership strategy has been developed jointly by RUNOs and relevant ministries and President Office.
4.2	PBF projects will identify and make linkages (where possible) between ongoing peacebuilding work by other UN agencies and CSOs (beyond PBF) and new peacebuilding work.	UNICEF	Nuriia Karakulova	6/27/2024	Completed	To enhance collaboration among stakeholders involved in addressing youth, peacebuilding, and social cohesion issues, the PBF Secretariat and the Resident Coordinator's Office (RCO) established regular Joint Steering Committee meetings, held quarterly. Along with that, RUNOs quarterly meetings are taking place. During these meetings, all RUNOs present updates, and other stakeholders seek synergistic opportunities, and strive to prevent overlap in efforts.