

Evaluation Management Response Document

Region: MENAR

Office: Iraq

Evaluation Year: 2021

Evaluation Title: Evaluation of the WASH Smart City Initiative Pilot Project in Baghdad

Person In Charge For Follow Up to Management Response: Ali Al-Khateeb

Overall response to evaluation

The evaluation report will support UNICEF WASH program and the government water service providers since it's in the way to scale up and replicate the smart city initiative at other Iraqi governorates. The analysis and recommendations are clear for both UNICEF and government partners for which they are going to take in consideration the main outcome results and do a corrective action. Also, the findings of the evaluation will feed into the program processes in strengthening the delivery, efficiency, and effectiveness of WASH services in general. The evaluation was aimed to assess how UNICEF supported the Smart City Initiative to facilitate, sustain water services and automate communications between the customers and water service providers and promoted the well-being of children and the extent to which the program is positioned for delivery across development continuum. The evaluation has provided key recommendations for maximizing outcome results. It has also highlighted significant policy, system strengthening and capacity barriers. The below workplan was produced in collaboration with the ministry of municipalities, Housing and Public Municipalities, the Mayorality of Baghdad and UNICEF WASH program staff. The workplan will be integrated into UNICEF and Government of Iraq Rolling work plan for 2022-2024 WASH program. Advocacy meetings will be held with the water service providers to ensure developing a paper to discuss the needs for implementing the water sector reforms.

Planned Use of the Evaluation

The recommendations of the evaluation report are well taken in consideration by UNICEF ICO and specially the WASH program as well as the main government partners who are the end users of the smart city initiative. Such an agreed approach will enhance the quality water services being delivered to the customers in Baghdad and other governorates once scaled up. Also, program staff will also use the recommendation as advocacy tool with the main governments partners. The evaluation report was disseminated to the ministry of construction, housing and public municipalities and the mayorality of Baghdad while it will be presented at the upcoming three days annual review workshop at which other different government partners representatives will be invited.

Recommendations and Actions

No.	Recommendations/Actions	Responsible Section (Action)	Responsible Person Name (Action)	Expected Completion (Action)	Mgt Response / Implementation Stage	Reason/Action Taken
1	Repeating the installation of smart meters on a stand-alone basis, and in locations where volumetric charges are not permitted, should be avoided. Instead, UNICEF should encourage (and potentially support, if funds are available) the demonstration of full smart functionality, as described in the evaluation TOR (i.e. installing and testing a networked smart water grids that automate water monitoring and control), ideally by building on the SCI-Pilot in Baghdad.				Agree	
1.0	Discuss and agree with the governmental partner to expand the pilot only to governorates where charges are in place and water monitoring will be monitored.	WASH section	Hussein Al-Azzawi	12/31/2021	Completed	Following productive discussions with government officials, the decision was made to scale up the Smart City Initiative pilot. The project is currently being replicated across all 15 governorates in Iraq (excluding the Kurdistan Region of Iraq) where charges are in place and water consumption is monitored. The attached evidence are the minutes of meeting between UNICEF and MoCHPM and the MoCHPM letter referring to the scale up of the project in 15 governorates.
2	When planning future activities under the SCI, UNICEF should set objectives that are realistic in terms of what IT improvements can deliver on their own.				Agree	

2.0	Review the outcome results of the pilot together with the government partner to establish realistic outcome statement and indicators.	WASH section	Hussein Al-Azzawi	12/31/2021	Completed	The Ministry of Construction, Housing and Public Municipalities (MoCHPM) has established an online platform, under the direct supervision of the minister, to monitor the deployment, installation, and operation of smart water meters across all 15 Iraqi governorates. This platform tracks revenue generated in Iraqi dinars (IQD). The online platform is only accessible by the ministry.
3	UNICEF (and other development partners) should continue to advocate for implementation of the reforms envisaged in the 2011 Road Map (including the introduction of an independent regulator and substantive private sector participation in service delivery, as well as the application of a tariff reform). The need for an updating of the Road Map should be further explored by UNICEF.				Agree	
3.1	Develop advocacy paper to discuss with key government partners the need for implementing the reforms.	WASH section	Hussein Al-Azzawi	10/29/2022	Completed	The advocacy paper jointly developed with the decision makers at the Ministry of Construction, Housing and Public Municipalities (MoCHPM) which elaborates on the Smart City Initiative concept.
3.2	Discuss with key government partners, based on the advocacy paper, the need for implementing the reform.	WASH section	Hussein Al-Azzawi	12/30/2022	Completed	Discussions were held with government staff and decision-makers through the sector coordination body focused on reforming Iraq's water sector. The aim is to increase revenue generation to cover the operation and maintenance costs of water facilities.
3.3	Discuss with government partners, based on the advocacy paper, the potential for a review of sector Road Map.	WASH section	Hussein Al-Azzawi	12/30/2022	Completed	UNICEF provided technical advisory to the Ministry of Construction, Housing and Public Municipalities (MoCHPM) in developing a three-year costed action plan to reform the water and sanitation sector in Iraq. This plan, endorsed by the MoCHPM minister, aims to mobilize financial resources from the federal budget to improve the sector.
4	For any future project, including a pilot, UNICEF should set out the purpose, objectives and expected results in a project document and results framework that explain clearly the rationale for the project including the particular issue or challenge it is trying to address and how this will (potentially) be achieved. Targets, milestones, indicators, budget and expenditure data should be clearly defined. If needed, a baseline should be established at or before the start-up of the project.				Agree	

4.0	Follow-up whether the existing programme document template is systematically used by UNICEF Iraq. The follow-up will focus on the specific characteristics of Pilot projects, including whether there is a clearly elaborated rationale for the project, whether the purpose is well defined and the results framework well defined at objectives and expected results levels (impact, outcome, output levels) and their indicators, and whether the budget is well defined and reflects the boundaries of the pilot.	PMR	Claes Johansson,O Mahmood Agha	12/31/2022	Completed	There were no pilot projects implemented by Iraq Country Office in the last two years, however, UNICEF's PMR section have conducted a 4-day RRBM training which included sessions on developing results framework. The training agenda is provided as evidence.
5	UNICEF and their implementing partners should monitor any future project, including a pilot, closely to track what changes are achieved against the project document, the results framework and, if available, a documented baseline.				Agree	
5.1	Roll-out the newly designed Iterative Beneficiary Monitoring to keep track of progress against outcome and output results, and take timely adaptive measures to bring projects back on track when needed.	PMR	Claes Johansson	3/31/2022	Completed	Both Iterative Beneficiary Monitoring reports were completed (Round 1 in October 2021 and Round 2 in May 2022)
5.2	Monitor the use of the Iterative Beneficiary Monitoring tool by the Programme Sections for monitoring of programme outcome and output level results.	PMR	Claes Johansson,O Mahmood Agha	12/31/2022	Completed	After conducting each each Iterative Beneficiary Monitoring (IBM) activity, the Planning, Monitoring and Reporting (PMR) Section produces a report and share with the relevant sections. In addition, PMR also produces a PowerPoint Presentation highlighting the main findings and gaps to be followed up by the sections. In addition, each IBM activity is linked to an output and output indicator (s) at the very early planning stages to ensure that all of this work is results oriented and contribute to the monitoring at the results level.