

unicef 



IMPROVING ACCESS TO QUALITY BASIC EDUCATION IN IRAQ  
Mid-term Evaluation

March 2013

 geopolicity.

## CONTENTS

<b>ABBREVIATIONS.....</b>	<b>IV</b>
<b>A: EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Main Conclusions</i> .....	4
<i>Key Recommendations</i> .....	4
<b>B. PROJECT OBJECTIVES &amp; BACKGROUND.....</b>	<b>10</b>
OVERALL PROJECT OBJECTIVE .....	11
OVERALL EVALUATION OBJECTIVE .....	11
EXPECTED PROJECT RESULTS .....	11
MAIN EVALUATION ISSUES.....	12
<b>C. CONCLUSIONS .....</b>	<b>14</b>
GENERAL PROJECT DELIVERY ENVIRONMENT:.....	15
OBJECTIVE 1: POLICY SUPPORT .....	16
OBJECTIVE 2: CAPACITY BUILDING .....	19
OBJECTIVE 3: SOCIAL MOBILIZATION .....	24
<i>Activity 3.3: PTA Mobilisation Communication Package Developed</i> .....	24
OTHER CORE OBSERVATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS.....	24
<i>Quality</i> .....	24
<i>Over-planning and Over-coordination</i> .....	25
<i>Policy Coordination</i> .....	26
<i>Absence, Dropout, Repetition</i> .....	26
<i>Coping with Displacement and Population Movement</i> .....	26
<i>Non-Programme Schools</i> .....	26
<i>Violence</i> .....	26
<i>Piloting and Coverage</i> .....	26
OWNERSHIP .....	27
CHILD-FRIENDLY SCHOOLS .....	27
<i>Performance Indicators</i> .....	27
SCHOOL-BASED MANAGEMENT.....	28
DECENTRALISATION .....	28
<i>Pitfalls and Contradictions of Decentralisation</i> .....	29
TEACHER TRAINING AND RESOURCE CENTRES.....	30
LIFE SKILLS .....	30
PARTICIPATION AND CONTRIBUTION .....	31
OVERCROWDING, SHIFTS AND LENGTH OF SCHOOL DAY.....	31
IT, E-LEARNING AND CHILD-FRIENDLY EDUCATION .....	32
SCHOOLS FOR GIFTED AND SPECIAL NEEDS.....	32
ENRICHMENT / EXTRACURRICULAR ACTIVITIES.....	33
PERFORMANCE MONITORING.....	33
IMPLEMENTING PARTNERS .....	34
VISIBILITY .....	34
<b>D. 35</b>	
<b>D. RECOMMENDATION.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>ANNEXES .....</b>	<b>38</b>
ANNEX 1: METHODOLOGY .....	39
ANNEX 2: SELF-ASSESSMENT SURVEY (MOE 200 SCHOOLS).....	41
ANNEX 3: STANDARDS FOR CHILD FRIENDLY SCHOOLS DEVELOPED FOR KURDISTAN.....	43
ANNEX 4: CAPACITY BUILDING (JUL - DEC 2012).....	47

**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

ANNEX 5: KEY INFORMANTS..... 48  
ANNEX 6: LIST OF SCHOOLS VISITED..... 49

**TABLES**

Table 1: Evaluation Summary ..... 6  
Table 2: Contributions of the Local Government within the CFS Program..... 17  
Table 3: Estimates of Learners and Non-Tertiary Public Servants ..... 18  
Table 4: Stakeholders Central to Developing Provincial Investment Plans ..... 19  
Table 5: Summary of Fieldwork Itinerary ..... 40

## **ABBREVIATIONS**

ALP	Accelerated Learning Programme
AWP	Annual Work Plan
BC	British Council
CFS	Child Friendly School
CPAP	Country Programme Action Plan
DoE	Directorate of Education
EC	European Community
ECE	Early Childhood Education
ECD	Early Childhood development
EMIS	Education Management Information System
EU	European Union
GIS	Geographic Information System
Gol	Government of Iraq
INGO	International Non-governmental Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
I-PSM	Iraq-Public Sector Modernisation
I-PSM	Iraq-Public Sector Modernisation
IRC	International Rescue Committee
IT	Information Technologies
KRG	Kurdistan regional Government
MAC	Ministerial Advisory Commission
MAG	Mine Advisory Group
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
MTE	Mid-Term Evaluation
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MOPDC	Ministry of Planning and Development Co-operation
MoLSA	Ministry of Social Affairs
MRE	Mine Risk Education
MSG	Mother Support Group
NCG	National Core Group
NESI	National Education Strategy for Iraq
NDP	National Development Plan
PTA	Parents Teachers Association
PMAC	Prime Minister's Advisory Commission
PWG	Priority Working Group
SBM	School-Based Management
SC	Steering Committee
SIP	School Improvement Plan
SSA	School Self-Assessment
ToR	Terms of reference
ToT	Training of Trainers
TRC	Teacher Resource Centre
TTI	Teacher Training Institute
UNAMI	United Nations Assistance Mission for Iraq
UNDAF	United Nations Development Action Framework
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Fund

## A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. ***Geopolicy is pleased to present this Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE) report on the EU-supported Improving Access to Quality Basic Education programme in Iraq.*** The programme is large and complex, involving a major shift in the perceptions and practices of the entire primary education system of Iraq. Whereas, it was formerly assumed that the education system was reflective of learner needs and progress through the primary education cycle, the present programme focuses on learner experience and opportunities to improve the system, effectively from the bottom up. It should be noted that while the educational impact of the programme is not a focus of this study, 'change in the child' is nevertheless considered the main aim of education and, therefore, factored into the evaluation of interventions to date.

## Objectives

2. ***The overall objective of the programme is to improve access to quality education in Iraq, especially for girls, through increased capacity of the government to ensure that policy development, technical support, and institutional strengthening is carried out at the national, governorate, and local levels.*** Three specific sub-objectives support the attainment of the wider project goal, as outlined below:

- ***Specific Objective One:*** To support the revision of existing government policies and development of new policies and initiatives that will improve the quality of the Iraqi education system at primary level;
- ***Specific Objective Two:*** To build the capacity of the government to implement the new policies and initiatives at all levels: central, directorate, district, community, and school; and,
- ***Specific Objective Three:*** To mobilize community support for improved retention and increased enrolment of out of schoolgirls and boys.

3. ***The objective of this MTE was to determine, as systematically and objectively as possible, the relevance, appropriateness and coherence of the EU sponsored programme to "Improve access to quality basic education in Iraq, especially for girls";*** the efficiency (referring to carrying out activities on time and within the budgeted cost) with which project activities have been delivered and their respective outputs realized, their connectedness to those produced by other actors; the effectiveness (referring to quality of outputs) of the programme in relation to its objectives; and the program's sustainability. The evaluation explicitly identifies the factors affecting the programme on these criteria (of relevance, appropriateness, coherence, efficiency, connectedness, effectiveness as mentioned above), including operating factors within and outside the control of UNICEF Iraq office.

## Context

4. ***Understanding the context within which the programme is being implemented, reforms institutionalized and quality reform measures introduced, was critical to drawing conclusions, especially given the central role that the Ministry of Education plays in most of programme activities.*** Since 2003, some reform and modernization projects in Iraq have failed to meet their expected outcomes. This is often as a result of difficult political and security environment depending on the general state. Further, a post-crisis focus on delivering 'quantity' before 'quality', unlike before the crisis meant that quality indicators had to be rebuilt and were not sufficiently included in the project design.

5. ***Key considerations in drawing conclusions therefore include:***

- ***Overall Policy Development Context:*** The 2012 National Education Strategy goes a long way towards outlining sector development needs, yet the strategy does not include much focus on change management in a decentralisation, administrative, civil service or public finance

reforms. The Ministry of Education policy units require to have more influence and to be consulted more. Sector planning is still centralised and often quantity and not quality based.

- **Overall Sector Governance Context:** The drive to increase access to education has meant a focus on increasing teacher numbers, building schools and improving learner to teacher ratios. With the number of teachers more than tripling, and with lack on in-service or teacher training arrangements a structural constraint, sector wide progress in driving quality requires significant investment in human resource and the overall performance incentive environment;
- **Overall School Based Management Context:** Parental involvement in school management has historically been limited, and despite various efforts, lack of public policy dialogue, communication and socialization means that this project has to overcome a recent weakness and ‘forgetting’ of school governance. Moreover, as most head teachers, children and parents have limited to zero experience of other national schools contexts, there is no clear benchmark for quality education around which poor quality can easily be judged. Metrics are clearly critical to such an outcome;
- **Overall Incentive Framework:** A major problem within the Ministry of Education, at national, regional, provincial, district and school levels is weak performance management and incentive framework practices;
- **Complexity:** The project design is complex, and with activities cutting across policy, planning, budgeting, execution and oversight functions, the project effectively needs to deal with five layers of delivery (central, regional, provincial, district and schools).

## Methodology

6. **The overall approach applied was based on the OECD/DAC Principles for the Evaluation of Development Assistance, and involved a combination of (i) primary data collection, including mixed-method, interviews/focus groups and direct observations, and (ii) secondary analysis of existing data.** The MTE focus on a selected number of schools both within and outside the current reach of the program, to allow for evidence-based comparison. Extensive informant interviews and discussions were also held with Ministry of Education (MoE) officials, UNICEF staff members and partner staff.

## General Conclusions

- Improving the quality of education is central to the programme;
- In the context of Iraq’s recovery and restoration, the term ‘child-friendly’ maps onto the idea of a good school, with good teachers, giving good education, with good results. These are not just exam results, or promotion to the next school but skills, and social and psychological competences;
- Providing sufficient support at the teacher level is key to all education sector reforms in Iraq, and the Evaluation Team welcomes UNICEF’s holistic approach to supporting teachers through and beyond the scope of training. Full support needs to be given to this approach;
- Learners’ role in enhancing their educational environment requires further attention, and opportunities could be explored in the programme to engage children in creating enriched school environments including the posting of pictures, diagrams, maps on school premises, which also encourage accidental and incidental learning;
- Most schools observed offer limited facilities that allow for extracurricular activities, such as sport, art, music or science; and,
- The evaluation concludes that the project needs to further emphasise and clarify its intended added value to basic education in Iraq, in terms of impact on change in children.

## Main Conclusions

- Verification procedures are generally weak, with an over-reliance on written reporting, with limited physical contact with the schools;
- It is necessary to differentiate between poorer and richer areas, and to strengthen efforts in poorer areas to remove risks of imbalances;
- It is recommended to establish better day-to-day monitoring arrangements and to focus more directly on child and school based outcomes;
- While promoting child-friendly academic environments, attention has to be paid at all levels on change and details, including what are generally viewed as minor issues;
- Real devolution of authority is necessary, including providing the necessary means to parents and teachers to carry out assigned responsibilities;
- Gender imbalance is not found to be a major problem at the primary school level according to Ministry of Education staff, teachers and parents consulted. UNICEF's efforts should therefore focus on the upper primary level, which records higher dropout rates for girls;
- Teachers were found to be aware of the narrow goals of the programme, but did not understand the overall purpose of the programme and their role in it;
- While the role of Information Technologies (IT), particularly computers and tablets, as a means and resources in teaching and learning practices is largely recognised, low use of such technologies in Iraq schools suggests limited understanding of the potential benefits to improving education service delivery and creating friendlier academic environments;
- A strong reference culture in the primary school level (including amongst academic staff) needs to emerge, on the back of better equipped Teacher Training and Resource centres;
- Teachers have requested an extended training package for each subject, in order to explore modern teaching techniques and improve the delivery of lessons. The 6 days training received has been considered insufficient; and,
- The adoption of a simple tool that monitors size of classes, gender ratio, attendance and attrition would add value to current UNICEF efforts.

## Key Recommendations

*The following is a summary of the major recommendations made by this evaluation.* Further details are provided in **Section D** below or in the main text.

### High-level recommendations:

1. Allow for a greater and more active role of the school management, teachers and parents in the school administration.
2. Conduct ongoing modifications and improvements in the program in line with realities on the ground.
3. There is a compelling justification for a no-cost extension at least up until the end of 2014 (perhaps beyond), given the need to (i) focus on communication and socialization of reforms to make quality-inducing changes stick (ii) allow government greater time to institutionalise the overall ethos and approach.
4. Allow flexibility in the re-allocation of budget items to support the implementation of School Improvement Plans (SIPs) until the government is able to finance these items through the budget process in consultation and coordination between the Ministry of Education and UNICEF at the country and regional levels.



**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

5. We recommend abandoning the non-performing programme elements and re-directing funds earmarked for these items to sustainable activities in the areas specified by the Ministry.
6. Since there are so many external factors affecting the functioning of the program, we recommend that the focus should be on outcomes and impact.
7. Establish better monitoring mechanisms, such as joint monitoring visits to schools, to determine the results and their impact on the child and the school.
8. Adjustments should be made to the ALP program, that the move away from intermediate coverage be documented and justified.
9. Branding and Ownership: We recommend a greater focus on branding and ownership; and,
10. Consider the introduction of incentives, such as tokens, badges and promotions to foster local ownership and make participants proud of being part of the programme.

**Recommendations at the school level:**

11. ***School-based management:*** we recommend larger involvement of PTAs through school-based management.
12. ***Gender:*** Efforts in regard to gender should be focussed on primary schools girls drop-out, rather than taking the form of generalised campaigns, given that gender balance is not found to be the most significant problem at the basic education level; and,
13. ***Investment Planning:*** The investment planning process should not just focus on infrastructure needs, but also on ICT and enrichment needs at the school and classroom level.

**Recommendations about teacher training:**

14. ***Teacher Performance Evaluation:*** Evaluating the performance of teachers must be through well-developed standards and methods.
15. ***Training Evaluation:*** Follow-up training results to know about the positive effects.
16. ***Quality of training:*** We recommend the quality of training to be standardized for its success and effectiveness.
17. ***Flexibility:*** Greater flexibility should be given to participants in choosing the time and place of the training and to identify training needs and training patterns.
18. ***Awareness:*** We recommend that greater emphasis is placed on communicating to teachers the importance of their performance and its impact on the child educational development.

**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

**Table 1: Evaluation Summary**

Coverage	
What approximate proportion of relevant (targeted) beneficiary groups has been reached by each intervention?	<p><b>Objective 1:</b> INES has been endorsed. No of CFS Target schools has reached 732 now throughout 18 governorates: 194 in North Zone, 328 in Central Zone and 210 in South Zone. Overall few schools are located in the rural areas, but especially around Basra there are reported to be the better examples of CFS implementation. The school hygiene promotion package was implemented in 240 schools during the reporting period, benefitting 102,152 children out of which 60,028 are boys and 42,124 are girls. 200 School Improvement Plans have been developed.</p> <p><b>Objective 2:</b> total of 5,515 teachers, head teachers and staff of DoEs and MoE, PTA members and community mobilizes amongst others were trained in various areas, such as child-centered teaching methodology, Parents Teacher Association (PTA) guidelines and roles and responsibilities, school management, development of school improvement plans, assessment of training needs of teachers.</p> <p><b>Objective 3:</b> In reporting period 4, enrolment campaigns and girls' education campaigns were organized in many schools at the start of the current academic year (September-October 2012).</p>
To what extent have girls and other targeted sub-populations been reached?	Based on the sample visited by the evaluation team, evidence suggests that girls are being adequately reached under the programme, and schools reflect urban, rural and rich and poor neighborhoods. However there was little specific reference to disability and while drop-out is not a major problem it would be better if it were specifically addressed.
What proportion of Iraq's schools has received each intervention?	<p>A total of 732 schools are so far under the programme*, through 18 governorates, but this will increase to the originally planned 2,000 if a no-cost extension is provided. With more than 24,426 primary and secondary schools in the country, this would be 12% of existing schools.</p> <p>* 194 North Zone, 328 in Central Zone and 210 in South Zone</p>
To what extent have interventions extended beyond core schools to reach all schools in their respective school clusters?	At present programme interventions have not extended much beyond core schools. Examples of similar interventions elsewhere suggest that coverage of all schools in the respective cluster takes time and is not always achievable. Previous efforts to run model schools in South Sudan, for example, resulted in transfer of children of influential parents to model schools, rather than improvement of the less endowed schools.
Effectiveness	
How successful has the programme been in boosting head teachers and teachers' awareness, understanding and knowledge of, and support for, CFS and teachers' capacity for delivering new curriculums in a more action-oriented, child-friendly manner?	Observations and interviews suggest that the six-day training currently provided across programme schools is insufficient to adequately cover and build full understanding and skills required for providing child-friendly education. Many of the teachers commented that not only did they only receive a few days training, but also not all of them did so, and there was no clear programme for training. The benefits of training were, therefore, not obvious. There is a need to provide teachers with some empowerment in this respect, taking charge of their own training, which may come alongside the introduction of e-learning.
How successful has the programme been in boosting head teachers' ability to manage schools using key	The intention of the programme is to lead the head teachers to a more collegiate and participatory style of management, involving parents and teachers. There is a certain amount of evidence that management is

## MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME

### Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq

modalities of school-based management?	improving whenever the new methods are introduced (as reported from Baghdad area schools).
How successful has the programme been in boosting DoE representatives' ability to plan, advocate and problem-solve in more data-driven, evidence-based ways?	This has not occurred since the data elements of the programme (EMIS) have not been implemented.
What is the level of fidelity to core programme elements among those trained – that is, how effectively have interventions been implemented by trainees?	This is difficult to assess given the limited access to direct observation of training. Moreover, with many of the staff trained coming from very weak education backgrounds, training had a measureable impact but could benefit from consolidation. Methods for distance assessment of teachers (by video, automated record-keeping) could also be explored. Going forward, measuring the programmes impact on the child is an essential indicator, though the conditions of the evaluation made this difficult to measure at present.
How successful has the programme been in helping remove barriers to access, not least of all for girls and other underserved populations?	This question rests on a belief that there are major barriers to girls at the basic education level, although the evaluation found few institutional obstacles. There are currently no specific components within the programme dedicated to addressing barriers to access to education for girls and other underserved populations. Indeed the programme would benefit from more attention to vulnerable groups which also include, for example, orphans.
What unintended outcomes, positive as well as negative, have resulted from the program?	Certain procedures have become more difficult, especially vertical fiscal transactions, involving the central MoE. Further awareness and focus on adaptation at central /KRG ministry level is required to underpin changes at the school level.
How successful has the programme been in boosting parental and community participation support for, and engagement in, developing basic education?	To date, the programme has been unable to make a significant improvement in engaging parents and the larger community in developing basic education, as there is no embedded mechanism for this. As this is an entirely new concept, which goes counter to the use of standardized curriculum, involvement of communities in developing basic education should be de-prioritized.
<b>Relevance/Appropriateness</b>	
How closely linked are the specific interventions chosen with the full scope and scale of beneficiaries' needs in Iraq, both generally and in terms of its status as a post-conflict setting?	CFS is not intended to handle national issues of this magnitude, and the indirect impacts of a better-educated society, as a result of the intended improvement of the quality of basic education will only be observed in the decades ahead.
How closely aligned is the basic education programme with relevant planning and policy frameworks of the MoE and international conventions, treaties and other agreements to which it is a party?	The basic education programme is closely aligned with all relevant international and national education strategic investments, including the INES, national education plan, and programs such as the I-PSM.
How closely aligned are the interventions with the social, economic, political and security priorities of Iraq as it transits into development?	As far as key government priorities focus on improving the quality of education as a medium to social, economic and political development, underpinning peace and stability, the programme is well aligned such national objectives.
How appropriate have been the UNICEF common principles (e.g. Convention on the Rights of the Child,	They are appropriate and have a significant value addition to all UNICEF activities in Iraq, including the basic education programme.

## MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME

### Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq

the Core Commitments for Children in Emergencies, etc.) promoted through the programme in light of local conditions and needs?	
<b>Coherence</b>	
To what extent have UNICEF and its partners identified and deployed appropriate programmatic elements that are most likely to improve the quality of basic education, access to it, and participation in it for all children?	Apart from a lack of concentration on core curriculum subjects, identification and deployment of programmatic elements is satisfactory overall.
What core programmatic elements are missing, and are these being addressed by other actors and programs, or are there outstanding gaps not being met at all?	The programme needs to be pared down to a more defined set of activities that add sustainable value to quality education to be modelled, piloted and expanded. If this happens, and the focus shifts towards deepening the institutionalization of CFS, and links are made to SBM, then we see the need to deepen communication through formal and informal channels, deepen community socialization and increase financing for school improvement plans.
How clearly are the programme's objectives, and the means to achieving them, understood by key stakeholders?	Some knowledge of the programme has been evidenced in the course of the evaluation, although widespread misunderstanding persists, in terms of the very objectives of the programme and the notion of 'child-friendly schools'. There is little awareness of the fact that CFS is part of a larger program. Teachers in schools, which are not covered by the program, did not generally know about the program. Even teachers in the programme are aware only of the 'local' goals of the programme inasmuch as they affect them. More effort is needed to explain the concepts of CFS and SBM to school administrations. In addition, it is recommended that future efforts focus on improving the meaningful participation of learners. Children should be made aware, as appropriate to their levels, that CFS schools are different and that they can express their opinions and make suggestions.  It is further suggested that Both MOE and UNICEF mainstream the MDGs and existing indicators as related to basic education
How comprehensive are the programs chosen as a necessary and sufficient suite of interventions to contribute to a high-quality basic education system, and increase access and attendance for all children?	The three level objective structure works well, though once support for EMIS and ALP are right-sized, the programme will take on a more unified feel. Currently the programme is overly complex and integration of many activities is difficult to sequence and priorities. Certain interventions, particularly short training courses, imperfect coverage from school to school and small financial grants, have had a limited but inconsistent impact on the overall improvement of the quality of basic education and learner attendance.
<b>Efficiency</b>	
How effectively has UNICEF used the resources dedicated to the programme to deliver high-quality outputs in a timely fashion, and to achieve targeted objectives?	Measures of efficiency can only be established on the basis of Cost Benefit Analysis, meaning that an efficient programme has a lower cost to benefit ratio. Currently, a little over Euro 5.5 million has been disbursed, against a budget of Euro 17 million (Circa 32 %) and the majority of this been spent on establishing the programme and developing enabling investments. For this commitment, introducing a new approach to school based management and improved quality, and with benefits already beginning to show, at the moment the benefits probably match

## MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME

### Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq

	<p>the costs. Once the programme consolidates and expands, and the approach becomes institutionalized, it would be safe to assume that the benefits could be considerably greater. Social cost benefit analysis would need to be conducted.</p>
<p>How cost-effective has each intervention been in achieving targeted objectives?</p>	<p>In the absence of a clear baseline, and without clear unit costs established, it is difficult to assess cost-effectiveness at this stage of project development. What is clear is that a number of areas of support such as EMIS, ALP and investment planning have been ineffective in meeting their goals, for reasons explored in the report. Corrective measures are required, as proposed. In other areas such as CFS, given early progress, and given a no-cost extension of 12 months, many targets will undoubtedly be met (such as school improvement plans etc.).</p>
<p>How successfully has UNICEF coordinated with other key actors (e.g. implementation partners, MOE and other line ministries, other entities conducting complementary interventions) to ensure non-duplication of efforts, a clear delineation of roles and responsibilities within joint programs, and the overall success of the program's implementation?</p>	<p>This is a very complex programme with many stakeholders, making effective coordination quite challenging. That said, after delays in start up, UNICEF has been very active in coordinating with other key actors, although in future, a greater focus on field level (school level) coordination and on impact and quality would benefit the program. There is no evidence that duplication of efforts exists, and this is in effect a government driven program, but greater coordination with the I-PSM around administrative, civil service, public finance and SBM related reforms is both urgent and warranted.</p>
<b>Connectedness</b>	
<p>How effectively has UNICEF coordinated with other key actors to ensure that further building blocks of child learning, that lie outside the scope of the present programme (e.g., nutrition, psychosocial, etc.), are in place to enhance children's attendance and readiness for learning prospects?</p>	<p>There have been no indications that UNICEF has failed to effectively collaborate with partners on these issues. UNICEF itself automatically covers many of these sectors and, naturally, takes them into consideration.</p>
<b>Sustainability</b>	
<p>Overall, how successful has the programme been in increasing on-the-ground capacity to deliver and maintain high-quality basic education in the longer term?</p>	<p>Establishing the pillars of high-quality education and sustainable quality teaching and learning in the sector is an ambitious task. The programme to date has definitely had a significant value addition to increasing management and quality education delivery capacities at the school level. Despite setbacks and the improvements required in certain areas as discussed above, in the longer term, the programme has the potential to make a tangible difference in Iraq's basic education.</p>

## B. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND BACKGROUND

## OVERALL PROJECT OBJECTIVE

7. *The overall objective of the programme is to improve access to quality education in Iraq, especially for girls, through increased capacity of the government to ensure that policy development, technical support, and institutional strengthening is carried out at the national, governorate, and local levels.* Three specific sub-objectives support the attainment of the wider project goal, as outlined below:

- **Specific Objective One:** To support the revision of existing government policies and development of new policies and initiatives that will improve the quality of the Iraqi education system at primary level.
- **Specific Objective Two:** To build the capacity of the government to implement the new policies and initiatives at all levels: central, directorate, district, community, and school.
- **Specific Objective Three:** To mobilize community support for improved retention and increased enrolment of out of schoolgirls and boys.

8. *The specific project level objectives of stated above are expected to be achieved through the implementation of activities reflected in the EU Action Fiche, grouped in three distinct components:* Specific objective one is to be achieved by a set of activities that focus on support to the MoE and related government of Iraq partners in the revision of existing government policies and the development of new strategies that will help improve the quality of the Iraqi education system at primary level. Specific objective two is to be achieved by a set of activities focusing on building government capacity to implement the new policies at central, district, community, and school level. Specific objective three is to be achieved by activities that focus on social mobilization and behavioural change.

## OVERALL EVALUATION OBJECTIVE

9. *The objective of this evaluation is to determine, as systematically and objectively as possible, the relevance, appropriateness and coherence of the EU sponsored programme to “Improve access to quality basic education in Iraq, especially for girls”;* the efficiency (referring to carrying out activities on time and within the budgeted cost) with which project activities have been delivered and their respective outputs realized, their connectedness to those produced by other actors; the effectiveness (referring to quality of outputs) of the programme in relation to its objectives; and the program’s sustainability. The evaluation will explicitly identify those factors affecting the programme on these criteria (of relevance, appropriateness, coherence, efficiency, connectedness, effectiveness as mentioned above), including those factors in UNICEF Iraq office’s operating context outside of its control, and those within its control.

## EXPECTED PROJECT RESULTS

10. *Three core objectives have been set under the program, with clear expected results at each level.*

### Objective 1: Policy Development and Revision

- Curriculum for basic education revised and in line with global standards and including critical components (life skills based education; hygiene promotion; psychosocial; and Mine Risk Education (MRE).
- Standards/policies reflecting equity for gender and child friendly schools endorsed, being implemented, and monitored by the GoI;
- Coherent and sound multi-year school investment and procurement plans endorsed and adopted;
- ALP (Accelerated Learning Program) curriculum revised; and,

- PTA (Parent Teacher Association) strategy developed and endorsed.

**Objective 2: Capacity Building**

- MoE's capacity to plan, budget and monitor strengthened through a functioning Education Management Information System (EMIS);
- Master trainers and teachers use child friendly teaching methodologies as well as effectively apply the new components of curriculum;
- Principals, DoE staff, and school supervisors have better understanding and use 'best practices' in the management of schools and the importance of community involvement;
- 1,200 schools (200 by UNICEF and 1,000 by GoI –inclusive of 300 ALP) equipped with necessary furniture and equipment for resource centres;
- Teachers trained on performance standards; and,
- Resource centres developed.

**Specific Objective 3: Social Mobilization**

- 1,200 communities organise effective social mobilisation activities focused on girls' education, contributing towards child friendly education and improved learning conditions;
- Improved school health and hygiene practices are practiced in 1,200 CFS (Child-Friendly) schools;
- PTAs in 1,200 schools are actively contributing towards child friendly standards in schools;
- Child friendly standards are met in 1,200 schools and 600,000 children benefiting from a child friendly learning environment and child friendly teaching and learning methods

**MAIN EVALUATION ISSUES**

11. *In keeping with the evaluation objective the evaluation has focused on standard evaluation questions* in relation to (A) relevance and appropriateness (B) coherence (C) coverage (D) effectiveness (E) efficiency (F) connectedness and (G) sustainability.

**A. Relevance/Appropriateness**

- How closely aligned is the basic education programme with relevant planning and policy frameworks of the MoE and international conventions, treaties and other agreements to which it is a party?
- How closely linked are the specific interventions chosen with the full scope and scale of beneficiaries' needs in Iraq, both generally and in terms of its status as a post-conflict setting?
- How closely aligned are the interventions with the social, economic, political and security priorities of Iraq as it transits into development?
- How appropriate have been the UNICEF common principles (e.g., Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Core Commitments for Children in Emergencies, etc.) promoted through the programme in light of local conditions and needs?

**B. Coherence**

- How clearly are the program's objectives, and the means to achieving them, understood by key stakeholders?
- How comprehensive are the projects chosen as a necessary and sufficient suite of interventions to contribute to a high-quality basic education system, and increase access and attendance for all children?
- To what extent have UNICEF and its partners identified and deployed the most appropriate programmatic elements that are most likely to improve the quality of basic education, access to it, and participation in it for all children?



- What core programmatic elements are missing, and are these being addressed by other actors and programs, or are there outstanding gaps not being met at all?

**C. Coverage**

- What approximate proportion of relevant (targeted) beneficiary groups has been reached by each intervention?
- To what extent have girls and other targeted subpopulations been reached?
- What proportion of Iraq's schools has received each intervention?
- To what extent have interventions extended beyond core schools to reach all schools in their respective school clusters?

**D. Effectiveness**

- How successful has the programme been in boosting head teachers and teachers' awareness, understanding and knowledge of, and support for, CFS and teachers' capacity for delivering new curriculums in a more action-oriented, child-friendly manner?
- How successful has the programme been in boosting head teachers' ability to manage schools using key modalities of school-based management (SBM)?
- How successful has the programme been in boosting DoE representatives' ability to plan, advocate and problem-solve in more data-driven, evidence-based ways?
- What is the level of fidelity to core programme elements among those trained – that is, how effectively have interventions been implemented by trainees?
- How successful has the programme been in helping remove barriers to access, not least of all for girls and other underserved populations?
- What unintended outcomes, positive as well as negative, have resulted from the project?
- How successful has the programme been in boosting parental and community participation support for, and engagement in, developing basic education?

**E. Efficiency**

- How effectively has UNICEF used the resources dedicated to the programme to deliver high-quality outputs in a timely fashion, and to achieve targeted objectives?
- How cost-effective has each intervention been in achieving targeted objectives?
- How successfully has UNICEF coordinated with other key actors (e.g., implementation partners, MOE and other line ministries, other entities conducting complementary interventions) to ensure non-duplication of efforts, a clear delineation of roles and responsibilities within joint programs, and the overall success of the program's implementation?

**F. Connectedness**

- How effectively has UNICEF coordinated with other key actors to ensure that further building blocks of child learning that lie outside the scope of the present programme (e.g., nutrition, psychosocial, etc.) are in place to enhance children's attendance and readiness for learning prospects?

**G. Sustainability**

- Overall, how successful has the programme been in increasing on-the-ground capacity to deliver and maintain high-quality basic education in the longer term?
- What if any gaps to longer-term sustainability remain?
- What key internal and external factors have influenced UNICEF's ability to meet the key objectives targeted by the program? Or what are the prospects that UNICEF can meet the remaining objectives?

## C. CONCLUSIONS

## GENERAL PROJECT DELIVERY ENVIRONMENT:

12. *Since 2003, many reform and modernization projects in Iraq have failed to meet their expected outcomes; largely as a result of the weak enabling environment for reform caused by political and security problems.* Further, the existence of a very centralised administrative and fiscal system, which is focused on delivering 'quantity' not 'quality', makes the introduction of quality metrics fairly new in the Iraq context. In addition, the senior civil service cadre has not seen many alternative modes of educational development.

13. *Critical to drawing conclusions therefore, given the central role that the Ministry of Education plays in most of the activities, is understanding the context within which the programme is being implemented, reforms institutionalized and quality reform measures introduced.* Key considerations in drawing conclusions therefore include:

- **Overall Policy Development Context:** The Ministry of Education does not have a policy unit, or a national education policy, and the sector is driven by sector planning which is highly centralised and often quantity and not quality based. The 2012 National Education Strategy goes a long way towards outlining sector development needs, yet the strategy has no focus on change management, decentralisation, administrative, civil service or public finance management reforms all of which are central to improved quality;
- **Overall Sector Governance Context:** The drive to increase access to education has meant a focus on increasing teacher numbers, building schools and improving learner to teacher ratios. With the number of teachers more than tripling, and with lack on in-service or teacher training arrangements a structural constraint, sector wide progress in driving quality requires significant investment in human resource and the overall performance incentive environment;
- **Overall School Based Management Context:** Government has long attempted School governance and PTA reforms in Iraq,, with limited success. Parental involvement in school management has historically been limited, and despite various efforts, lack of public policy dialogue, communication and socialization means that this project has to overcome a legacy of weak school governance in general. Moreover, as most head teachers, children and parents have limited to zero experience outside Iraq, there is no clear benchmark for quality education.
- **Overall Incentive Framework:** A major problem within the Ministry of Education, at national, regional, provincial, district and school levels is weak performance management and incentive framework practices.
- **Planning and Budget Management Context:** The current education planning and budget formulation practice remains archaic, incremental and poorly integrated. Recurrent costs flow through the Ministry of Finance but capital and investment costs flow through the Ministry of Planning and directly to the provinces through subventions. As a result, setting provincial investment and procurement plans requires consolidation and simplification, if such plans are to be implemented.
- **Complexity:** The project design is extremely complex, and with activities cutting across policy, planning, budgeting, execution and oversight functions, the project effectively needs to deal with five layers of delivery (central, regional, provincial, district and schools) and more than 70 decision-making units, given the current management framework.

## OBJECTIVE 1: POLICY SUPPORT

14. **Objective 1 aims to ‘support the revision of existing government policies and development of new policies and initiatives that will improve the quality of Iraqi education.’** Given the complex environment for policy formulation, strategy development and development of regulatory standards, it is clear that many of the activities necessary to meet Objective 1 will take quite some time to develop, socialize and formally adopt. There are a large number of stakeholders under the program, calling for strong coordination.<sup>1</sup> The National Education Strategy for example, supported by UNESCO, UNICEF and the World Bank, took more than 5 years. However, despite this context, in many areas considerable progress has already been made, providing a foundation for further consolidation.

15. **The evaluation team concludes that given that the programme commenced only recently, it is largely premature to fully analyse results achieved towards Objective 1.** Finalisation of results and recommendations produced through the various action research activities in the field is a prerequisite for further policy development.<sup>2</sup> Key activities under Objective 1, and the broad conclusions reached through field based evaluation are provided below:

- Activity 1.1: Policies and standards for child friendly schools developed;
- Activity 1.2: PTA tools and guidelines developed;
- Activity 1.3: Gender issues main-streamed;
- Activity 1.4/5: Curriculum revision supported; and,
- Activity 1.6: Multi-year investment and procurement planning undertaken.

### **Activity 1.1: Policies and Standards for Child Friendly Schools Developed**

16. **Significant progress has been achieved to date under Activity 1.1.** There is little doubt that the introduction of Child Friendly School (CFS) has stimulated a much wider appreciation of the importance of the school as the basic unit to provide quality education. Key activities include (i) developing a framework for implementing CFS (ii) drafting CFS criteria and (iii) establishing a national Core Group for CFS representing all 18 governorates. In the recent Iraq Public Sector Modernization (I-PSM) Phase II inception Phase, meetings with the Ministerial Advisory Commission (MAC) and Prime Minister’s Advisory Commission (PMAC) used the CFS approach as a way to understand the transition towards School Based Management (SBM). Given the lack of experience in Iraq with alternative approaches the CFS pilot has allowed a new model to begin to emerge that should one day impact the entire primary school system. The table below provides an outlined of local government and provincial directorate contributions and Annex 3 provides standards for CFS developed for Kurdistan.

17. **The policies and standards already developed for CFS are a significant step forward in their own right.** However, what is required, at present, is further dissemination and field-testing in the form of action-research, which can then be reflected into final policy and standard documents. The development must be iterative, and involve significant buy-in within the Ministry and the schools themselves, demanding not only formal adoption but also implementation. The old PTA guidelines, issued but badly implemented, serve to remind us of the risks of not assimilating new approaches to guarantee adoption. Given the planned timeframe for the project (to conclude at the end of 2013), a

<sup>1</sup> Stakeholders include: Ministry of Education Officials at Federal, Regional and Governorate levels, National NGOs, UN Agencies, Private Contractors, Iraqi Teacher Training Institutions (ITTI’s), 24 DoE staff trained (EMIS), 72 master trainers (in-service), 72 master trainers (new curriculum components), 1,200 Head-teachers; 6,000 Teachers; 1,200 School Supervisors (in-service), 1,200 Head-teachers and 6,000 Teachers (new curriculum components), 70 ALP master trainers, 600 ALP teachers and 2,000 PTA leaders.

<sup>2</sup> The scope of curriculum revision (for example) under this programme is mainly focused on extra-curricular education, such as MRE, ALP and Life Skills, including psychosocial support and hygiene education.

no-cost extension would appear justified to make sure that policy and strategy work is more deeply institutionalized, with implications for long-term reform adoption and sustainment.

18. **Field results however demonstrated that training has been uneven across schools.** In certain schools the full cadre participated in training (some twice), while in others participation was limited to headmasters and a selected number of teachers. Both teachers and parents, nevertheless, welcome the positive impact of PTA training on the cooperation between parents and teachers for the benefit of learners. This is despite the fact that few parents are currently involved in the training.<sup>3</sup>

**Table 2: Contributions of the Local Government within the CFS Program**

**The contributions that can be made by local governments:**

- Support the project with financial allocation to complete the infrastructure of child-friendly schools i.e. ;( school building – Rehabilitation- adding new venues).
- Follow-up and monitoring after having the faith in the idea of the child-friendly schools by; municipal councils - provincial councils- and the conservatives.
- Provide financial and material capabilities for Training and Development for; Department of Human Resources - Directorate of municipalities in the provinces - Center for Training and Development - Governorate – through cooperation in capacity building with the international and local, the provincial councils.
- Law enforcement, especially the law of Compulsory Education to reduce the lack in enrollment through the efforts of the High Commissions in the province and administrative units.
- Enhance the communication of the project through local media, field visits and the statements of conservatives to support the project with letters of acknowledgment and graduates.

**Contributions of the DoEs to the CFS Program:**

- Government provides all the facilities necessary for the success of the experience of the Child-Friendly schools such as providing education and training rooms for teachers, staff working in the project, and covered all the training.
- The allocation of four thousand dollars for each school building for the purpose of rehabilitation, which will lead to improving the situation of schools covered by the project, similar to other schools.
- Allocation half million dollars for each of the Ministry acted in accordance with requirements agreed between the Ministry of Planning and Development Cooperation and the Development Assistance Framework for the United Nations in Iraq UNDAF.
- Expand the authorities of the general managers in the exchange of five million dinars to fifty million dinars, which will reflect positively on the reality of all schools, including schools, child-friendly.

**Activity 1.2: PTA tools and Guidelines Developed**

19. **PTA tools and guidelines were not always found in schools, or mentioned, though they have been developed.** PTA tools include (i) laying out roles and responsibilities (ii) school self assessment tools (iii) School Improvement Plans and (iv) accountability and transparency procedures. Their development and distribution at the school level requires further attention and necessarily requires formal distribution by the MoE, to make sure adoption is guaranteed. Given the historic failure to empower parents to take a more active role in education, guidelines will need intensive and proactive dissemination (as well as media priming) in the months ahead. UNICEF can call upon.<sup>4</sup>

<sup>3</sup> As discussed in the preceding sections, school management is still generally perceived as a centrally managed function and most MoE staff interviewed have significant reservations about the capacity of schools to govern themselves. While progress is evident in certain areas, the MoE appears hesitant about devolving authority to school principals or committees although it is clear that the CFS approach goes a long way to changing perceptions of school based management issues. Under the I-PSM program, SBM is to be formalized through a national guideline and the experience of piloting CFS currently provides the only in-country example of an alternative development approach.

<sup>4</sup> An essential part of any longer term SBM approach is the central role played by Parent-Teacher Associations. In Iraq the PTA model, although present for some time now, is widely reported as underactive. PTAs face practical difficulty in being involved in the programme as relevant laws have not been amended and the MoE does not have a section devoted to their

### Activity 1.3: Gender Issues Mainstreamed

20. **Despite prioritisation of gender matters in the project plan, gender imbalance is not found to be a major problem at the primary school level according to Ministry of Education staff, teachers and parents consulted.** Activities however conducted under the programme include (i) advocacy in selected schools for equal participation in school activities (ii) support provided for the formation of mother-support groups (iii) advocacy for women’s participation in project-supported events and (iv) gender-disaggregation of baseline data collected from all selected schools. There is no statistically significant distinction between female and male attendance in schools and the dropout rate of female pupils is on average 4% less than male. UNICEF’s efforts should therefore focus on the upper primary level, which records higher dropout rates for girls in some geographical areas. A school in Basra reported that girls are forced to leave school due to early marriage or family circumstances (such as parents’ divorce); some parents are said to believe that basic literacy is sufficient for girls. These considerations reflect the need for substantial society-wide changes of attitude to the role of parents and civil society in education. It is important to emphasise that this is not just ‘government’s business’.

### Activity 1.4 and 5: Curriculum Revision Supported

21. **The team has been unable to assess the level of curriculum revision, which is typically a lengthy process, and for the purpose of the programme concerns ‘peripheral’, as opposed to ‘core’ curriculum.** Activities undertaken include (i) establishment of a curriculum review committee (ii) the incorporation of MRE messages into textbooks in KRG (iii) psycho-social support incorporated into teacher training manual for ALP and primary education and (iv) Life Skills Education incorporated into ALP curriculum. However, the mechanism for monitoring curriculum change, particularly in the context of major changes introduced in KRG, requires further clarity and development and such changes necessarily require long lead-in and execution times.

### Activity 1.6: Multi-year investment and procurement planning undertaken

22. **Activity 1.6 has not commenced yet.** The table below presents broad parameters essential to investment budget planning, highlighting that the average expenditure for non-tertiary learners/pupils has increased from US\$ 201.27 in 2005 to US\$ 252.73 in 2011 (Est.), with the number of teachers increasing from 336,592 to 566,164 over the same period. The numbers of primary education pupils has increased from 4,430,267 in 2005 to an estimated 5,936,981, and secondary pupils from 1,751,164 to 2,346,727 over the same period, showing that the learner public servant ratio has decreased from 18 in 2005 to 15 in 2011. While these figures are estimates based on available information within MoF and MoE, there is sufficient information to conduct investment planning at the provincial level to project out costs, and link these to procurement plans.

Table 3: Estimates of Learners and Non-Tertiary Public Servants		2005	2006 Est.	2007 Est.	2008 Est.	2009 Est.	2010 Est.	2011 Est.
No. Learners (primary, secondary and tertiary)		6,181,431	6,490,503	6,815,028	7,155,779	7,513,568	7,889,246	8,283,709
Primary education, pupils		4,430,267	4,651,780	4,884,369	5,128,588	5,385,017	5,654,268	5,936,981
Secondary education, pupils		1,751,164	1,838,722	1,930,658	2,027,191	2,128,551	2,234,978	2,346,727
Cost per Non-Tertiary learner (US\$)		201.27	199.28	199.13	219.40	198.75	173.00	52.73
Number of non-Tertiary Public Servants (MoE)		336,592	494,594	514,644	551,089	551,089	556,164	566,164
Learner/non-Tertiary Public Servant Ratio		18	13	13	13	14	14	15

development. As reported by IRC, the MoE has been unwilling to devolve power or government allocated resources to PTAs, and has left these associations largely without oversight.

23. **According to UNICEF, lack of demographic data and EMIS have undermined the ability to undertake investment and procurement planning, and this activity is envisaged to be linked to the I-PSM program, where the decentralised service delivery model will be implemented.** However, as outlined in the field work and through the I-PSM, it is both possible and desirable to develop service delivery baselines for demographic trends by administrative units, map them to a bottom up Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and to set capital investment plans at the provincial level to guide future public spending. This activity can proceed, and can be strengthened in due course, using public finance management and budget planning as entry points. A detailed TOR would need to be developed as the level of detail provided in the project document and logical framework are insufficient. Such activities can be costly, not because of the time to develop the MTEF, but because of the need to resolve budget planning constraints in a consensual manner with various budget holders.<sup>5</sup> MoE Budgeting mandates, essential to this support, would include:

Table 4: Stakeholders Central to Developing Provincial Investment Plans	
State Function	Mandate
MoE/Ministers Office	Budgets according to MoF Budget Call Circular Instructions.
MoF	Releases Recurrent Call Circular, Aggregate Estimates, CoM and CoR Approval.
MoPDC	Releases the Capital Call Circular, Aggregates Estimates, and Submits to MoF.
DM for Scientific Affairs	Prepares DM Functional Budget Submissions.
DM for Administrative Affairs	Prepares DM Functional Budget Submissions.
DM for Technical Affairs	Prepares DM Functional Budget Submissions.
DG for General Education	Aggregates primary, secondary, literacy, supervision and kindergarten budgets.
DG for Educational Planning	Relates planning targets to budget allocations and allotments.
DG for School Building	Oversees preparation of school building budget requirements.
DGs (Central)	Budget DG annual activity plans.
DGs (Provincial)	Support MoE and Provincial Councils in recurrent and capital submissions.
Contracts Department	Aligns procurement plan with budget plan.
MoMPW	Allocations Land for school construction
Provincial Councils	Submit capital budgets estimates to MoPDC.

## OBJECTIVE 2: CAPACITY BUILDING

24. **Objective Two aims to ‘build the capacity of the government to implement the new policies and initiatives at all levels: central, directorate, district, community, and school’.** In this regard, it is important to note that while a Euro 17 million project is a significant investment, with a budget exceeding multiple billions of US\$, the project is in fact a very small investment aimed at bringing meaningful structural change. Moreover, capacity building programs are most successful where a strong incentive framework is established, and where performance is rewarded. Neither exist in Iraq, and yet some progress has been made under this objective, through a no-cost extension will be required if the full range of activities envisaged are to meet their objectives. Key activities under Objective 2, and the broad conclusions reached through field based evaluation are provided below:

- Activity 2.1: EMIS development and training;
- Activity 2.2: Teacher Training Capacity Gaps Reviewed;
- Activity 2.3/4: In-Service Teacher Training Conducted
- Activity 2.5: ALP Teachers Trained;
- Activity 2.6/8: Essential teaching/learning materials procured for primary schools and ALP;

<sup>5</sup> According to the INES, in the primary stage there is a deficit of (4476) buildings in the centre and region, and there are double shifts in (3963) buildings, and triple shifts in (424) buildings in the centre and region, in addition to (1097) clay schools and (2441) unfit schools, as well as (6639) buildings in need of restoration. Whereas, in secondary education there is a deficit of (2415) buildings in Iraq, and there are double shifts in (1214) buildings, and triple shifts in (140) buildings. Moreover, there are (313) unfit buildings, and (1547) buildings in need of restoration, in addition to (10) clay schools in the centre so far.

- Activity 2.7: Libraries and Resource Rooms Established; and,
- Activity 2.9: Government staff, school management/teachers trained on engaging PTAs.

### **Activity 2.1: Education Management Information System (EMIS)**

25. ***The development of the EMIS in Iraq has had a long and complicated past, and this support is pending because the extensive nature of assistance required to make the EMIS operational, is in all honesty beyond the scope of this support.*** Like the US\$ 550 million Iraq Financial Management Information System (IFMIS) supported by the US Government, unless internal governance processes demand evidence based information to drive policy development, information systems are not used. The EMIS (substantially supported by UNESCO over the years) remains largely inoperable, and the costs of making it functional would be in the tens or hundreds of millions. Moreover, there has not been a census to provide baseline data in recent years, and as shown by the National Education Strategy the education system is not yet driven by evidence. Moreover, the last census completed in Iraq took place in 1997. Current data, therefore, does not factor major internal and external displacements, amongst other issues. However, due to increased focus on decentralisation in the past years, information available at the lower levels of the system, and certainly in the schools, is well handled manually and, occasionally, electronically. The evaluation team believes that this activity should be dropped, and monies used to finance enabling reforms at the provincial level, which are critical to improved access to quality education.

26. ***UNICEF regards information management as a key area of focus.*** The National Strategy document confirms, '[the Ministries] lack integrated and advanced information systems that may be a sound source of data and information'. Currently, the statistics departments in both ministries are used for the provision and processing of data.

*At the Central level (MoE Baghdad), the USAID is funding a programme to establish a fully functional EMIS at national level in about eight to ten months time.*

27. ***It has been proposed to introduce an Education Management Information System (EMIS) but this has not yet been implemented.*** One of the reasons is that there has not been a recent census to provide baseline data.

*In KRG the MoE has hired a US based company (Rand) to establish EMIS for KRG and the programme is expected to be completed in eight months.*

The last census completed in Iraq took place in 1997.

Current data, therefore, does not factor major internal and external displacements, amongst other issues. However, due to increased focus on decentralization in the past years, information available at the lower levels of the system, and certainly in the schools, is well handled manually and, occasionally, electronically. There is also little proof that an EMIS would have a significant immediate impact on improving the child-friendly school environment in Iraq. Alternative customized statistical packages are available and it would take a tiny proportion of the current budget to introduce an effective, if interim, statistical tool.

28. ***At the moment, the most critical piece of census information required is the total population of children of school age.*** At the local level the Echo Bravo method of mapping absence from school conducted by the school children themselves has proved effective. UNICEF has further suggested conducting a diagnostic study to identify bottlenecks, which impede reporting, and has emphasized the need for third party validation and verification. The adoption of a simple tool that monitors attendance and attrition

*'ALP classrooms, teachers, school furniture, teaching aids as well as stationery were provided by the Ministry of Education in addition MoE is printing 50,000 copies of each subject of the ALP textbooks for the new school year, costing over 1 million US dollars*



would have the most value addition to current UNICEF efforts. In the context of child-friendly schools the size of classes and the male/female ratio of pupils are also important and this can be gathered in traditional ways.

### **Activity 2.2: Teacher Training Capacity Gaps Reviewed**

29. **A critical cause of poor teacher teaching capacity is lack of formal opportunity for in-service training and skills upgrading.** While much work remains to be done under this activity, a Thematic Working Group on Teacher Training has been established and a continued professional development plan has been developed for teachers.

30. **It is reported that some of the new content has been incorporated in the existing thematic training packages, instead of designing and conducting separate teacher training on revised curriculum.** For example, *Psychosocial Care* has been incorporated in the CFS teacher-training package. The training material for *Hygiene Promotion* has also been developed, and training is expected to take place in the second half of 2013. The *Thematic Working Group on Teacher Training* has been established, although, due to time constraints, the evaluation team has been unable to verify how frequently this group meets.<sup>6</sup>

### **Activity 2.3: In-service teacher training on improved CF teaching methodologies**

31. **In-service teacher training on improved CF teaching methodologies has commenced, although in a rather conventional way.** Comment has been made earlier on the need to improve the training and to ensure that it is rolled out consistently. Currently, the project has (i) developed a Teacher Training manual in Arabic and Kurdish (ii) trained 3,000 teachers in selected schools on child participatory and child-centred pedagogical approaches and (iii) trained 48 lead trainers to implement cascaded training in 18 Governorates.

### **Activity 2.4: Effective Application of New Curriculum Components**

32. **During the reporting period the programme has focused on establishing continuous professional development for teachers, prior to developing the contents of the training.** It is unclear if teachers trained actually apply new knowledge and skills into practice inside the classrooms.

33. **A number of observations can be made with regard to in-service teacher training, as follows:**

- **Training teachers on the concept and definition of child-friendly schools:** CFS training manuals were not always present on site visits, and the latest figures of teachers trained are not available. A number of teachers interviewed have expressed dissatisfaction with the cascade model applied, and training provided by peers. An outside trainer is preferred. Current impediments to the cascade model need to be addressed, particularly in the absence of a clear standardizing factor, such as a video or detailed manual to ensure that training content is consistent at all levels.
- **Use of visual aids in training:** Incorporation of videos in teacher training has received higher level of satisfaction by teachers, and, in some cases, has promoted use of visual materials in teaching. Further support is required from MoE, in terms of providing visual aids to schools for teaching purposes.

---

<sup>6</sup> On a separate note, assessment should be incorporated in the training component of the programme, particularly in the light of KRG's abolition of an external examination in Primary 6. The National strategy places great emphasis on improving the examination system, and this should be reflected in greater training for teachers on the use of tests and school-based examinations. Echo Bravo, for instance, lists fifteen reasons for testing, most of which aim at improving learners learning experience, and assist teachers with improving planning and performance.

- **Further training requested:** Teachers have requested an extended training package for each subject taught, in order to explore modern teaching techniques and improve the delivery of lessons. The 6 days training received has been considered insufficient;
- **Teaching workload:** By international standards, the teacher–pupil ratio in Iraq is very good. In fact, a detailed examination of the number of teachers on school establishment lists has, more often than not, indicated a healthy number of teachers. Classes are reportedly always covered in the absence of a teacher. However, teachers are generally unwilling to participate in work-related activities outside official school hours. This limits the opportunity for training and quality improvement. This necessitates a concerted effort to make training valuable enough for teachers to attend. Linking training with promotion or salary increments could be considered.

### **Activity 2.5: ALP Teachers Trained**

34. **Progress to date under the ALP has been limited, though about 20 lead trainers have been trained for the ALP programme and 575 new ALP teachers were trained from 13 Directorates of Education; 40% of who were reportedly women.** No information has been made available to the evaluation team on the number of ALP teachers trained, and whether training has included first-time teachers or educators previously engaged in regular schools.

35. **A number of challenges facing ALP have been widely documented in project monitoring reports.** It is claimed that (i) a lack of school buildings in some districts hinders the expansion of some areas (ii) the new law on compulsory education has yet to be activated and there are an increasing number of school drop outs (iii) because ALP is not included in ministerial legal provisions, no government funding has been allocated (iv) a low rate of female enrollment in schools where the accelerator does not exceed the proportion of female enrollment of 26%; though the aim of the project that the percentage of female enrollment to 40% and (v) there are problems with the stability of non-teaching (support) staff in some districts because of non-compliance with instructions issued by the Ministry. Funds allocated to ALP will be under spent and would ideally be allocated to other priorities, to strengthen impact, as outlined in the recommendations.

### **Activity 2.6/8: Essential Teaching/Learning Materials Procured for Primary Schools/ALP**

36. **Responsibility for the procurement of essential ALP teaching and learning materials currently rests with the central MoE. A report of materials supply has not been available at the time of evaluation.** There is a general problem with the Ministry of Education in their support of projects, which relates to the lack of budget allocation (matching funds) and dedicated staff to follow up. Steering Committee members have existing full time positions, and project can often be seen as an additional burden. This problem is not unique to MoE. Currently, the amount budgeted per school for teaching and learning materials is almost insignificant; and only a government allocation can resolve this problem. Further, the EU expressed concern that the ALP is not being provided at the intermediate level, and justification is therefore required to this end.

37. **An ALP usually seeks to solve a particular problem arising from a period of disruption of education.** This is the problem of pupils being overage and/or unsuitably old for the class attended (whether or not there are formal rules about age). These children are potential dropouts and the ALP is regarded as one of the best solutions. Typically an ALP offers an acceleration of two years in one. Such a course especially designed to be short-term (e.g. to prepare pupils for an exam), is also called a ‘bridging course’ (a term also used when there is an abrupt change of langue of instruction, or of curriculum).

38. **Practical implementation of ALP was, however, not evident at observed schools.** ALP textbooks were also unavailable. Discussion and document analysis, nevertheless, suggest a number of constraints, typical in accelerated and bridging programs:

- The MoE fears that ALP learners do not reintegrate at the first available moment into a normal school which has, in effect, singled ALP as a new type of schooling (six years in three, or five years in nine);
- An ALP is an emergency measure or a palliative measure and should naturally fade away; and,
- There is a divergence of opinion on whether ALP should, in its five-year version, cover the full 9 years of basic education (including primary and intermediate levels), or as in KRG, be limited to the first six years.

39. **While UNICEF rightly emphasizes, as with normal schools, the need for, ‘Advocacy with MoE to strengthen the quality of educational delivery to ensure that those enrolled do not drop out due to bad quality’, it should be recognized that ALP is a much more difficult programme to teach and administer than the normal primary school.** In particular, daily classroom times are longer, and lessons are more intensive, with less holidays and free time, which makes ALP somewhat child-unfriendly.

40. **Furthermore, a number of bottlenecks in Iraq’s ALP system need to be addressed, as follows:**

- The lack of school buildings or spare classrooms hinders the expansion of ALPs in certain areas;
- The law of Compulsory Education is not approved by the parliament yet, nor is Accelerated Learning included within the Ministry of Education’s Law or mandate, thereby hindering budget allocations; and,
- Low level of female enrolment, the reasons for which may be purely societal, as female pupils may be regarded as having finished school rather than dropping out.

41. **Given the current state of ALP education in Iraq, it is suggested that further research be undertaken by UNICEF on the quality of learner experience in ALPs, including quality of ALP curriculum.** An ALP approach should also have an exit strategy, which re-integrates children into formal education in a specific area. ALP initiatives may then commence in a new area. The willingness and commitment of the Government to ALP offers an opportunity to advance progress in the area, although ALPs should be subject to uniform basic education regulations and oversight (inspections, tests etc.) as applicable in regular schools.

### **Activity 2.7: Libraries/Resource Rooms Established**

42. **Resource centers (36 have been identified), where observed, were often simply small reading rooms and often used for other purposes.** In the original proposal libraries were to be established, and the EU recently expressed uncertainty as to why this activity had been changed to resource rooms instead. After discussion and clarification in the Steering Committee meeting in Erbil a common understanding was reached that they are all part of the concept of a Teacher Training and Resource Centre, which is more than simply a library. It is noted elsewhere how the concept of library has greatly evolved in recent years.

### **Activity 2.9: Government staff, school management/teachers trained on engaging PTAs**

43. **Given the strategic failure of government to institutionalize the role of PTAs in the current service delivery framework, this activity is absolutely central to strengthening bottom-up accountability and improving public school accountability to civil society (parents/kids).** A total of 4665 teachers, PTA and community members were trained in the second half of 2012, on how to provide support for school development, with a focus on (i) the role and responsibilities of PTAs (ii) development and participatory school improvement plans (iii) transparency and accountability procedures and (iv) maximizing children’s active participation. However, based on the sample survey undertaken, only a small number of teachers were reported to be involved in PTA training.

### OBJECTIVE 3: SOCIAL MOBILIZATION

44. **Objective Three aims 'to mobilize community support for improved retention and increased enrolment of out-of-school girls and boys'.** Key activities under Objective 3, and the broad conclusions reached through field based evaluation are provided below:

- Activity 3.1: Develop and implement social mobilization plans;
- Activity 3.2: School Health and hygiene Promoted; and,
- Activity 3.3: PTA mobilization and communication package developed.

#### **Activity 3.1: Develop and Implement Social Mobilization Campaigns**

45. **So far, Social mobilization campaigns have been undertaken in 130 communities, in relation to school enrolment and making schools child friendly.** Available information on social mobilisation suggests that consolidation of this effort will be required, but obviously social mobilization must be a primary activity of the MoE, not a single project. The key question therefore is whether this activity can be formalized as standard operating procedure for the Ministry as a whole – implying district and provincial level engagement, a communications strategy and increasing involvement on media in education.

#### **Activity 3.2: School Health and Hygiene Promoted**

46. **Given the need to cluster education, water, sanitation and hygiene services around the school unit, to reach MDGs and improve access to services, this activity alone provides a very tangible impact for children.** For all the schools, school improvement plans contains WASH, with rehabilitation of WASH services reportedly on-going in 70% of the CFS schools). Observations have indicated that the promotion of school health and hygiene is a major activity at schools, although of the extent to which this was a direct result of the program has been difficult to assess.

#### **Activity 3.3: PTA Mobilisation Communication Package Developed**

47. **This work remains pending but this is particularly urgent given the linkage between communication and socialization.**

## OTHER CORE OBSERVATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

### Quality

48. **While improving the quality of education is central to the program, the general opinion amongst many interviewed beneficiaries is that the current system is either near perfect or 'good enough'.** Quality being a relative concept, the lack of exposure of educators, teachers and learners to other systems undermine a clear assessment of 'quality' education, although relative quality can be assessed by looking at schools not under the project. The focus on improvement is, therefore, limited, and is often considered being beyond a teachers' formal scope of work. This results from lack of exposure to recent modernization efforts, and from the legacy of a historically centralised, top-down decision making education system. As noted by one key informant:

*'However, the key challenge for the ministry of education is represented in the lack of an institutional organization specialized in quality. [...] Quality management is non-existent in the institutional system of the MOE. There is no organizational unit [for quality] at the Ministry (though one is to be created).'*

49. **Focus on higher quality of education service delivery is, however, detailed in the National Strategy and is to be addressed through Ministry Law No. 22 of 2011.** However, given the strong drive since 2003 to increase the number of teachers and to rapidly build schools to fill a massive

infrastructure gap, the focus of government has very much been on quantity first and quality second. While the best way to increase access to education has been the path followed, as the 2012 National Education Strategy makes perfectly clear,

- Establishing quality specialized organization units in the ministry and education directorates throughout Iraq, since quality is not restricted to only one aspect of the educational process, including management;
- Upgrading international quality standards. Preparing and applying quality specifications in the field of education in the light of what is regionally and internationally accredited;
- Increasing the number of specialized staff in the field of quality of examinations and assessment methods; and,
- Conducting quality evaluation tests for schools and rewarding high scorers.

50. ***There are several references to the establishment of a quality assurance function in the Ministry of Education (MoE) and Directorates of Education (DoE);*** progress towards which is further explored in proceeding sections. The major problem however relates to how the metrics of 'quality' are measured, monitored, reported and fed back into policy and planning processes, and as a result setting service delivery baselines is critical to monitoring sector wide quality improvements.

51. ***Overall, the evaluation concludes that the project needs to further emphasise and clarify its value addition to quality basic education in Iraq, in terms of impact on change in children.*** A set of targets and monitoring and evaluation measures need to be established in order to ensure adequate monitoring of progress towards quality-related programme outputs.

### **Over-planning and Over-coordination**

52. ***Contrary to the spirit of School-Based Management (SBM) and decentralization, the evaluation process has indicated a persistent level of over-planning and over-coordination in the project.*** During the inception phase UNICEF, under the United Nations Development Action Framework (UNDAF), and in line with its Country Programme Action Plan (CPAP) 2011-2014, established the Annual Work Plan (AWP). Developed in coordination with MoE, the AWP incorporates activities under the EU cooperation agreement. This assures cohesion, continuity and coordination of all UNICEF activities with the government's own plans.

53. ***However, the simultaneous engagement of a number of stakeholders suggests over-coordination of activities in the education sector of Iraq.*** A Steering Committee has been established as the core Government counterpart in the sector. However, there are a number of other stakeholders including a Child Friendly School (CFS) National Core Group, a Thematic Technical Working Group, and an Education Sub-Priority Working Group (with UNESCO), amongst others.

54. ***UNICEF and British Council (BC) have defined areas of cooperation and programme targeting principles (e.g. school selection) to avoid duplication.*** Generally, it has been agreed that BC is to provide support in developing the contents of the improved teaching methodology for in-service teacher training, while UNICEF is to focus on establishing mechanisms at the national, sub-national and school level for the decentralised teacher training system. Coordination between BC and UNICEF currently takes the form of numerous joint meetings; although the evaluation team has been unable to establish their actual value addition to achieving programme results, particularly with regard to impact on the child. UNICEF reported that "The entire Teacher Training is supposed to be coordinated with Teacher Training Institutions; a working group on teachers' training was formed during early 2011. However, due to high staff turnover within the TTI no formal meetings of Teachers' Training group have been convened.

### Policy Coordination

55. ***The Education component of UNICEF CPAP 2011-2014 is in line with the National Development Plan (NDP), with an overarching strategy of Child Friendly and Inclusive education.*** The strategy focuses on equality of education, school readiness for young children, completion from primary and transition to intermediate level of education, and enabling school autonomy for enhanced local governance through (i) promoting Child Friendly and Inclusive education, and (ii) improving school-based management. There are several relevant sector policies and the programme seems to be in full compliance with them, bearing in mind changing nature of the regulatory environment in Iraq. The National Education Strategy, though repetitive, provides valuable guidance on quality, especially in terms of sector modernisation, in a number of aspects such as examinations for instance.

### Absence, Dropout, Repetition

56. ***The National Strategy focuses on improving the attractiveness of schools, assuming generally that children do want to attend.*** The programme rightly supports this objective and, where implemented, CFS schools indeed appear more appealing to learners, with many observed to be reluctant to leave at the end of the day. However, it must be noted that the shift system and the lack of extracurricular activities limit hours spent within the school. Reported attendance levels vary across observed schools, although it has been difficult to verify numbers at all occasions. Schools reported a relatively low attrition (drop-out and persistent absence rate), estimated at 3 - 5 cases in each school, which is reported to be always subject to follow-up by the PTA.

### Coping with Displacement and Population Movement

57. ***A number of the school observed were coping with displaced children (e.g. from Mosul).*** In some instances displaced children accounted for over 40% of the enrolled learner population, with the school managements clearly committed to absorbing additional attendees (even by circumventing burdensome central MoE reporting) and, at the same time sustaining an attractive and productive academic environment. The success of the programme in this and other aspects, therefore, relies significantly on the commitment of school management and other local stakeholders.

### Non-Programme Schools

58. ***As part of the evaluation, and for the purpose of comparison and objectivity, two schools, which are currently not part of the CFS program, were analysed.*** While the state of school facilities appeared comparatively worse, it was difficult to establish whether this is correlated to the lack of programme coverage or other present factors, including: declining and low-income population, weaker management, ongoing nearby demolition and construction work, etc. Of particular importance to the program, observations suggest that demographic changes and community developments need to be factored in school profiling. This will also address instances in which a mixed school is left largely populated by girls, due to a large, famous boys' school in close proximity.

### Violence

59. ***In all schools visited, lower levels of teacher violence vis-à-vis learners and the establishment of friendlier relationships between educators and learners was highlighted as one of the positive changes brought by the program.*** It is, however, important to establish a baseline definition of violence. An examination of research available indicates that a very wide and vague definition of violence has been used to date by UNICEF and NGOs, which fails to capture all various aspects of aggressive behaviour and exchanges in a typical school.

### Piloting and Coverage

60. ***In addition, UNICEF support to schools is perceived as uneven due to the additional financial and programming attention received by a select number of schools under the CFS program.*** The difference between programme and non-programme inputs is generally misunderstood, which has

highlighted discrepancies between schools who received a financial grant (e.g. to repair the water system), and others who in addition to the financial support also got computers and stationary (e.g. pencils and notebooks).

## OWNERSHIP

61. ***A critical issue for the longer-term success of the programme is ownership by the MoE, provincial directorate generals, school management and civil society.*** Given that making change to the new normal takes considerable time, it is clear that a no-cost extension and cautious re-programming of finances could focus on deepening socialization and communications across key stakeholders. In other areas, where legislation and regulations are required allow the more formal engagement of the Ministry (for example by mobilising dedicated finance and staff), the leadership of the Minister has been and will be crucial.

## CHILD-FRIENDLY SCHOOLS

62. ***Expressions like ‘child-friendly’ are generally met with resistance from experienced teachers as they imply an unfriendly environment prior to the new policies and practices introduced by the Government and UNICEF.*** In addition, interviews have highlighted the resemblance between the programme and sector policies and practices that have theoretically been in place since the 1970s. This has led to questions about the potential of the UNICEF initiative to create permanent change.

63. ***One way to better position the programme amongst beneficiaries is with an emphasis on quality (‘good’), rather than appeal (‘friendly’).*** The term child friendly was born in the idea of ‘child-friendly spaces’ in the immediate reality of an educational emergency. In the context of Iraq’s recovery and restoration it maps onto the idea of a *good* school, with *good* teachers, giving *good* education, with *good* results. These are not just exam results, or promotion to the next school but skills, and social and psychological competences. It follows that child-friendly policies and actions are the best in the circumstances, and that the aspiration is to make them better.

## Performance Indicators

64. ***The following are suggested performance indicators for the ‘child-friendly schools’ approach:***

- The school has a fully functioning PTA;
- The school has developed a simple School Improvement Plan and has initiated proposals for support from the community, local government, and external agencies;
- The school has developed a plan to improve school management;
- The school has a clear, observable focus on effective learning as well as teaching in school improvement activities, and on promoting the participation of out-of-school children with a focus on girls, children with disabilities and other marginalised groups;
- Groups (or clusters) of schools have been established with a coordinating mechanism for sharing of resources and skills;
- There is clear, observable improvement in learner/teacher attendance and learner performance;
- There is evidence that teachers are applying more active learning approaches; and,
- The teachers have access to a fully functioning Teacher Training and Resource Centre.

65. ***At the same time, while promoting child-friendly academic environments an utmost attention has to be paid at all levels of change,*** including what are considered minor, but nevertheless, progress-impeding issues, namely:

- One of the policies in CFS is not to approve the transfer of teachers from CFS to non-CFS and vice versa. Some teachers find this as a constraint since the number of CFS is limited; and,
- Though some adopt the group approach in lower grades classes, there is no evidence of changes in the teaching techniques.

KEY ELEMENTS OF CFS (EXTRACTED)

SEE ANNEX 3 FOR KURDISTAN NORMS LAUNCHED IN FEBRUARY 2013.

**Learner or child 'friendly':** Focusing on assisting schools to become more effective academically, with improved teaching and more relevant curriculum. Improved school administration and management are essential to the creation of an enabling context for more effective teaching and learning.

**Healthier for children:** Assisting schools to become physically safer and more appropriate places for learning, and 'health promoting' through increased attention to health and nutrition education with school and community. The principles of the Convention, in particular the best interests of the child, the principle of non-discrimination and the right of the child to express opinions in matters affecting them are particularly relevant to this 'lighthouse' school program.

**More inclusive and protective of children's rights:** 'Child-friendly' schools should also be those where attempts are made to expand access and opportunities in education beyond the limits of those who are currently enrolled in schools, especially children with disabilities, out of school children, and other unreached groups.

**More inclusive of parents and community members:** Schools should be actively seeking to encourage and promote parent and community participation. The school should also be an integral part of the community with efforts made to develop the school as a community resource.

Naturally curriculum revision should take account of the CFS.

## SCHOOL-BASED MANAGEMENT

66. ***School Based Management (SBM) is only just being discussed under the I-PSM program, at the MAC and PMAC levels; although it remains to be formalized as an approach to decentralising day-today authority.*** School management is generally perceived as a centrally managed function. School administrations are selected according to the Ministry's instructions. Performance of teachers is under the supervision of special education committees in the MoE. While progress is evident in certain areas, the Ministry appears hesitant about devolving authority to school principals or committees. Inadequate decentralisation of authority is also partially evident in the lack of School Implementation Plans, as implied under the SBM model.

67. ***Schools newly joining the programme also face the problem of lack of financial support at a time when the MoE is expecting school administrations to comply with the requirements of CFS.*** This leads to unauthorised actions such as teachers making personal financial contributions towards covering the cost of cleaning, maintenance and refurbishment of schools especially in poor areas.

68. ***Teachers were found to be aware of the narrow goals of the program, but did not understand the holistic purpose of the program.*** Everyone, however, praised the new continuous communication between teachers and parents, and the head teacher. They were eager for more capacity building to explore modern teaching and administrative techniques. This said, and as with the 'child-friendly schools' concept, the practical execution of the SBM model needs to be showcased via pamphlets and videos demonstrating implementation in actual schools in Iraq. At a different level study visits to countries in the Middle East should be arranged on a regular basis until a fully fledged school is established in each major centre of Iraq.

## DECENTRALISATION

69. ***The principle of decentralization is fundamental to School-Based Management, as it suggests the devolution of decision-making to the school level.*** Large ministries, running national systems, naturally focus on providing a unified service. Therefore, more often than not, government institutions, while reluctantly introducing decentralization measures, fail to adopt the means of carrying them out.



70. ***Previous attempts at decentralization introduced without full commitment and an effort to repeal existing rules and regulations have reportedly stalled rather than improved development in the sector.*** Anecdotal evidence has indicated that there is: (i) certain amount of confusion about what could or could not be decentralized; and, (ii) a great deal of confusion about how it was to be carried out. **Parents and teachers reported often that they ‘were asked to do something, but not given the means to do it.**

71. ***‘Content’ decentralization is of particular interest as education service delivery is a national mandate, with the curriculum, as a result, intrinsically national.*** It is, therefore, not subject to decentralization except in the case of the self-governing region of KRG, where both language and medium of instruction have been changed. At the same time, Life Skills and Mine Risk Education (MRE) curriculum have not been adapted to particular local rural, urban, and displacement factors.

72. ***Overall, decentralisation of decision-making should devolve responsibility to the school level with regard to:*** educational enrichment items (reference book purchase, materials for visual aids, school trips, computer software etc.); sports / entertainment items; hosting visitors, PTA etc.; and, ad-hoc items like purchase of a specific item for a school programme, art and athletic events and attending conferences and seminars. With many of these often provided by the Government and development partners as standardised kits, actual opportunities for exercising decision-making powers at the school level are limited in practice.

### **Pitfalls and Contradictions of Decentralisation**

73. ***In some instances, miscalculated decentralisation of MoE functions to the school level can effectively undermine the overall quality of education service provision.*** The elimination of Primary 6 external exam in KRG, for example, even though teachers were given special exam training, removes a key external monitoring function with potential impact on the quality of primary education in the region.

74. ***Maintenance and refurbishment of school facilities is another function the scope of which is currently unclear to school administrations under the decentralisation framework.*** Under the current system financial resources to schools and DoEs are channelled through the Ministry of Education, with ‘decentralised’ schools struggling to reimburse advanced spending, due to (i) a perceived corruption in school management, and (ii) a pervasive bureaucracy in refunds. In terms of bureaucracy, interviews have suggested that installing a safe is a precondition for receiving larger funding (e.g. 5 million Iraqi Dinar (\$4200) in Abu Graib) from MoE, in addition to long and complicated financial and administrative requirements of significant burden to school management, including:<sup>7</sup>

- Pre-approval of expenditures of up to ID 50 thousand from related director generals;
- Earmarking of funding to predefined expenditures (e.g. electricity, water and sanitation maintenance, etc.); and
- First reimbursement received at ID 2.5 million spent.

75. ***This said, in order to support execution of School Implementation Plans a mechanism needs to be developed whereby DoEs and schools can control the financial resources that underpin these plans.*** The National Strategy commits to (i) undertaking a review of the MoE Law and administrative and financial bylaws; and (ii) enact a new law for financial and administrative control ensuring the streamlining of procedures and guaranteeing impartiality in the application. It accepts that disbursement authorities are characterized by a high degree of centralisation in terms of

---

<sup>7</sup> These have resulted in the reluctance of schools to apply for financing of such volume.

instructions, while the legally permitted funding sources are extremely limited. Technically, this means that schools are not allowed to engage in fund-raising or accept working funds from donors.

**76. *The present reality, therefore, requires measures (e.g. 'one-time' approval) to ease the regulatory environment and schools access to financing.*** UNICEF should work with MoE to review the old policies related to the programme and try to amend them as needed to hasten the change process especially those related to financial independence of schools. The MoE should officially authorise a bookkeeper for each school or group of schools, train them on the required financial requirements and procedures so they can handle the money efficiently. The authorities should also review their inbuilt resistance to devolving spending authority. UNICEF should work with them on that.

## **TEACHER TRAINING AND RESOURCE CENTRES**

**77. *The wording of the original project documents referred to libraries and resource centres. There is a need to clarify these terms and we suggest this be done as follows:***

- Firstly, what the programme needs and is moving towards are TEACHER TRAINING AND RESOURCE CENTRES. These are not new. In some countries they are situated in the Inspectorate, in others near a transport hub, or within a school easily accessible to others. The latter model is the one adopted in Iraq:
  - a. There is a body of knowledge and experience available for TTRC, which is a venerable concept used in many countries; it is not the same as a school library. It is often used to back up distance learning as a centre with reading and reference facilities. It needs to be open when teachers are free, so it cannot follow normal office hours. Special labour rules are needed;
  - b. The word 'resource' refers to reference materials (hard copies, soft copies and online) but also to the provision and making of visual aids. Charts, kits and items for science, language and other subjects can be borrowed;
  - c. TTRC run both regular training courses and one-off courses, which support extra-curricular activities and encourage drop-in by teachers any time they feel the need for help, to consult or to make some teaching materials; and,
  - d. A strong reference culture in the primary school level (including amongst academic staff) needs to emerge, on the back of better equipped libraries and resource centers;
- Secondly, we refer to a LIBRARY, which is also different in 2013 from what people have been used to. It becomes the core of a modern school, and also has to support E-learning albeit at a different level; and,
- Finally, we would suggest the use of a better name as suggested also in the branding of the project. For instance, if the project is called XX, then they become Merkaz XX.

## **LIFE SKILLS**

**78. *A critical role for this programme is to introduce enhanced life skills through improved curriculums, pedagogy and education management.*** In the context of this programme, at least at primary level, life skills are not simply the classical ten psychosocial skills but should be interpreted to include learning skills, reference skills and scientific skills. The education system must also focus on better skills to observe, analyse and reach a conclusion. Consideration should be given to making the hidden curriculum an explicit part of the Life Skills work. The hidden curriculum consists of important things, which are not in the national syllabus; it consists of ideas and opinions which re

possibly not written down in the curriculum itself. In the Equatoria syllabus developed in 1984 for primary schools in Sudan, the following were added after the statement of curriculum aims:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Socialization of the child (i.e. learning how to relate to other people) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Behavior of the child <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Respect for elders <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Intelligent curiosity about the world <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Punctuality <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Respect for hard work, both mental and physical	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Team spirit <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Respect for mother tongue and tradition <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Hygiene (both personal and public) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Tidiness, smartness and a sense of order <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Pride in their own culture and language
--	---

## **PARTICIPATION AND CONTRIBUTION**

79. **Primary and secondary research suggests that there is confusion between ‘contribution’ and ‘participation’ at the school level.** While parents are found to be regular contributors to refurbishment and other operational costs, and assist in the resolution of learner or teacher-related problems; generally, they do not participate in significant decision-making (such as school funds management and appointment or removal of personnel). Yet our evaluation shows that they certainly have opinions, which can be tapped, though roughly half those asked felt that even if they gave an opinion it would not be listened to.

80. **There are, nevertheless, a number of options that could be explored to enhance participatory decision-making and bring Iraq closer to model PTAs established in other countries.**<sup>8</sup> School rules (where available) should be analysed with a focus on identifying entry points for improvement to allow higher PTA engagements in the CFS context. Joint discussions between PTAs and school management could also be encouraged on issues such as adaptation to influx of displaced children.

81. **In certain cases, disproportionate parental financial contribution result in inequality in education service provision between schools in high and lower income areas.** The contrast between PTA support in rich (e.g. Mansoor) and poor areas of Iraq is stark. Interviews have suggested that occasionally donations are made on individual basis, circumventing a PTA, and resulting in preferential treatment of donor’s children. By contrast, lower income families are resistant to the notion of financial contributions, and therefore the higher level of parental engagement assumed under the SBM model.

82. **In terms of learner participation, interviews and observations suggest that participation by children is limited to elections of class leaders and taking over responsibility for cleanliness and decoration.** However it is always useful to have a council elected by the children to meet the head teacher and parents from time to time.

## **OVERCROWDING, SHIFTS AND LENGTH OF SCHOOL DAY**

83. **Where classrooms are often overcrowded - reported at 80 pupils per class in some schools - schools run double and triple shifts.** In some cases, shifts may alternate and are operated under the same school management. In others, both the management and the academic staff vary between shifts. The shift system also makes incidental learning, and pride in ones classroom very difficult.

<sup>8</sup> PTAs in Uganda and South Africa, for example, are effectively the management body of the school where even the recruitment or removal of teachers is subject to parental approval.

84. **More importantly, however, the time Iraqi learners spend in school is very low by world standards.** Even when shifts are run they do not fully occupy the day, and the use of classrooms is at maximum 9 hours per day. Governments are making great efforts to improve school capacity by restoring or building new schools, although this may have a temporary negative and disruptive effect on capacity and learning conditions.

## IT, E-LEARNING AND CHILD-FRIENDLY EDUCATION

85. **While the role of Information Technologies (IT), particularly computers and tablets, as a means and resources in teaching and learning practices is largely recognized,** low usage of such technologies in Iraq schools suggests not only limited resources, but also limited understanding of the potential benefits to improving education service delivery and creating friendlier academic environments. The following key observations have been made:

- School management and staff realize the importance of computer literacy, including effective use of the Internet;
- Tablet computers appear to be widespread among the middle class and the elite at least in urban areas, but an informal survey suggests that they are predominantly used for leisure activities (e.g. social media and games);
- The use of computers for administrative tasks (e.g. statistics, reports) is largely recognized but application of IT technologies provided by UNICEF appears limited to these matters only;
- A strong reference culture in the primary school level (including amongst academic staff) needs to emerge, on the back of better equipped Teacher Training and Resource centers;
- The use of portable computers and the Internet as a useful tool for teacher's lesson preparation and delivery, general oversight, as well as inter-collegial discussions is under-applied;
- A good proportion of teachers interviewed were aware of e-learning even if they did not know the details; they, and administrators, often requested information on what was available. They wanted an electronic teaching package for each subject to assist them to deliver the material in a more efficient way; and,
- Computers can provide access to online courses and teacher training, which along with the use of other technologies (e.g. training videos, materials sharing, electronic books) has the ability to harmonize and standardize the quality of teaching and training in Iraq.

Everywhere children have been introduced to learning by computers they have accepted it easily and naturally. (It is older people who find them difficult) Children enjoy going at their own pace and the fact that the computer does not criticize them; rather it gently encourages them towards the right answer. It has been found that creativity has blossomed on computers when the child is not worried about being 'correct' for the moment.

86. **Taking into account all the above, the CFS programme requires a further focus on the introduction of electronic media (particularly computers and/or tablets) in classrooms.** This has to be paralleled with awareness building campaign and an accelerated effort to place school curriculums online, in order to improve both materials and the learning experience. A study tour to a country that uses some of the latest IT technologies in teaching (such as tablets) would also be valuable, with Egypt or Morocco as potential destinations.

## SCHOOLS FOR GIFTED AND SPECIAL NEEDS

87. **While schools for gifted and special needs currently fall beyond the scope of CFS, it is suggested that these are included among the child friendly schools in the program.** This would require further research and

Shyness is a serious problem at a certain age. Teachers should be trained to handle shyness. Group work, drama and school theatre are amongst common solutions that could be applied in schools.

understanding on the role of child-friendly activities for improving learning, performance and experience in such cases. A learner may be a late developer for a number of reasons, and a child-friendly school can provide the safe environment required to nurture their improvement.

88. ***The notion of gifted pupils should also be revisited in CFS programming and teacher training content.*** A learner may outperform in maths but be partially autistic and lacking social skills. In this particular case, attendance of a regular, rather than 'gifted learners' school may be more beneficial. Further research and analysis is required on this issue.

## **ENRICHMENT / EXTRACURRICULAR ACTIVITIES**

89. ***Most schools observed offer limited facilities that allow for extracurricular activities, such as sport, art, music or science.*** Even large halls in cluster centres do not seem to be used to full capacity. It appears that agriculture (school gardening) has also been cancelled in a number of schools, thus distancing children from rural and productive pursuits.

***A child-friendly school should also have an enriched environment.*** Many schools visited do not showcase artwork or other materials on their walls. Those schools that exploit inside and outside walls with pictures, diagrams and maps, do not regularly updated showcased content, which undermines the important role of accidental and incidental learning. The reported "Six types of basic learning-aid materials developed" are only a small start.

90. ***Positive efforts need to be made to extend education beyond the classroom, engaging both learners and parents.*** Geopolicy suggests the Echo Bravo methods of marking centimetre rules vertically on walls or pillars so children can measure their own height, providing bathroom scales so they can know their weight and the weight of objects, erecting compass sign-posts to show the cardinal points and many others. These are relatively affordable improvements and can all be created and maintained by the children themselves, thus empowering them and giving them a stake in their own education.

## **PERFORMANCE MONITORING**

91. ***The scope and nature of the CFS programme requires regular monitoring at the school level, including teaching performance.*** Education service delivery already has a monitoring system in place in the form of inspections (supervisions), registers, exams and others. The programme should focus on strengthening these existing systems, while differentiating between monitoring programme milestones and programme impacts, such as better learning, changed attitudes, and improved skills.

92. ***Measures taken to increase the number of national education officers is a positive step towards greater oversight, although it is important to adopt a standardised monitoring method such as by video recording.*** Best practices in teachers' performance evaluation via video recording could be borrowed from other contexts. In Chad, for instance, Echo Bravo ©, in partnership with development partners, pioneered mass grading of teachers by video recording of school sessions. Good practice videos were also developed and made available to teachers during training.

93. ***Simple methods of data collection can, therefore, be introduced as part of the program, entrusting monitoring responsibilities to the lower levels of the education system.*** The current prerequisite for higher educational - particularly social science – qualifications of monitoring officers should be eased, allowing the involvement of primary teachers in oversight at the primary school level. Checklists are available that can be administered by anyone, regardless of qualification.

94. *These recommendations have been discussed in detail with the Ministries of Education from Central Government and KRG, UNICEF and the European Union.* However, the conclusions and recommendations reflect the views of the independent evaluators.

## IMPLEMENTING PARTNERS

95. *UNICEF has highlighted the challenge of identifying qualified implementing partners, particularly International and National Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs).* This has proved especially difficult in the south of the country. A partnership agreement has been established with the IRC to implement PTA activities in northern and central governorates, which is the groundwork for the implementing strategy, the CFS initiative.

96. *A similar partnership for the southern governorates is being sought. Three planning workshops for the PTA activation for all the 18 governorates were held with the participation of MoE/DoEs, and plans of actions for the 18 governorates were developed.* The programme has, however, moved forward on the PTA activation without an implementing partner by directly supporting DoEs. The results from the planning workshop for the south are optimistic, in terms of the great enthusiasm received and the existing capacity within DoEs. The programme has also engaged NGO partners at various levels of CFS implementation in order to enhance their capacities.

## VISIBILITY

97. *Programme visibility is observed to be inadequate.* A number of schools within the programme showcase CFS-related images, artwork and slogans. CFS, EU and UNICEF signage outside schools and on educational items is, however, selective and occasional. Where present, branding has often been found on boards inside school compounds, and with limited reference to the school being part of a specific CFS program.

98. *In Baghdad, a number of schools have installed new panels including the school's name and the words 'Child-friendly school'.* Others, however, have reportedly refrained from using the slogan on the pretext of non-approval of the Ministry of Education. This is also indicative of the inadequate 'depth' of decentralisation of Iraq's education service provision, with implications for effective SBM.

## D. RECOMMENDATIONS

99. **The following recommendations are drawn from this evaluation.** While these have been fully discussed with the central and regional Ministries of Education, UNICEF and the European Union, the recommendations remain those of the evaluation team.

**High-level recommendations:**

1. Allow for a greater and more active role of the school management, teachers and parents in the school administration.
2. Conduct ongoing modifications and improvements in the program in line with realities on the ground.
3. There is a compelling justification for a no-cost extension at least up until the end of 2014 (perhaps beyond), given the need to (i) focus on communication and socialization of reforms to make quality-inducing changes stick (ii) allow government greater time to institutionalise the overall ethos and approach.
4. Allow flexibility in the re-allocation of budget items to support the implementation of School Improvement Plans (SIPs) until the government is able to finance these items through the budget process in consultation and coordination between the Ministry of Education and UNICEF at the country and regional levels.
5. We recommend abandoning the non-performing programme elements and re-directing funds earmarked for these items to sustainable activities in the areas specified by the Ministry.
6. Since there are so many external factors affecting the functioning of the program, we recommend that the focus should be on outcomes and impact.
7. Establish better monitoring mechanisms, such as joint monitoring visits to schools, to determine the results and their impact on the child and the school.
8. Adjustments should be made to the ALP program, that the move away from intermediate coverage be documented and justified.
9. Branding and Ownership: We recommend a greater focus on branding and ownership; and,
10. Consider the introduction of incentives, such as tokens, badges and promotions to foster local ownership and make participants proud of being part of the programme.

**Recommendations at the school level:**

11. **School-based management:** we recommend larger involvement of PTAs through school-based management.
12. **Gender:** Efforts in regard to gender should be focussed on primary schools girls drop-out, rather than taking the form of generalised campaigns, given that gender balance is not found to be the most significant problem at the basic education level; and,
13. **Investment Planning:** The investment planning process should not just focus on infrastructure needs, but also on ICT and enrichment needs at the school and classroom level.



**Recommendations about teacher training:**

14. **Teacher Performance Evaluation:** Evaluating the performance of teachers must be through well-developed standards and methods.
15. **Training Evaluation:** Follow-up training results to know about the positive effects.
16. **Quality of training:** We recommend the quality of training to be standardized for its success and effectiveness.
17. **Flexibility:** Greater flexibility should be given to participants in choosing the time and place of the training and to identify training needs and training patterns.
18. **Awareness:** We recommend that greater emphasis is placed on communicating to teachers the importance of their performance and its impact on the child's educational development.

## ANNEXES

## ANNEX 1: METHODOLOGY

***The objective was to assess the effectiveness and efficiency of the Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq programme activities in relation to its stated objectives and results, as well as to generate knowledge and identify good practices and lessons learned.*** The overall approach applied is based on the *OECD/DAC Principles for the Evaluation of Development Assistance*, which are framed around assessment of five key evaluation criteria (i) relevance, (ii) effectiveness, (iii) efficiency, (iv) impact, and (v) sustainability, in addition to (vi) appropriateness, (vii) coherence, (viii) coverage, and (ix) connectedness. Each issue is associated with a number of key evaluation questions that are to be addressed and explored.

***The process aimed to generate, in a systematic and objective manner, information to address a number of evaluation questions identified by UNICEF.*** Particular emphasis was placed on the current programme results and the possibility of achieving all the objectives in the given timeframe, taking into consideration the pace of implementation of activities.

***The evaluation methodology consisted of 4 key components, including:***

- Primary Data Collection – Mixed-Method;
- Primary Data Collection – Interviews or Focus Groups;
- Primary Data Collection – Direct Observation; and,
- Secondary Analysis of Existing Data.

### Limitations\*

***Challenges resulting from time limitations narrowed the envisaged scope and depth of the evaluation, but they have not fundamentally affected the findings and recommendations.*** Of particular note also is the paucity of historic primary data and the resultant reliance of the evaluation team and client counterparts on secondary information and written reports (due to lack of means to engage in inspection visits). However, survey work was undertaken alongside key informant analysis and focus group discussions. In addition, it needs to be recognized that the evaluation is affected by the inability to interview learners privately (i.e. without their teachers being present). This has also affected the ability to explore the ‘change in the child’ issue, although this has been partially offset through interviews with parents.

***The overall evaluation process was constrained by time and access issues.*** In particular, field research took place in time of examinations, with limited opportunities for direct observation of activities. In these circumstances, and in order to achieve greater coverage, the team worked together on the first two days of the assignment and then split to target locations. The Government in partnership with UNICEF selected the schools for the evaluation. Cooperation of school staff and common onsite conditions have allowed for useful observations and the drawing of informed conclusions. The main evaluator’s years of practical educational experience, including time as Head teacher and schools’ inspector was valuable in countering these constraints.

***Key constraints to implementation of evaluation activities included:***

- ***Primary Data Collection – Mixed-Method:*** Undertaking of pre-post quasi-experimental assessments of select interventions being rolled out over the course of the evaluation was not possible;
- ***Primary Data Collection – Interviews or Focus Groups:*** As field research took place in time of examinations, opportunities for direct interview and focus group discussions with teachers, head teachers, parents, and pupils were very limited. In some cases missing groups asked to write memos;

**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

- **Primary Data Collection – Direct Observation:** There was limited possibility for direct observation though it was possible to observe the effects of actions, such as the embellishment of the teachers training hall in a Nabat school. Few tools were observed, but the general impression suggests that the schools run relatively efficiently;
- **Secondary Analysis of Existing Data:** Cost-effectiveness analysis of select interventions, in order to assess the units of programme outcomes yielded for each unit of input within a given intervention was only partly possible.

**Itinerary**

<b>Table 5: Summary of Fieldwork Itinerary</b>	
<b>Erbil (12-17 January 2013)</b>	The team of three met up in Erbil on the first day and finalized the general methodological approach; the focus group and school visit questionnaires and implementation timeframe for the assignment. 2 programme schools and 2 non-programme schools were visited;
<b>Baghdad (14 January 2013)</b>	Schools visited. Meeting in Baghdad between the Evaluation team and the Ministry of Education; Geopolicity was represented by Peter Middlebrook and the national consultants.
<b>Basra (27-31 January 2013)</b>	Visiting 10 schools, attending a meeting at DOE with a focus group and meeting with UNICEF Basra office.

*Note: Visits to Amman were also undertaken as part of the evaluation process.*

\* It must be noted that the present report refrains from making conclusions based only on reported rather than observed information, particularly if information has been reported by only one person, or an interested party.

The evaluation did not explicitly assess the quality of WASH provision, of school infrastructure or address issues of nutrition

The evaluation team was unable to observe the following: (i) Overcrowded classrooms; (ii) Private schools (which would have been useful in order to analyse and compare management practices/capacity); (iii) Schools for special needs; (iv) Disabled children (although single-story schools were generally suitable for access by disabled persons); (v) School for gifted; (vi) Children’s participation; (vii) Classes being taught; (viii) Teaching of Life Skills or Mine Awareness; and, (ix) ALP classes.

Language was a major constraint in KRG, which uses both Arabic and Kurdish and where English is not always fluent, resulting in loss of subtlety and nuance. A Kurdish-English translator was eventually hired by the Consultants to facilitate communication with interviewees.

A remarkable number of documents consulted did not have definitive date of issue, which made it difficult to understand which period the data referred to. Further it was not always clear whether a figure referred only to the reporting period or was cumulative since the start of the project.

Surprise visits, which are an important evaluation tool, were impossible due to security considerations and the consequent need to inform school management prior to arrival on site. This was further complicated by excess reporting on planned activities to UNICEF (consultants were required ‘to keep UNICEF informed at all times of the exact timing, venue and nature of activities undertaken well in advance so that the UNICEF personnel may plan on time and comfortably reach the site of activity’).

Contrary to EU requirements, EU counterparts were not involved in programme evaluation missions, which necessitated remote communication with EU parties. It is to be noted, however, that the EU has engaged another agency, Star Orbit, to monitor progress of the programme.

## ANNEX 2: SELF-ASSESSMENT SURVEY (MOE 200 SCHOOLS)

Ten questions

The person responding (circle): Head teacher; other teacher; Parent member of PTA s (Name not necessary)		
School name: <b>Al Mustafa</b>	Place: <b>Baghdad/ Rasafa 1st</b>	Date: February 2013

General questions		
Please confirm your school is part of the Child Friendly schools programme supported by UNICEF [A reference on being a CFS is added to the name of the school]	Yes	No
Have you had the following		
Supervisor's visits since June last year	Number: 3	
Booklets or manuals about the programme [8 posters from DOE]	Yes	No
Access to Resource centers		
How far to nearest resource centre [Resource centre for the school is not identified yet]	Km	
Is it open any reasonable time you want to use it, e.g. after school?	Yes	No
What do you use it for? (1) Reading (2) Reference (3) Consulting internet (4) I only go there when called for training.		
Which of these trainings have you received? Give the number who attended each one		
PTA IRC (or Ministry): IRC (2 day training for Head teachers, head of PTA and one parent)	1 Male	2 Females
Child friendly schools: Ministry training	Male	12 Females
Computer: [No computers or any office supplies]	Male	Female
What have you received from UNICEF in 2011 and 2012?		
Computers (testing if they realize UNICEF also has other programs)	Yes	No
Books of any kind	Yes	No
Visual materials such as charts, visual aids (e.g. globe?)	Yes	No
What have you had from Government beyond what is normally given to all schools?		
Training: 12 teachers on CFS		
Books, materials: Nothing specific for being a CFS		
Infrastructure help? Nothing specific for being a CFS		
Which of these problems have you faced?		
New financial arrangements?	Yes	No
Effectively involving the parents in decisions not just contributions?	Yes	No
Asked to do something but not given the means to do it?	Yes	No
Name 3 important things that still need to happen? What do you expect in 2013?		
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ending the phenomena of schools with double shifts especially when the 2 schools are of different categories and gender.</li> <li>Supporting the school with computers and other office equipments as well as desks and genitors.</li> <li>Reactivate school nutrition program</li> <li>Activate the role of parents in monitoring the distribution of allocations from school shop to support orphans. The suggestion is for the PTA to buy the needs of the orphans and distribute it instead of handing money to the guardian. This will ensure that all orphans are benefiting from the</li> </ol>		

**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

allocated money since most of the time the money is not enough to cover all orphans at the rate that MOE set which is 50000 ID/Orphan.

5. To review and amend the regulations and resolutions that obligates more responsibilities to master teachers with so little power and independency.

6. There is an urgent need to build the capacity of supervisors on their role in supporting schools.

**Improving the programme**

Do you feel you can help make the <u>programme</u> better?	Yes	No
Do those administering the programme listen to you?	Yes, but not sure if they adopt our ideas	No

Thank you

### ANNEX 3: STANDARDS FOR CHILD FRIENDLY SCHOOLS DEVELOPED FOR KURDISTAN

Indicators	Standards	Fields	#
1.1. All areas of school, and all parts of school building, such as playing yard, ground, rooms, ceilings, walls, doors, and windows are clean.	The building is clean and healthy. All children have access to it. It provides basic needs of learning. It protects children from effects of weather and external and natural hazards.	School Building	1
1.2. The school is established in an accessible and secure place, which is far from the place of collection for garbage and rubbish.			
1.3. A disabled child has access to all sections and departments in the school.			
1.4. All parts of school building(s) such as foundations, walls, roofs, doors and windows are strong and suitable. They do not pose any risk to the life of children.			
1.5. The school runs in single shift mode.			
1.6. The roofs are clean and rain drains are open.			
1.7. No rubbish found on the ground.			
1.8. There is an active committee looking after repair and maintenance of the school building.			
1.9. There is an active committee looking after school hygiene and tidiness.			
1.10. There is natural light in all parts of the school building (except basements) and the humidity is kept to a comfortable normal level.			
1.11. The school is far from noise.			
1.12. There is a playing field of the size according to the number of learners (for example, two square metres per pupil).			
1.13. There is a green field in the school.			
1.14. There is a simple and transparent fence around school premises.			
1.15. The latrines for boys are separated from those of girls'.			
1.16. The number of latrines is according to the number of learners. (1 toilet for 25-30 learners)			
1.17. The number of classrooms is according to the number of learners. (1-1.5 square meter for a learner in a classroom)			
2.1. The school principal is trained (oriented / instructed) on management and leadership.	The school principal, in collaboration with teachers, learners and parents, and in coordination with educational supervisor, endeavours to improve the school.	School Management	2
2.2. A work plan has been prepared for school development by school principal, in consultation with teachers, learners and their parents.			
2.3. The roles of school principal, teachers, learners and their parents have been clearly defined in the school development work plan.			
2.4. The school development work plan is being implemented.			

**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

Indicators	Standards	Fields	#			
2.5. Capacity development of teachers as per their needs is part of the school development work plan.						
2.6. Teachers respect the school principal and trust managerial decisions.						
2.7. Learners love and respect the school principal.						
2.8. The school principal along with the school staff, learners and teachers participates in the teamwork for school development.						
2.9. All school records are kept updated and accessible.						
2.10. Minutes of administrative meetings are recorded and available.						
2.11. All participants are given opportunities to have active roles in decision making during the meetings.						
2.12. Parents-Teachers Association (PTA) is established and actively participates in school management, planning and implementation of development plans.						
3.1. A special budget is available for school improvement.				There is a special budget for school improvement along with a transparent system for expending the budget.	School Budget	3
3.2. The sources and amounts of the budget are clear and transparent.						
3.3. There are special and clear instructions for budget utilization.						
3.4. There is a special committee for supervising the budget utilization.						
3.5. Clear and transparent records are kept for budget utilization.						
3.6. A list of school needs, along with cost estimates for each item, is maintained and regularly updated.						
4.1. PTA members are drawn from different classes of community.	There is an active parents-teachers association (PTA) that involved in solving school problems and ensures basic needs are fulfilled.	Parents-Teachers Councils / Community Involvement	4			
4.2. PTA establishment process and activities are documented.						
4.3. The minutes of the meetings of the PTA are properly recorded.						
4.4. PTA activities are visible.						
4.5. PTA members pay visits to the homes of learners to discuss with the concerned parents if there are any issues and problems facing their children.						
4.6. PTAs help in solving the problems facing children, teachers, school management and staff, and parents.						
5.1. The teachers have been trained (oriented/guided) on the effective learning methodology.	Teachers implement active learning methods in child-cantered classrooms in which children are	Effective Learning / Capacity Building of Teachers	5			
5.2. Teachers encourage learners to attempt self-learning.						
5.3. The teachers ask questions to encourage brainstorming and wider participation of learners.						



**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

Indicators	Standards	Fields	#
5.4. The teachers do not call children with bad names.	enjoying learning.		
5.5. Teachers give opportunities to, and encourage all learners to participate without discrimination.			
5.6. Teachers manage and control classrooms with no problem.			
5.7. The teachers help learners to enable them to solve their problems themselves.			
5.8. The teachers link the curriculum with daily life through non-classroom activities.			
5.9. The learners have great roles in the classroom.			
5.10. The teachers are facilitators in the classroom.			
5.11. The educational materials are available in the classroom.			
5.12. Promotion rate is increasing.			
5.13. The learners enjoy learning.			
6.1. There is a sustainable source of drinking water in the school as per a laboratory test report.			
6.2. The water tanks and distribution networks are clean and healthy.			
6.3. The latrines are working.			
6.4. The water basins are working.			
6.5. The latrines and their surroundings are cleaned on daily basis.			
6.6. The children have been trained (oriented) on keeping the latrines and water basins clean.			
6.7. There is a committee for school hygiene.			
6.8. The school hygiene committee closely monitors the cleanliness of the latrines and water basins.			
6.9. The school administration has provided required materials and equipment for cleaning.			
7.1. No violence against any child.	There is a safe and tolerant environment, free of violence and dropout with focus on sports, arts and non-classroom activities.	Learning Environment / Violence / Learners Interrelations / Sports and Arts activities / Drop-out	7
7.2. No dropouts			
7.3. Follow-up and solving the problems of learners.			
7.4. There is a school library and the learners are benefiting from it.			
7.5. Science laboratory is available and used.			
7.6. There is a computer lab and being used.			
7.7. There are various types of non-classroom activities held on regular basis.			
7.8. There are various kinds of sports activities held frequently and recorded.			
7.9. Various types of arts activities are held frequently and recorded.			

**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE EU SUPPORTED EDUCATION PROGRAMME**  
**Improving Access to Quality Basic Education in Iraq**

Indicators	Standards	Fields	#
8.1. All the education programs are gender sensitive.	<p>a. The education curriculum is developed based on the requirements of individuals, community and labour market, and taking into consideration gender aspects.</p> <p>b. The curriculum is being implemented through new teaching aids and children are trained on life skills.</p>	Programs and Educational Aids / Life Skills	8
8.2. The education programs promote peace.			
8.3. The educational aids are available and in use.			
8.4. The content of programme subjects is reflective of human rights and child rights.			
8.5. The education programs focus on the child personality and life skills.			
8.6. The textbooks are printed in colour.			
9.1. There is a canteen/ tuck shop available on the school premises.	Children can obtain essential, suitable and healthy food within the school premises.	School Nutrition	9
9.2. The canteen is neat and clean.			
9.3. The canteen sells hygienic and healthy food items. All children have opportunity to buy necessary food items from the shop.			
9.4. The canteen supervision and monitoring committee is active and regularly reports on the operation of school canteen.			
10.1. All children are enrolled in the school without any discrimination (excluding the condition of age which is established according to ministry instructions).	All children are enrolled and continue their education without any discrimination based on gender, disability, religion, ethnicity and creed.	Inclusiveness (Gender) and participation of disabled children	10
10.2. Teachers believe in children's capacities and have confidence that the individual differences do not stop the children's learning process.			
10.3. Teachers have been trained (oriented) on treating the disabled children.			
10.4. No gender-based discrimination verbally or in deeds.			
10.5. The teachers do not impose their political, religious and ethnic opinions on the children.			
10.6. Teachers are aware and cautious when giving examples, and they never hurt children's feeling.			

## ANNEX 4: CAPACITY BUILDING (JUL - DEC 2012)

### KRG:

- 50 supervisors, school principals and teachers were trained as lead trainers (TOT) in Child Friendly School concepts, management and leadership, CFS pedagogy and child-centred teaching-learning process;
- 3198 Teachers were trained in CFS pedagogy;
- 254 school principals and assistants were trained in management and leadership and CFS concepts;
- 6 PTA groups with a total membership of 66 were identified for training in January on CFS concepts, roles and responsibilities of PTAs, concepts and advantages of inclusive education;
- 28 Representatives of DoEs from Sulaimaniya, Erbil, Garmiyān and Dohuk were provided detailed explanation on CFS concepts, and role of DoEs;
- 9 Supervisors from Erbil were trained about their roles and responsibilities in supporting CFS. These supervisors will also conduct in future months training of head teachers and deputies; and,
- In total, 3,548 teachers, principals and their deputies, supervisors, MoE staff, community mobilisers and PTA members were provide training in KRG during the current reporting period in various topics, such CFS concepts, Child-centred pedagogy, school management, leadership, health and hygiene promotion, community mobilization, roles and responsibilities of PTAs, managing small projects at school level etc.

### Centre and South zones:

- 480 teachers, deputy principals, supervisors trained in Health and Hygiene promotion package, through a series of 16 training workshops;
- 42 supervisors, and school principals received training as lead trainers in Assessment of Training Needs of school teachers;
- School principals and teachers were trained as lead trainers (TOT) in Child Friendly School concepts, management and leadership, CFS pedagogy and child-centred teaching-learning process;
- 1,117 Teachers were trained in CFS pedagogy;
- 328 school principals and assistants were trained in management and leadership and CFS concepts; and,
- 461 schools out of 636 targeted schools had completed their School Improvement Plans (SIPs), and started implementing small-scale projects from their respective SIPs.

Source: UNICEF report #4

## ANNEX 5: KEY INFORMANTS

Federal Government: MoE	
Mr. Emad Eddin -	Director-general of educational projects.
Ms. D. Hana -	Expert - Quality Assurance Dept.; responsible for Training Affairs
Ms. Mayyada A.J.Najm	General Directorate of Intl. and Arabic Orgs. MoE.
Ms. Sana	Directorate of educational programmes
Ms. Mayada Abdul Jabar Najem	General Directorate of international and Arab organizations in the ministry Secretariat
Mr. Adel Abdul-Reheem	D.G. of General Education in the MoE.
Directors of Education, Baghdad Area	
Ms. Sahira	Director of Education Directorate Al Karkh -1
Mr. Mohammed Rashid	Director Education Directorate Al Karkh 2
Mr. Mohamed Moussa	Director of Education Directorate Al Karkh -3
Mr. Wathiq	Director of Education Directorate Rusafa -1
Mr. Hadi -	Director Educational Directorate Rusafa 2
Mr. Yassin	Director of Education Directorate Rusafa 3
KRG	
Mr. Yousif Othman Hamad	CFS Focal Point MoE-KRG
Mr. Abdul-Basit Abdul-Hamid	Supervisor, MoE-KRG
Basrah	
Mr. Mahdi	Education Directorate. Basra
UNICEF	
Dr. Ikem Chiejine	Chief of Education in UNICEF
Mr. Fiaz Shah	Education specialist
Parvez Akhter	Consultant
Joyce Gachiri	Head of sub-office, KRG
Abdelkader Kakasur	Education Officer KRG / North Zonal Office
Others	
Martin Omukuba	Children and Youth, Protection and Development Senior Coordinator, IRC
Ms. Hala Al-Sharifi	Project Manager, EU
We did not meet anyone of British Council, IoM or DRC	
Evaluation Team	
Akram Jumali	Consultant
Nahla Ashraf	Consultant
Peter Middlebrook	Project Director
Barry Sesnan	Lead consultant

## ANNEX 6: LIST OF SCHOOLS VISITED

### KRG

Name of School	Place	Type
Pashai Gawra	Rwandz	Rwandz CFS rural
Garawani Khwaru	Garawan village	Rwandz CFS semi-urban
Khanaqin	Nusaran Qt Erbil	CFS urban
Hasarost	Nusaran Qt Erbil	CFS urban
Mhabad	Brayatee Qt Erbil	CFS good
Sabat	Kasnazan Dashti Hawler	CFS big
Hawsang.	Khabat Khabat	CFS semi-urban
Taqtaq....	Taq Taq Koya	CFS semi-urban
Lawan	Kurani Ainkawa Qt Dashti Hawler	non CFS
Rasan	Setaqan Erbil	non CFS, for girls

Note: 7 additional schools did self-assessment.

### Basra

Name of School	No of Learners	Teachers, including Principals	Shift/No schools in building	Type
Al-Minaa P.S. (Girls), Ma'qel	450	25 (F)	1/3	-
Rasheed Aali P.S. Boys, Ma'qel	427	21 (6M+19F)	1/2	-
Rayet El Islam (Girls) Abu el Khaseeb Minawi Lijem	482	28 (F)	1/1	-
Husseiniya P.S. (Girls)	611	25 (F)	1/3	-
Hamdan P.S. (Boys), Abu el Khaseeb	613	25 (19M + 6F)	1/2	-
Tannouma P.S. (Boys), Shatt el Arab	675	20 (10F+10M)		-
Difa Sharqiya (Boys), Shatt el Arab	720	27 (21 F+ 6 M)	1/3	-
Al-Saja P.C., Hay el Hussein	510	15(F)	1/3	Mixed non CFS

### Baghdad

Name of school	Notes	Type
Thilfiqar	Al-Bayaa	
Al-Sabah	Hay Al-Amel, the first two schools so close to each other	Two schools
Boar Saeed	Hay Al-Mutanabi	-
Al-Abrar I	In Al-Washah	-
Sit Zoubida	Al-Shuhadaa-Al-Kharkh	-
Al-Kumeet	Al-Rayaheen in rural area. The two schools are working in one building, Abu Gharib	New to CFS
Al-Mofieed	Al-Kahdimiay	-
Qoraish	Al-Kahdimiay	Non CFS
Al-Tomoah	Baghdad al-Jadidah	-
Al-Qahtaniah	Baghdad al-Jadidah	-

Note: six additional schools did self-assessment.