

Evaluation of the WASH Sector Strategy “Community Approaches to Total Sanitation” (CATS)



Nepal – Country Visit Report

October, 2013

Table of Contents

Contents

Acronyms	4
A. Overview of the global CATS Evaluation	5
A.1 Rationale behind this evaluation	5
A.2. Objectives of the global evaluation	6
A.3. Overview of the main evaluation questions.....	6
A.4. Establishment of Complementary Tools at the National and Global Level.....	7
A.5. Objectives of this in-country evaluation report	7
B. Methodology of the in-country evaluation	8
C. Analysis of the four evaluation dimensions	10
C.1 Outcomes	10
C.1.1 Main achievements of CATS programmes and contrast with pre- CATS situation.....	11
C.1.2 Main constraints for CATS programme implementation.....	12
C.1.3 Criteria for Success.....	12
C.1.4 Success vs. difficult conditions.....	13
C.1.5 Other impacts (health etc)	13
C.2 Efficiency	14
C.2.1 UNICEF’s contribution to create an enabling environment for scaling-up	14
C.2.2 Costs and financial competitiveness of CATS.....	15
C.2.3 Financial incentive.....	15
C.2.4 Spontaneous diffusion effects	15
C.2.5 Institutional arrangements and partnerships	16
C.3 Effectiveness	17
C.3.1 Evidence for social norms change on OD after CATS interventions	17
C.3.2 Triggering	18
C.3.3 Movers and shakers in different phases	18
C.4 Sustainability.....	19
C.4.1 Evaluation criteria used to measure CATS results	19
C.4.2 M and E system used to measure results	20

C.4.3	Evidence of adherence to ODF status and lasting behavior change (i.e. use and maintenance of toilets and hand-washing facilities)	20
C.4.4	Evidence of drop-out and equity aspect	21
C.4.5	Reinforcement for continued adherence and going up the ladder	21
C.4.6	Remedial actions	22
D.	Main conclusions	23
ANNEXES	24

ACRONYMS

CATS	Community Approaches to Total Sanitation
DOLIDAR	Department of Local Infrastructure Development and Agricultural Roads
D-WASHCC	District Water, Hygiene and Sanitation Coordination Committee
DWSS	Department of Water Supply and Sewerage
ENPHO	Environment and Public Health Organization
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NEWAH	Nepal Water for Health
NMIP	National Management Information Programme
N-WASHCC	National Water Hygiene and Sanitation Coordination Committee
ODF	Open Defecation Free
SEIU	Sector Efficiency Improvement Unit
SLTS	School Led Total Sanitation
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
VDC	Village Development Committee
V-WASHCC	Village Water, Hygiene and Sanitation Coordination Committee
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene

A. OVERVIEW OF THE GLOBAL CATS EVALUATION

A.1 RATIONALE BEHIND THIS EVALUATION

UNICEF has put efforts in Nepal since the decade 1990s to improve the hygiene and sanitation of the country and has introduced several programmes responding to the changed socio-political context. In 1990, the national sanitation coverage of Nepal was only 6 per cent. In 2011, as per the report published by Central Bureau of Statistics, the sanitation coverage has increased to 62 per cent. Evidences reflect Nepal's sanitation coverage took a speed after 2006, which is also the year when Community Approaches for Total Sanitation were introduced and its elements were replicated and diffused across the country.

UNICEF has paid special attention to protect the children in countries where children's death rate is higher simply because they lack simplest practices like using toilets and washing hands with soap. In Nepal, diarrhea is one of the top 2 killers of children under 5 years old after the Acute Respiratory Infection.

To combat such situation, UNICEF has implemented the CATS approach across developing world, and Nepal is one among those where UNICEF has partnered with government and agencies to cut down on the rates of diseases and deaths among children.

Not only has UNICEF responded to the changed socio-political contexts, but as well it has been constantly reviewing its programmes to spread results from one part of the country out to the other and to continually maximize results in there. Meanwhile, UNICEF realized that the CATS has further potentials to positively affect lives of much more people in regions beyond where these approaches are running. In doing so, evaluation has been proven as fundamental as effective to ensure equity, take corrective measures and to make sure that UNICEF's purpose, targets, goals are on track and meet set standards.

In specific terms, the evaluation is carried out to gather evidences and gain insights into what inputs the community-approaches-to-total-sanitation grew more valuable, what results it created, what process it followed and what impacts it created. In general terms, the evaluation tries to deliver knowledge, insights and evidences that help UNICEF bring more focus, force, speed and value in implementing CATS inside and beyond where the approach is currently underway.

A.2. OBJECTIVES OF THE GLOBAL EVALUATION

As part of a team with the International Consultants, the National Consultant will examine, as systematically and objectively as possible, the effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and outcomes of the efforts in CATS supported by UNICEF. While it will be based on national and sub-national level experience, it is expressly called upon to deliver global level findings.

The main purposes of the evaluation are:

- A. To enable evidence-based decision-making: to link attained CATS results back to the inputs, activities, and performance by UNICEF and other stakeholders, and thereby to determine any changes needed to make national partners and UNICEF more effective at CATS programming and to guide decisions about scaling up or not of the strategy;
- B. To contribute to global learning: to make available to the global communities interested in WASH, Education, and other topics the understanding about effective hygiene programming that will emerge, in order that they may alter the programs they support in light of the CATS evidence.
- C. To promote accountability: to verify the accuracy of claims made about CATS performance, and to examine the reliability of data used to assess CATS performance, in order to assure internal and external stakeholders of the accuracy of the evidence that is presented and the efficiency of the program they support.

A.3. OVERVIEW OF THE MAIN EVALUATION QUESTIONS

The evaluation put together a range of 20-25 questions that were distributed into 10 different sub-sets for different key informants whose breadth of responses were expected to vary based on their institution, scope of the work, responsibility and experience.

Questions related to financial mechanism did not gain as much responses as expected since efforts into this dimension were very negligible and no accountable body was in place to look after such issues. Majority of respondents and discussions around workshops also reflected that no plan is forthcoming to explore, collect and assess evidence on financial mechanism. In this respect questions related to financial efficiency made little meaning to the stakeholders in Nepal.

However, respondents were more willing and enthusiastic to answer questions related to other aspects of inputs, enabling environment, implementation process, results and outputs. The questions received responses that were consistent and uniform among stakeholders of varied level and background.

Since little researches had been carried out in the past to assess impact and sustainability, there was relatively less consistency in peoples' responses as compared with those under other questions.

A.4. ESTABLISHMENT OF COMPLEMENTARY TOOLS AT THE NATIONAL AND GLOBAL LEVEL

The key complementary tools creating positive values for the CATS approaches in Nepal include 'Aligning for Action' and national Sanitation Master Plan. A range of other tools such as School WASH, Global Sanitation Fund, and community based sanitation initiatives of the Ministry of Local Development and Ministry of Education are providing authorities' reasons to fill in resources gaps in areas where CATS are implemented.

Aligning for Action bred a culture of coordination, gave regional directors power who before had little say over the development initiatives. Thanks to the grown willingness and readiness of the development agencies to work together, joint plans, joint implementation and joint monitoring happened. The 'Joint-effort' in many districts became instrumental in giving the sanitation initiative a speed and hence to declare a village and district Open Defecation Free.

The solid example for how 'Aligning for Action' complemented the Community Approaches for Total Sanitation is the Dang district. While the district's several schools implemented School Led Total Sanitation and the influence was stretching across villages to villages, 'Aligning for Action' stepped into the district to bring together stakeholders who set a broader vision and placed efforts with a greater force. 'Aligning for Action' has created similar effects in several districts of the Mid and Far Western region. However, its implications have not yet reached beyond the country.

Nepal's Sanitation Master Plan has also made CATS its central focus so as to motivate and guide national initiatives toward 'total sanitation' status. The principles of the Master Plan and its implementing guidelines are compatible with the global principles of the CATS. Nepal's key five ministries, Ministry of Urban Development, Ministry of Local Development, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Health and Nepal's Planning Commission have approved the elements of the Master Plan and have pledged their support.

Though the effect and scope of the 'Master Plan' and 'Aligning for Action' have not reached beyond Nepal, their influences have been considered vital in complementing the CATS approaches and amplify their results.

A.5. OBJECTIVES OF THIS IN-COUNTRY EVALUATION REPORT

The in-country evaluation report aims to put together findings of the evaluation that the team carried out through field visits, semi-structured interviews, focused group discussions, national and sub-national workshops and literature reviews. The specific objectives of this in-country evaluation report are as follows:

- To present evidences, realities and findings of the evaluation accurately, objectively and completely on four dimensions of the evaluation: effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and outcomes
- To provide granularity on the methods: how and where the evaluation was carried out
- To deliver a product that can be archived and recorded for future use for facts, evidences and conclusions that will help UNICEF makes decisions.

B. METHODOLOGY OF THE IN-COUNTRY EVALUATION

As the evaluation aimed to assess more of the qualitative aspects of the approach and less of the quantitative, a complete range of methods that the nature of the work demanded have been employed. The details of the methods followed have been mentioned below.

Workshops:

Inception Workshop:

The evaluation team took an opportunity to share on the purpose of its visit to a large number of stakeholders who were the members of the National WASH Coordination Committee that recommends hygiene and sanitation policies and suggest strategic actions.

Nepal's stakeholders attending the workshop briefed the evaluation team on the country's overall sanitation situation, helped size up which interventions to include under CATS in the national scenario and which districts to select that would give representative information. The government of Nepal also assigned officials to help the team in the evaluation process.

Prior to discussion, the team made a presentation and clarified on matters that participants asked for clarifications. Participants also discussed on aspects on which Nepal is unique when it comes to the matter of CATS.

Sub-national Workshop:

So as to share on the first-hand information from areas across the country, stakeholders from 16 districts who have been implementing CATS attended the Sub-national workshop organized in the Chitwan district. Those attending the workshop included Local Development Officers, district engineers, regional directors, media persons, community group representatives, health volunteers and other government's district officials.

Representatives of all of these districts had presentations ready to present to the workshop participants, and their enthusiasm and willingness to tell their stories were visible in the way each of them were trying to take a time to present. Their slide presentations, video documentaries and photographs were collected and participants were given time to briefly deliver key highlights.

The participants in the workshop were divided into three groups: a) government agencies, b) local bodies, civil societies and community organizations, and c) NGOs. These groups worked on different questionnaires and made presentations. Participants discussed on their findings and together refined the insights.

National Workshop:

In the national workshop, the evaluation team shared on the findings from the field visits, semi-structured interviews, observations, focused group discussions and sub-national workshops. Representatives from government bodies, donor agencies, development agencies, networks and federations added their inputs to these findings.

Participants of the national workshop were divided into three teams so as to work on group-works. And the three different topics they worked on included a) comparing CATS with previous approaches: differences in annual sanitation uptake, b) community led and national target, c) national target: general support through indirect subsidies. Insights, information and evidences presented in the group works were discussed and participants added further information and provided feedbacks on each of these presentations.

Field Visits:

In order to capture the real-world-scenario of the field, visits were made to two different districts keeping in mind that they would represent the realistic pictures of the national sanitation aspects. In doing so, Jagatpur VDC of Chitwan district and Lalparsa VDC of the Parsa districts were chosen. Interactions were made with group of people that included community leaders, members of Village WASH committees, local cooperatives, farmers and women. Separate discussions were also made with school teachers, students, child club members and school headmaster. The evaluation team including district bodies and national consultants visited households and schools, observed their toilets, and held interactions.

Feedbacks from the observation of the field were later on discussed with the District WASH Committee and verifications on the findings were made.

Focused Group Discussions:

Focused Group Discussions were held at the local level in fields. In Parsa district, a set of questions were presented to a group of people who were female health volunteers, members of village WASH committees, representatives of local groups. Such discussions were also made

with the school teachers, child clubs members. Similar was done in the Chitwan district, where schools, wards and settlements of the Jagatpur VDCs were observed.

Semi-structured Interviews:

So as to maximize the number of interviews with key informants, international consultants for CATS evaluation led two different groups that reached out to different individuals for interviews. From the government's side, policy maker, implementers, chief of department, regional director, officers looking after programme and local bodies running programmes at the local level were interviewed.

From the UNICEF's side, Representative of UNICEF, Chief of WASH section, programme leader and district officers were interviewed.

Interviews were also taken with the national, district and local level development agency, network, federation, journalist, headmaster, and local leaders.

The participants who were interviewed encompassed a broad range of people from the senior government level to the local level representatives, who had been directly working for the promotion of the community based total sanitation approaches that are in general School Led Total Sanitation and Community Based Total Sanitation.

Literature Review:

A set of national and international publications, reviews, study reports, news and events were reviewed. Databases of publications such as Nepal Demographic Health Survey, National Census Report, Nepal Living Standard Survey and other national documents were found to make primary focus on delivering coverage and less on qualitative aspects.

National Sanitation Master Plan, National Census Report, Sector Status Report and data-bases from NMIP were reviewed to explore information that could help set the background for the evaluation and to review the results of Nepal's overall M and E system. Publications of UNICEF, DWSS, DOLIDAR, WATER Aid, ENPHO and NEWAH were reviewed to extract information that fall within the scope of the evaluation.

The sector was found to have done little studies in aspects such as financial management, sustainability, post ODF status, behavior change and social norms. Whatever information available on these aspects is inadequate and incomplete.

C. ANALYSIS OF THE FOUR EVALUATION DIMENSIONS

C.1 OUTCOMES

C.1.1 MAIN ACHIEVEMENTS OF CATS PROGRAMMES AND CONTRAST WITH PRE- CATS SITUATION

As of March 2013, 748 village development committees and 6 municipalities have been declared as ODF areas. Five districts (Kaski, Chitwan, Tanahun, Myagdi, and Pyauthan) have achieved 100 per cent sanitation coverage and they have been declared as ODF districts. The national sanitation coverage in 2011 reached 62 per cent. Before the CATS intervention, none of the achievements mentioned were in these forms. The concept of measuring village development committees, municipalities and districts as 'ODF-declared' came after school catchment areas declared their areas ODF and the concept was stretched out to the village development committees and districts. Nepal's sanitation initiatives took aggressive mode after total sanitation approaches such as School Led Total Sanitation were introduced. The trend of declaring areas Open Defecation Free is increasing day after day.

Celebration of International Year of Sanitation in 2008 added a major boost to Nepal's initiative. The occasion created opportunities for collaboration, commitment and gain support from diverse range of stakeholders: beaurocrats, politicians, civil societies, government and local bodies. Every year, Ministry of Education put money to install infrastructures in public schools of the country.

Unlike before, sharing of lessons, insights and experiences have been surging spontaneously across the country. Increased coordination, cooperation, consultations during Master Plan development, SEIU development and coordination committees at the national, regional, district and local level are examples of how stakeholders now work. District strategy development spreading across the country from Chitwan district to others like Tanahun and Kaski districts is an example of the effect on sharing and replication through enhanced coordination and cooperation.

Earlier efforts in the country were fragmented in nature. Mostly those initiatives were executed in isolation and lacked any national priority. Because of their narrow scope, effects like behavior change were far from their priority. Back then, majority of such approaches were hardware focused. Now the trend has moved toward a single-channeled approach.

In scale, earlier efforts were project based, and now efforts close to the concept of the community approaches to total sanitation are more like programmes. The government's chain leading sanitation initiatives from the center to the district as they are doing now was absent in the past.

In the past, dropout rate among users were significant, as studies of Water Aid, Lumati, UNICEF and KAP have shown. Now, while ODF declarations still has lapses with respect to sustainability, the use and maintenance rate have markedly increased as compared with the previous rate.

However, calculating those results in terms what should have happened, stakeholders say, efforts are still inadequate. A large portion of these achievements were driven more by the dedication to meet the national goal of total sanitation by 2017, and less so by the motivation to meet the ultimate state of sanitation.

C.1.2 MAIN CONSTRAINTS FOR CATS PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION

While open defecation declarations are growing on speed, in the process some villages and districts have hurried up and have escaped the awareness generation and behavior development aspect of the sanitation promotion. In villages like Lalparasa of the Parsa district, local authorities have poured in a large chunk of subsidies in a bid to compete against neighboring villages and declare their villages ODF sooner.

Because the ‘total sanitation’ initiative now has shifted its approach of focus from ‘some without toilets’ to ‘all without toilets’, the equity issues have no longer remained between the poor and rich classes. Rather, equity issues have now emerged between ‘those-having-toilets’, and ‘those not having toilets’.

For reasons that some are waiting for subsidies and some hastened to achieve ‘total sanitation’ status, declarations have also happened with temporary toilets. Though the cases of temporary toilets are negligible and districts have often put priority in replacing temporary toilets with permanent, the process has been challenging.

Moreover, some cultural and geographic factors are also causing difficulties. A large flat land of tarai region faces challenges of water contamination every year, as floods hit some parts of the region every year.

Migrants coming to settle in the ODF declared regions without a toilet, landless households encroaching lands and unhygienic public toilets along highways have demanded a continuous enforcement mechanism to sustain results. However, the sector still lacks a policy or enforcement mechanism that ensures management of such issues.

Despite the government’s coordinating bodies (WASH coordination committees) are present at national, district and local level, Sanitation Master Plan has not yet reached out to all the districts, villages and schools that are willing to introduce community approaches to total sanitation but lacked management and financial capacity.

C.1.3 CRITERIA FOR SUCCESS

As per the discussion with key informants and stakeholders during workshops, they are clear on defining success of CATS. In stakeholder's perspective, key indicators that define CATS successful include social and political commitment, commitment from schools, agencies and local bodies and coordination among them and local bodies taking ownership over the approach.

The national target to reach total sanitation by 2017 has touched villages, districts and schools, who have welcomed the idea since this total sanitation as a target is compatible even for a smallest unit of a community like school. In general, open defecation free declarations draw admirations from stakeholders, civil societies and media.

C.1.4 SUCCESS VS. DIFFICULT CONDITIONS

One of the difficult conditions that CATS has been efficiently able to overcome is that poverty has not brought the force of the sanitation initiative down. But this is conditional. In areas where schools are proactive, coordination is strong and people have clear idea on what to do, how to do and what to achieve, even disadvantaged settlements have been able to install toilets and use them.

In case of Kalikot district, in the course of moving sanitation ahead, geographical inaccessibility and scattered household and poverty posed challenges, which would have slowed down the process of ODF declaration. In addition, temporary toilets were widely in practices in the region, replacing those with permanent was hugely costly in this kind of topography. However, these challenges turned negligible in front of the district's collective passion, commitment and forceful action.

Kalikot is one of the many districts in the Mid and Far western region where diarrhoea outbreak used to claim lives of people almost every year. In early 2009, diarrhoea outbreak caused deaths of over 300 people in the Jajarkot and Rukum districts. An initiative 'Aligning-for-Action' introduced thereafter brought scores of stakeholders together to combat the district's challenges. As a result, now all the districts in the region have district strategic plan in place to declare their areas Open Defecation Free at some time in future. And Kalikot which has already achieved so is one of them.

When local bodies show readiness to decide, implement and take ownership, objectives of CATS are easiest to achieve. However the sector is finding it hard to find a definite way to bring behavior change as has been visualized by the CATS approach.

C.1.5 OTHER IMPACTS (HEALTH ETC)

In areas like Ghachok of Kaski district, the approach has caused improvement in environmental sanitation. Jagatpur residents feel their reputation enhanced as they were respected in neighboring villages for their works. Health posts reports and health volunteers reflect sharp reduction in diseases such as diarrhoea and typhoid. After declaring their area open defecation free, community people have begun managing their cow-shed.

In some districts like Dang, use of smokeless stove, eco-san latrine, organic farming, initiation of 'hero of generosity' concept and mobilization of sanitation commando have emerged as effects of CATS. These effects grew as CATS became more flexible to local contexts.

People have developed positive perception towards their life with increased dignity and pride. Prospects for tourism are also opening up in areas like Bandipur of Tanahun district. And lack of sanitation, as it once used to be, has no longer been an obstacle for tourism promotion.

C.2 EFFICIENCY

C.2.1 UNICEF'S CONTRIBUTION TO CREATE AN ENABLING ENVIRONMENT FOR SCALING-UP

UNICEF supported government stay at the forefront to lead sanitation across the country and backed the government from behind. Nepal's Sanitation Master Plan has incorporated the principles of CATS. UNICEF's supporting role has also been vital in bringing the Master Plan at the right time for the right purpose. The Plan has been endorsed by Ministry of Urban Development, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Local Development and the National Planning Commission. And UNICEF played a vital role in producing the mutual commitment from the government's side.

Its support was also instrumental in helping government design policies, standards, guidelines and making those accessible down to the community level. Nepal has made several breakthroughs during International Year of Sanitation in pulling stakeholders' support for standardization, harmony and unity.

UNICEF also took a significant step into designing and implementing the concept of 'Aligning for Action', which empowered government's regional leadership and drew joint-efforts in planning, implementation and monitoring CATS approaches for Mid and Far western region of Nepal.

UNICEF also has played a role of mediation to bring competitive advantage of the central stakeholders and local bodies together to move on with the Nepal's total sanitation initiative.

C.2.2 COSTS AND FINANCIAL COMPETITIVENESS OF CATS

Stakeholders consider community-level-resource-mobilization as one of the strengths of the CATS approaches. A study carried out by Water Aid shows the relative cost effectiveness of the SLTS approach as compared with the others being implemented to improve the sanitation status of the country.

A mix of both the subsidies and community resources were used to keep sanitation initiatives moving. Communities like Jagatpur of Chitwan district and Saudiyar of Dang districts entirely used community resources. Government's strategy to promote local level resource mobilization is earning support and an increased understanding among stakeholders was found on discouraging subsidies.

Still, fragmentations on support mechanism exist. Hence, currently no agencies are in place to calculate inputs in the economic terms and no efforts has yet been made in the direction and no evidences are available so far.

C.2.3 FINANCIAL INCENTIVE

Since the CATS intervention has been implemented, financial incentives and subsidies have been made in the form of rewards and in some cases are managed through revolving funds. Such incentives and subsidies are guided by Nepal's Hygiene and Sanitation Master Plan, which has discouraged direct subsidies and has encouraged local level resource mobilization.

Mostly districts also put up systems for loans which poor people use to install toilets and pay it back within six months. For example, in a Jagatpur village, a sanitation fund of 50,000 was put up. Similarly Dang district provided loan facility ranging from 3000 to 10,000 to its people.

In Nepal, concerns on subsidies are mounting and efforts are in place to cut down on direct subsidies. However, a large portion people including poor and disadvantaged still lack hygiene and sanitation services. In such contexts, stakeholders explored some ways to redefine indirect subsidies in various forms. Some of them include, reward after construction, exploration of local donors to finance poor households, support from users committee for ring production, piloting of sanitation marketing approach and drawing support from community groups such as forest users groups and women groups.

C.2.4 SPONTANEOUS DIFFUSION EFFECTS

Sanitation campaign ran far faster and stronger and increasingly touched the identity and emotions of people. ODF ceremonies organized in the neighboring villages and the dignity and pride villagers earned grew covetous to many near-by villages and districts. Villages and districts where CATS approaches have not been implemented also took initiatives to declare their areas ODF on their own. In these areas fast-paced diffusions have emerged.

After schools proved their strength in bringing total sanitation status within school catchment areas, Nepal's government, on its own will, made a decision to implement SLTS programme in all the 75 districts of Nepal.

Bajura, the least ranked district in sanitation status, gained motivation from its schools that implemented SLTS approach. The district now is gaining momentum in toilet installation and hand washing promotion based initiatives.

In Dang district, child clubs volunteered in demonstrating street drama and ran awareness campaign. Villages declaring ODF on their own without any external support are also emerging.

Open defecation free declaration ceremonies that drew participation from neighboring villages and senior personalities from government and donor agencies have led to positive competition among villagers. Spontaneous adoption of such behaviors has occurred through appreciating people who have been rewarded and recognized. In several districts, the current sanitation movement has been attractive to political leaders, and community people have welcomed their efforts and proactive-ness. The movement in the country has grown massive and unstoppable.

Students staging awareness rally in Dang District



C.2.5 INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS AND PARTNERSHIPS

Department of Water Supply and Sewerage under the Ministry of Urban Development oversees the country's sanitation-based operations. Within the Department, National WASH Coordination Committee has been set up which coordinates relevant line ministries, their departments, UN agencies including UNICEF and development agencies. The National Committee is extended to the district level as District WASH Coordination Committee and to the village level as Village WASH Coordination Committee.

UNICEF works within the framework of government and strengthens the role of such Coordination Committees at national, district and village level.

There is an increased consensus among stakeholders on strengthening institutional instruments such as D-WASHCC and V-WASHCC for the implementation of community approaches to total sanitation. A mechanism to build capacity of WASH coordination committees at the central, district and local level have also been developed and implemented.

Thanks to the efforts to build coordination, Ministry of Education has joined the national initiative in promoting school sanitation, which once had worked alone while building sanitation-based infrastructure in schools.

The district Kalikot considers that its' key strength is the strong WASH coordination committee at the district and village level. With cooperation among political leaders, education office, local administration, local NGOs and forest users groups, the Dang district is gaining confidence to declare its entire area open defecation free by 2014.

Private sectors' role grew critical in making physical infrastructure available for toilet installations, overcoming financial challenges at the local level, and in distribution system by making materials available easily and efficiently. However, private sectors find it challenging when materials are lost, and when they have to give materials in credit, some of which are not used.

C.3 EFFECTIVENESS

C.3.1 EVIDENCE FOR SOCIAL NORMS CHANGE ON OD AFTER CATS INTERVENTIONS

Nepal has been keeping track of evidence-based knowledge on coverage but has relatively missed out on collecting evidences related to social norms including post-ODF, sustainability and behavior change.

Through discussions with key informants and during workshops, the evaluation found: a norm that toilets must be built to meet the national goal of achieving total sanitation by 2017 now has been established. In the country, providing access firstly to poor and disadvantaged has been established as a norm. Thanks to such developed norms, widows, landless, poor and disabled are receiving support without obstacles.

Currently, UNICEF and NRCS are working together on an approach in which developing local norms are key elements. Within the approach, communities design their preferred norms and make efforts to establish them in their society.

Department of Education of the Education Ministry has designed and implemented a design which is inclusive of local norms especially with respect to gender, child and disabled friendly. In schools, ramps are installed and handles are placed properly to facilitate disabled; locks, basins, pans are set in a way to make the facility child friendly. Chambers are installed with incineration facility to manage the wastage of menstruating girls, who continue to attend school during menstruation period.

C.3.2 TRIGGERING

Triggering events differed regions to regions, just as they differ in their norms. For an example, the concept of 'commando' was effective in the Dang district, while offering dosalla in local style grew effective in the Chitwan district. In Tanahun district, offering *tika* on forehead and staging praise walk grew popular and effective.

Behavior development and toilet installations were also found to be triggered by the proactive action of the school children, political leaders and district leaders. For an example in Tanahun district, proactive action of Local Development Officer did a lot to motivate several other officials and stakeholders. He spent several days in the field digging pit for disadvantaged households and many people followed his suit. His actions created additional speed and force. As a result, many people installed toilet and hand washing facilities in their households.

In districts, some triggering approaches have been proven more effective than others in producing consistent results. Other triggering approaches proven effective so far include: demonstration of how feces enter into mouth, feces calculation, praise and shame walk, social mapping, flagging, whistling, making names public and reward and recognition.

C.3.3 MOVERS AND SHAKERS IN DIFFERENT PHASES

Firstly, it is the school and community who together prove to district authorities that achieving total sanitation in their region is possible. Nepal was seen unique with respect to the role public schools can play in drawing disadvantaged people into the pool of initiators since schools are the places where mostly students' poor and disadvantaged communities come from. The effects are positive since schools are the smallest unit of a community which can pay close attention to each household while monitoring the maintenance and sustainability of the sanitation facility such as toilets.

Secondly, it is also found that each and every district where CATS is taking a progressive course, Local Development Officers of the Local Development Office and District Engineers of the District Development Office have played vital roles. Within the District WASH Coordination

Committee, District Engineers coordinate district's stakeholders throughout the journey and Local Development Officer chairs the Coordination Committee. Since government agencies, UN bodies and several development stakeholders rely on the coordination committee to take over the districts actions, mechanisms are also in place to empower them. In this sense, if a district relies on the institutional framework, Local Development Officers and Districts Engineers have the power to either make or break the possibility of succeeding CATS approaches. However, role of the two of these agencies and stakeholders have drawn appreciation from stakeholders for their proactive and positive roles.

Thirdly, it is the supporters under which donors, government's department, who always show willingness to motivate and support schools, villages and districts that are proactive to promote hygiene and sanitation status.

Role of electronic and print media, and private sectors also have been enabling to establish sanitation as an important facility in community, schools and institutions. Local media such as newspapers, FMs and radios presented sanitation as their social responsibility and journalists made unconditional support.

C.4 SUSTAINABILITY

C.4.1 EVALUATION CRITERIA USED TO MEASURE CATS RESULTS

In districts where CATS are implemented, a district level monitoring and evaluation committee recommends whether a proposed area is eligible for achieving open defecation free status. On the recommendation of the committee, District WASH Coordination Committee qualifies a village, school catchment area or a district to gain open defecation free status.

The minimum standard communities maintain in installing toilets include criteria such as water seal latrine, users friendly and permanent structure. The same are also the criteria for evaluation within the CATS framework.

In the qualitative aspect of the CATS results, the Committee assesses the level of commitment households and communities show. While doing so, evaluation members observe individual and community's hygiene practice and behavior. For an example, committed households make soaps available close to water taps, properly clean their toilets, maintain cleanliness of surroundings and set up a place to dry up kitchen utensils.

At the national level, SEIU developed a sector status report that set indicators for hygiene and sanitation in order to bring in sector efficiency.

C.4.2 M AND E SYSTEM USED TO MEASURE RESULTS

In the country, as ODF ceremonies, innovative activities and practices are increasing day after day – unexplored data, information, insights and lessons are also rising. There is no doubt that the sector now than ever before has a need of a strong M and E system to measure its results. The line ministries of Nepal such as Ministry of Urban Development, Ministry of Local Development and Ministry of Education have established monitoring and evaluation departments to collect insights, information, lessons – but their role has been relatively undermined and overshadowed.

Several agencies run sanitation programmes with their unique system to collect database that measures outputs against set objectives. For an example, DOLIDAR does evaluations for the projects it implemented, UNICEF has its internal mechanism of reporting and data collection based on key indicators. NEWAH and ENPHO have tried to set up resource centers to store information.

However, an MOU had been signed among DOLIDAR, DWSS and FUND BOARD to use a uniformed reporting approach. In order to do so, a set of detailed indicators had been designed but still required proper implementation.

While VWASHCC has grown to be promising and DWASCC has been progressively taking over the role of monitoring and evaluation, the sector still falls short of a clear, uniform, standard, simple and user-friendly reporting and information collection format.

Until now, most part of the monitoring of ODF status takes place at the local level. While Village WASH Coordination Committees lead local level monitoring, community groups, child clubs and schools actively engage in the monitoring activity.

C.4.3 EVIDENCE OF ADHERENCE TO ODF STATUS AND LASTING BEHAVIOR CHANGE (I.E. USE AND MAINTENANCE OF TOILETS AND HAND-WASHING FACILITIES)

So as to keep the sanitation results, schools, communities and households placed key priority on regular maintenance of toilets and hand washing with soap. Efforts are made also to improve live-stock sheds, cleanliness of kitchen, use of smokeless stoves and setting a place to dry out kitchen utensils. To make sure that these actions are on track, local bodies monitored established sanitation mechanisms. To keep communities abreast of the importance of sanitation and make them constantly alert, regular promotional activities such as street drama and media campaigning are made.

Exceptionally committed communities maintain gardening, do tree plantation, while average communities regularly clean water taps and toilets. Mostly, when community approach is

implemented in the form of a programme and not as a project, mechanism to keep sanitation results takes place in collaboration and coordination among concerned stakeholders.

Efforts are also made to attend to ensure sustainability at the local level such as development of code of conduct. However efforts to address these challenges are not in place in a systematic way. And those in operation are incomplete. So far, no enforcement measures or implementable policies are in place which would help sustain results.

C.4.4 EVIDENCE OF DROP-OUT AND EQUITY ASPECT

There are also cases that communities had returned to practicing open defecation even after their area declared Open Defecation Free. People doing so include those who constructed temporary toilets, who installed toilets in pressure, people who lack water resources, and who are not properly monitored. In places where public toilets are not available, people tend to return to open defecation practice. Moreover, people with lower awareness level also practice open defecation even when toilet services are available.

Lapses have also happened where schools have been missed out in the process of CATS. For an example, Achham district could not sustain the ODF status because it did not include schools during when it launched the ‘total sanitation’ campaign.

In districts like Rolpa and Salyan, installing toilets alone is riskier since generations-old practice encourages them to use leaves and it is hard for them to develop a behavior to clean hands after using toilets.

In order to respond to the social context such as gender, cast and religion, the sector has identified a number of factors to bear in mind. These include child, gender and disabled-friendly toilets, implementation of policies, and complete use of the sanitation facilities. Adaptations to social factors can be observed relatively more than that to the environmental factors. However, much more has yet to be done in the sector.

In order to make sure that views of the poorest and excluded community are sought, heard and responded, equal participation has been ensured within village WASH coordination committees.

When schools, villages or districts launched the initiative for total sanitation, they put priority on poor and disadvantaged people since reaching out to them enhanced the prospect and confidence of meeting total sanitation status within a shorter period.

C.4.5 REINFORCEMENT FOR CONTINUED ADHERENCE AND GOING UP THE LADDER

Much of Nepal's current focus lies on ensuring access of toilet to all the households of the country by 2017. Since the national government itself has accepted the fact that merely achieving total sanitation status as envisioned by the national goal is not enough to meet the ultimate state of sanitation, little efforts have been made toward sustaining behavior change and build complete environmental sanitation. From the government's side, limited enforcement mechanism is in place. At the local level, schools, villages and districts have set rules, regulations and policies. Some have published form of those aspects. However, these are not enforceable by the government's rule and vulnerable to be broken when government's political leadership shifts.

In communities that have declared ODF with CATS, systems are in place to demand clarification for open defecation practice, employing penalty, payment for any acts that violates established norms.

While the current approach of putting schools at front in running total sanitation campaigns is on track toward the sustainability, complete initiatives such as focus on enforcement through policy and behavior change based efforts are not in place.

The other factors inspiring reinforcement of the CATS's intent at local level include development of code of conduct, policies, guidelines and community's acceptance over those regulatory measures. Moreover, sanitation funds are established and used, orientation on local plans, policies and guidelines are made, and community groups such as child clubs, mothers groups and women's federations are involved in the initiative. In some places, sanitation marketing tools are also being used to keep CATS messages effective.

However, communities find it hardest to maintain certification requirements for behavior change including hand washing with soap.

C.4.6 REMEDIAL ACTIONS

Now the government has a plan to design a post ODF plan that will begin in coming September.

The government also has a plan to carry out an impact study in 32 village development committees that will cover 1000 households. The impact study aim to explore insights and evidences that would help the sector take a course towards sustainability.

In districts like Kalikot, activities are underway to correct the technical errors happened while installing toilets and in replacing temporary toilets with permanent. Now almost districts have mechanisms to replace temporary toilets with permanent.

While the sector has recognized that natural disasters such as floods and landslides can damage the sanitation results, concrete plans are not in place to take corrective measures in such situations.

D. MAIN CONCLUSIONS

- As increased coordination proved instrumental in leading a village or a district towards the destination of open defecation free, the strategy gained more priority from government agencies, development organizations and stakeholders. Nepal's Master Plan on Sanitation, Aligning for Action and International Year of Sanitation created enabling environment in pulling stakeholder's support for standardization, harmony and unity.
- Nepal's sanitation movement began to take course from schools and stayed as effective up to now as it was when it began in 2006. The effects are positive since schools are the smallest unit of a community which can pay close attention to each household while monitoring the maintenance and sustainability of the sanitation facility such as toilets. Nepal is unique with respect to the role public schools can play in drawing disadvantaged people into the pool of initiators since schools are the places where mostly students' poor and disadvantaged community come from. Regardless of terai or himalayan region, schools have played key role in making community people aware of the importance of sanitation.
- In the country, providing access to poor and disadvantaged is no longer an issue since a necessity to help them first has been established as a norm and hence the equity issue has moved to communities, village and districts having and not having subsidies.
- Up to now, 5 districts, 6 municipalities and 748 Village Development Committees have declared their area open defecation free and the trend is increasing day after day. A large chunk of these achievements were driven more by the dedication to meet the national goal of total sanitation by 2017, and less so by the motivation to meet the ultimate state of sanitation. While emerging speed of declarations have drawn admirations, the same has also posed challenges to areas where districts and villages have hurried up and escaped vital elements of the CATS approaches.
- Sustainability is in the mind of majority of implementers, government, development agencies and UNICEF. Efforts are also made to attend to the challenge, such as development of code of conduct, however efforts to address these challenges are not in place in a systematic way. And efforts in place are incomplete. So far, no enforcement measures or implementable policies are in place which would help sustain results.

ANNEXES

Annex 1

CATS evaluation
 Sub-national workshop
 Date: 28 June 2013
 Venue: Hotel Royal Century, Bharatpur
 Community Approaches to Total Sanitation (CATS), UNICEF Nepal
 National Consultative Workshop
 1 July 2013
 Kathmandu

Time	Activity	Lead / support	Comments
7.30	Arrival and sign-in (with breakfast coffee/tea)		
8.00	Welcome Introduction to the research and purpose of the workshop. Opening Remarks	UNICEF CO International consultant / NC Guest	
9.00	Presentation of initial observations from the evaluation	International consultant / NC	Initial observations grouped around key themes (effectiveness, outcomes, sustainability). Summary hand-out given to all participants.
9.30	Points for clarification from the presentation. Initial questions arising from the presentation.	Participants	International consultant / NC captures points raised, ensuring they are addressed here, or at a later point
9.45	Facilitated discussion around key questions / issues arising from the early observations through group work	International consultant / NC	Group work around key themes (effectiveness, outcomes, sustainability)

10:30	Coffee / tea break		
10:45	Key points from the groups presented back to the plenary, soliciting inputs from the other groups	International consultant / NC	To include matters of agreement / disagreement, areas where further information is required (and from whom / where)
11.30	Reaching consensus on the initial findings. Facilitated discussion on considerations, proposed actions by Nepal to address any of the key points raised in earlier discussion	International consultant / NC	
11.45	Final wrap-up and closure	International consultants UNICEF CO Chairman	
12.00	Lunch and departure		

Annex 2

CATS evaluation
Sub-national workshop
Date: 28 June 2013
Venue: Hotel Royal Century, Bharatpur

Proposed schedule			
Time	Activity	Lead / support	Comments
8.30	Arrival and sign-in (with coffee / tea)		
9.00	Welcome Introduction to the participants and research. Highlight presentation of purpose of the workshop	UNICEF CO/ field office and International consultant / NC	

Proposed schedule			
Time	Activity	Lead / support	Comments
10.00	Presentation by one or two invited implementing partners of their experiences of CATS implementation.	VDC/NGOs, etc.	Invited implementing partners “set the scene” by presenting short case studies of CATS projects.
10.30	Coffee / tea break		
11.00	Introduction to key evaluation questions and purpose of group work	International consultant / NC	
11.15	Formation of groups to work on questions	International consultants / NC	
11.30	Groups discuss key questions on aspects of the evaluation (relating to relevance, effectiveness, outcomes or sustainability)	Participants	International consultants / NC “facilitate” group discussions, providing clarity where required
13.00	Lunch break		
14.00	Groups finalise discussions on key questions	Participants	International consultants / NC “facilitate” group discussions, providing clarity where required
14.30	Plenary session for feedback from groups - First group - Second group	Participants	
15.00	Coffee / tea break		
15.30	Plenary session for feedback from groups - Third group	Participants	

Proposed schedule			
Time	Activity	Lead / support	Comments
15.45	Broad discussion on key issues raised during plenary session	International consultants / NC	
16.15	Final wrap-up	International consultants	
16.30	Close and departure	UNICEF CO	

Annex 3

UNICEF CATS Evaluation Schedule (Date: 23 June 2013)

Day	Date	Activity	Involved parties	Comments
-3	Wed 19nd 2013	International consultants meet with national consultant for briefing in Geneva	DK, GRS	Taking advantage of Guna's presence in Geneva
-1	Sat 22th June	Introductory and planning meeting among International consultants, national consultant and UNICEF CO	HS, YS and NLS	
0	Sun 23rd June	International consultants meet with national consultant for briefings UNICEF country Office make Government Office visit fix the focal person participation in the evaluation activities	HS, YS NLS	
1	Mon 24th June	Morning: International consultants initial briefing with UNICEF Nep staff Finalization the schedule Afternoon: Meeting with ministry; MPPW & MOUD	DK, HS, YS & GRS, UNICEF CO DK, HS, NLS, NC(GRS/YS)	
2	Tue 25th June	Morning: Kick-off Meeting with SH Task force Remainder of day: Semi-structured interviews with key partners and stakeholders at national level	DK, HS, NC (GRS/YS) UNICEF Nep	Where possible, DK and HS to carry out simultaneous SSIs – where protocol allows and translation

Day	Date	Activity	Involved parties	Comments
		<p>Examples of partners and stakeholders:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Government representatives from: DPHE, MoH, MoE, MOUD - UNICEF strategic partners supporting CATS programmes (SNV, - Key organizations supporting the sanitation sector (ADB, SDC, WB/WSP, DoLIDAR etc.) 		support is not required for both
3	Wed 26th June	<p>Morning: Semi-structured interviews, with key partners and stakeholders at national level continued</p> <p>Afternoon: Travel to the district- Chitwan</p>	<p>DK, HS, NC</p> <p>DK, HS, NC, UNICEF Nep</p>	UNICEF country office and regional office arrange transport and logistic
4	Thu 27th June	<p>All day: Visit to community implementing CATS programme. Prepare for local stakeholder workshop. Processing of data</p>	DK, HS, NC, UNICEF Nep	Field visit: one school one VDC at Chitwan
5	Fri 28th June	<p>All day: Workshop with key partners and stakeholders at sub-national level</p> <p>Examples of invited partners and stakeholders:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - District-level government staff responsible for sanitation and hygiene: Health, Education and Local Government Departments. - Local officials (Mayors, etc.) - NGOs / CBOs implementing CATS as UNICEF partners in the district - NGOs / CBOs involved in sanitation but not linked to UNICEF - Representatives of civil society organisations - Local private sector providers working with CATS communities 	DK, HS, NC, UNICEF Nep	
6	Sat 29th June	<p>Semi-structured interviews with key partners and stakeholders at sub-national level</p> <p>Examples of partners and stakeholders:</p>	DK, HS, NC, (UNICEF Nep, if deemed	Where possible, DK and HS to carry out simultaneous SSIs – where protocol

Day	Date	Activity	Involved parties	Comments
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - District-level government staff responsible for sanitation and hygiene: DOLIDAR, DHO... - Local officials (Mayors, etc.) - NGOs / CBOs implementing CATS as UNICEF partners in the district - NGOs / CBOs involved in sanitation but not linked to UNICEF - Representatives of civil society organisations - Local private sector providers working with CATS communities 	necessary for reasons of protocol)	allows and translation support is not required for both. Consultants to clearly explain the purpose of the sub-national workshop in addition to the SSIs and seek to confirm attendance with key individuals / organizations
7	Sun 30th June	Travel back to Kathmandu Initial data analysis and report-writing, including proceedings from local stakeholder workshop	DK, HS, NC, UNICEF Nep DK, HS, NC	
8	Mon 1st July	All day: Workshop with key partners and stakeholders at national level Examples of invited partners and stakeholders: (NSHCC) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Government representatives from: DPHE, MoH, MoE, - UNICEF strategic partners supporting CATS programmes - Key organizations supporting the sanitation sector (WB/WSP, ADB, Water Aid, etc.) 	DK, HS, NC, UNICEF Nep	Workshop logistics to have been managed by NC, with support from UNICEF Nep as appropriate, and agreed.
9	Tue 2nd July	Morning: Debriefing with UNICEF Nep CO Afternoon/evening: International consultants depart	DK, HS, NC, UNICEF Nep DK, HS	Consultants to present early findings from the evaluation visit, for verification and clarity, with UNICEF CO staff.

Annex 4

CATS Nepal
Sub National Level Consultative Workshop
Bharatpur Chitwan
28-Jun-13

S n	Name of the Participants	Partici pating region	Office	Designatio n	Contact Address		
					Office teleph one	Mobil e	email
1	Ram Lakhan Mandal	MW	RMSO, Surkhet	Regional Director	83520 360	98580 51202	rlmandal13@gmai l.com
2	Tilak Poudel	CR	DDC, Chitwan	LDO			
3	Raj Kumar Yadav	ER	WSSDO, Saptari	Division Chief		98528 20077	ryadhav- 48@yahoo.com
4	Janak Giri	ER	RPRDC, Udayapur	ED	35420 550	98528 35455	janak.girig@gmai l.com
5	Bishow Raj Bhatt	ER	UNICEF, Biratnagar	WASH officer	21471 612	98511 73031	brbhatt@unicef.or g
6	Ram Adhar Prasad Yadav	CR	RCD Nepal, Rautahat	PO	55520 140	98450 95206	ram4sir@gmail.co m
7	Homa Nath Ghimire	WR	WSSDO, Kapilvastu	Engineer	076- 56007 4	93450 47470	homanath_ghimir e@yahoo.com
8	Govind Khadka	MW	Journalist, Dang			95578 31994	khadka.govinda@ gmail.com
9	Bishram Adhikari	MW	NRCS, Dang	District coordinato r			
1	Tilak	MW	WSSDO,	Engineer		98478	tilak.newpane26

0	Newpane		Dang			26448	@gmail.com
1 1	Ganesh Bahadur Khadka	FW	NRCS, Achham	Secretary		98448 51191	nrcsachham@gmail.com
1 2	Saraswoti Rawal	MW	V-WASH- CC, Dailekh	member		98483 07221	
1 3	Anki Lal Bhatt	MW	V-WASH- CC, Asigram	member		98487 76545	
1 4	Laxmi Bhandari	MW	FNJ-Surkhet	member		98482 03898	laxmibhandari@gmail.com
1 5	Tula Ram Pandey	MW	D-WASH- CC, Kalikot	member	087- 44015 0	98483 01462	pandeytularam@gmail.com
1 6	Sulochana Joshi	MW	ENPHO, Surkhet	Project coordinator	083- 52333 4	98492 67543	joshi.sulochana@gmail.com
1 7	Ram Chandra Gyawali	CR	NEWAH, CWRO	Account officer	056- 52409 3	98550 65074	rcgyawali@newah.org
1 8	Hari Krishna Poudel	CR	WSSDO, Chitwan	Division Chief	056- 52220 4		hkpoudel
1 9	Ram Bahadur Rimal	CR	WSSDO, Chitwan	Engineer		98450 24122	sbrimal@yahoo.com
2 0	Puspa Kamal Subedi	CR	PP	PP		98450 23535	puspa_subadi@yahoo.com
2 1	Madhav Prasad Upreti	CR	DDC, Chitwan	Engineer		98550 56989	upretimadhavprasad@gmail.com
2 2	Anita adhikari	CR	Journalist, Chitwan	member		98453 97479	heartbit28@yahoo.com
2	Pramila	ER	IDE Nepal,	Program	041-	98440	pramilasing2@ya

3	Kumari Shing		Dhanusa	officer	23550	52001	hoo.com
2 4	Sushila sharma	WR	NGO network, Tanahun	member	065- 56056 0		suhsilash@yahoo. com
2 5	Dev Kumar Shrestha	WR	Chamber of Commerce, Tanahun	president		98560 23985	dev_gandaki@hot mail.com
2 6	Sunil Pandey	WR	DDc, Tanahun	DDC focal person	065- 56043 6	98560 27525	pandey_5101@ya hoo.com
2 7	Susila Wagle	WR	Women &Child office	WDO	056- 52241 6	97410 54929	wagle.susila622@ yahoo.com
2 8	Shreejana Devkota	WR	FEDWASU N, Chitwan	member	056- 52078 5		shreejana2011@g mail.com
2 9	Gyan Sali Neupane	WR	NRCS, Chitwan	Secretary			
3 0	Bikash Joshi	FW	VDC				joshibikash@yaho o.com
3 1	Zakki Ahamad Ansari	CR	WSSDO, Parsa	Division Chief	051- 52130 1	98550 27390	zakki_np@yahoo. com
3 2	Sudarsan Gautam	FW	VDC, Kauwaban	VDC seretary		97550 01428	mero_yatra@live. co.uk
3 3	Manjula Shah	ER	Peoples Inspiration Centre, Dhanusa	president		98441 14912	manjula2002shah @yahoo.com
3 4	Khagaraj Ojha	CR	NGO Federation youth Society	ckairperso n		98450 48521	kojha@ysnngt.org .np

			Nepal, Chitwan				
--	--	--	-------------------	--	--	--	--